

A MUSICAL CHAIN OF MEMORY

THE CATHEDRALS' GROUP CHOIRS FESTIVAL 2018

REV PROF JUNE BOYCE-TILLMAN, MARIA BUSEN-SMITH, PROF STEPHEN CLIFT, DR DAVID M WALTERS



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival

Participating Universities



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

This research originated in a desire to undertake combined research across the Cathedrals' Group of Universities, which was the substance of a joint conference at Newman University in September 2017. Funding was allocated by Winchester University for a research project that would be carried out jointly with Canterbury Christchurch University in the figure of Professor Stephen Clift.

In Winchester, the Rev Professor June Boyce-Tillman was the Principal investigator and Maria Busen Smith was appointed as a research assistant, Dr David Walters managed the project and Holly Pye carried out the administration and the design of this report. The team are grateful for the Vice Chancellor of Winchester University, Professor Joy Carter and Professor Kate Adams, Head of Research for their support of this project.

Context

Established in 1982, the annual Choirs Festival (the Festival) is the Cathedral Universities Group's oldest collective tradition. Having evolved as an integrated gathering of choirs, chaplains and vice chancellors, it follows a three-day weekend pattern hosted in rotation by different member institutions. A centrepiece concert, often but not exclusively in a church or cathedral setting, features choirs from as many universities as wish to participate, usually ca.75%.

The 2018 Festival was hosted by Newman University and included customary meetings for chaplains and vice chancellors. The Festival concert normally reflects the Group's Christian heritage and usually opens with pieces chosen by the attending choirs.

The Choirs' Festival Research Project belongs to a Cathedrals Group (the Group) initiative to expand networking among its HEIs and examine existing collaborations.

In an increasingly competitive market the Group's capacity to form alliances among its members is a valuable asset with scope to grow and enhance student experience/engagement, strengthen recruitment, stimulate research and support preparation for TEF assessments by pooling expertise and raising esteem for good practice.

Aims

1. To examine the impact of HEI choir membership and Festival participation on singers' and their well-being in the following dimensions:
 - 1) physical
 - 2) mental
 - 3) social
 - 4) spiritual
 - 5) musical development and achievement
2. To gather and correlate opinion from vice chancellors, founders, singers, music directors and chaplains about the Festival's contribution to music provision, student experience and engagement (UKES skills), corporate affiliation/reputation and community participation.
3. To identify findings: collaborative challenges and benefits in common.
4. To extrapolate recommendations for the Cathedrals Group as a whole.

Methodology

A mixed methods design was ethically approved at the University of Winchester in mid-February 2018. Data was collected in three concurrent phases as follows.

1. **Questionnaire: mixed.** A mixed response-item online questionnaire was made available to participating singers straight after the Festival.
2. **Festival statements from vice chancellors: qualitative.** 16 (100%) of the Group's vice chancellors were invited to send a short Festival statement to the research team. The response period ran from March to May 2018.
3. **Semi-structured interviews: qualitative.** Representatives of 12/16 Cathedrals Group HEIs received an interview invitation, with distribution by role as follows: 12 music directors (including one whose choir did not attend the 2018 Festival), 6 Festival founders, 3 chaplains and 1 audience member. Potential interviewees were identified through a process of purposive sampling based on their association with the Festival tradition and/or attendance in 2018. Interviews were conducted between March and June 2018.

The survey questionnaire included two sections of statements with Likert response scales to assess firstly, participants' experience of choral singing and secondly, their experience of taking part in the Choirs Festival and the evening performance event (including the combined choirs' performance of the Berlioz Requiem).

Content analysis coding was applied to the open interview questions. The Interview prompts were designed to address Research Aims 1 and 2 in keeping with semi-structured style. Music directors were asked, additionally, to describe their association with the Festival and confirm how they were employed by their HEI.

The dimensions from the questionnaires

Questionnaire items in both Likert response sections were written to assess five hypothesised dimensions of choral singing relating to:

1. Physical wellbeing
2. Mental wellbeing
3. Social wellbeing
4. Spiritual wellbeing
5. A Sense of Achievement

In all cases a distribution of answers across the response scale was observed but in general positive statements tend to elicit agreement or strong agreement and negatively worded registered disagreement.

Physical health and wellbeing associated with singing concentrates on improvements in breathing.

Positive experiences during the Festival included improvements in general wellbeing and a strong sense of achievement from singing a demanding work in a prestigious venue.

Quality of the social experience provided by choir membership: This points strongly to a sense of friendship and support within individual choirs. Few people actually reported feeling lonely and isolated within their groups, and most felt that members of the choir were supportive.

Singing as a spiritual experience: This is the clearest of the five and relates to the degree to which participants experienced singing as having a spiritual dimension, although seldom associated with a particular belief system.

Mental wellbeing benefits from singing: This captured the commonly expressed idea that singing can raise mood and release feeling of stress

In summary, the data shows overwhelmingly that participants feel that their wellbeing is enhanced by the festival. Social wellbeing is clear with singing forming effective community for many students and the choir forming a small community in the context of an expanding university community. The enhancement of mental wellbeing is also clear in the data. This includes a sense of meaning and purpose; this is also part of the spiritual dimension which is acknowledged by many responses, although probably not in the form that it would have been when the universities were founded. These findings present a strong case for maintaining singing traditions in HE in an age concerned with the wellbeing of the student community.

Outcomes from the interview data

Here there is a strong sense of an evolving tradition – a chain of memory. There is an ongoing high degree of value ascribed to this as a way of establishing a corporate identity and a community purpose – not dissimilar to the way that singing has defined various Christian traditions. Musical participation is valued by VCs for its contribution to student wellbeing. This research makes singing an important tool in an age of increasing evidence for student problems in the area of health and wellbeing.

This is well served by the music directors' embracing of a nurturing leadership style. In terms of relationships of mutuality and respect. However, the cost of maintaining the tradition of the festival has become increasingly complex in the context of the decline of a musical presence associated with the Western classical canon in the HE curriculum. This has resulted in music directors feeling overwhelmed by the demands, both in terms of notated music with a group of students unfamiliar with the tradition, but also in the organisational and financial demands of organising an individual choir's participation which is greatly increased when their university is hosting the festival. This is compounded by hourly contracts and the necessity of combining work in the university with other teaching commitments.

The musical directors' positions are protected by the concern of VCs for corporate values and image but the fragility of their employment contracts may stand in the way of future musical growth or radical change. This research reveals the need for support for the development of co-operative and collaborative practices within this group.

All the data reveals a strong sense of the festival of continuing in some (possibly changing way) of expressing the spiritual identity of the Cathedrals' Group. This too may colour the reshaping of the festival and reveal fault lines in the way that the sacred in music is perceived – particularly in relation to traditions other than the Western classical canon.

Findings

Finding 1

Music directors' excellent practice and resourcefulness are largely responsible for stabilising the Festival tradition.

Recommendation 1: Music directors would benefit from central support.

Finding 2

Participation in the Choirs' Festival is a much-valued experience for singers and contributes significantly to HEI loyalties.

Recommendation 2: To examine across the Group whether it is feasible to devolve and expand the festival:

Finding 3

Evidence suggests that the Festival and choir participation have deep, possibly enduring effects on mental and spiritual well-being

Recommendation 3: Raise awareness of the benefits of singing to mental health and wellbeing

Finding 4

The festival was shown to affect the social wellbeing of a majority of participating singers but only a small percentage were aware of the Cathedrals' Group

Recommendation 4: To encourage marketing teams to do more to impress the social wellbeing aspect of the brand on students and members of the community.

Finding 5

Social fulfilment is foregrounded in singers' motivation for joining their choir.

Recommendation 5: Use of Social media and digital tools to enhance the community of choirs within the Cathedrals Group

Findings 6

A significant proportion of students would want further collaboration activities

Recommendation 6: Choirs Festival as a standing item on relevant committees in the Cathedrals' Group

Finding 7

The Festival stage celebrates a long-established choral tradition and has featured commissions over the years.

Recommendation 7: To foreground and recognise student achievement in composing and/or conducting at the Festival through a Festival Scholarship scheme.

Research Recommendations

1. *Staff with strategic oversight of research, be put to their teams and/or music directors to ascertain levels of possible interest in an extended research project into innovative singing practice across the group.*
2. *To compare the place of the Festival in singers' wellbeing with threshold choirs and community choirs of various kinds.*
3. *To seek outputs focusing on life-long patterns of music participation and factors which mitigate against drop-out.*
4. *More systematic examination of the attitudes of chaplains and Deans of Spirituality towards singing, especially works with a sacred origin.*
5. *To interrogate the possibility of shared works that include both orate and iterate musical traditions to achieve effective musical inclusivity*

Overall Conclusions

As a treasured and resilient tradition, the Choirs Festival has much to offer future generations of staff, students and members of the community served by the Cathedrals' Group, particularly through the collective power of its HEIs to celebrate the excellent practice on a large stage and conversely, apply wider benefits back to the day-to-day life of the Cathedrals Group of Universities.

This report has looked in detail at this longstanding tradition. Both the world in which they are situated and their own internal structures have changed a great deal over this period. We have identified continuities and discontinuities with the past. This is particularly true in the areas of the Christian faith, the place of chapel worship and the place of the Western classical music tradition in the curriculum. There is a deep continuity in the role of music in the wellbeing and formation of students, the encounter with the tradition in which they sit and the formation of collegial spaces in which students can feel they belong to a community of learners with a sense of meaning and purpose.

The data shows that the festival does have positive effects on many students' wellbeing, particularly mental and social. Furthermore, UKES results indicate that activities such as singing and the Festival improve academic, civic, active learning and career skills and thereby impact academic performance and possibly NSS scores where intersections with credit-bearing assignments exist.

The strong presence of social elements in students', staff's and founders' data would indicate the significant role music can play in the formation of a strong community of learners. What is clear is that the festival supports a sense of the collegiality that had been present in the much smaller originating colleges. An inclusive community is created with a diversity of participants. The assembled group includes staff, students, community members, chaplains and alumnae/i. The individual choirs provide small communities in the wider university community, particularly for valuable for vulnerable students.

It is clear that Vice Chancellors value the choice making of students in activities, many of which are extracurricular, leading to a grasp of their own personal and musical autonomy. The festival encourages ethical behaviour in its inclusivity, lack of competition, and the centrality of collaboration to bring an extremely complex undertaking to a successful conclusion. Relationships of mutuality and respect are clearly formed which requires a range of skills on the part of music directors, far beyond those traditionally taught in choral conducting courses and including compassion and nurture.

Esteem-characteristics associated with Festivals make a profound impression on singers. They are connected with investment in prestigious locations/resources, the dedication and excellent practice of music directors and the artistic expertise of the choirs themselves which, in the case of those reviewed for this Project, meet typically for just two hours a week. Consensus among singers, music directors and vice-chancellors about the quality of performances is universally high, mirroring indications for reputational gain and well-being.

Musical inclusivity and respect is clearly posing problems for a festival that has traditionally had a notated Western classical masterpiece as its central work; with changes in the nature of HE music courses, as well as the absence of any music in the curriculum of some institutions, this will need to be addressed as the festival evolves.

There are clear spiritual elements in students' data and in VCs aspirations for the experience of the festival. Words like uplifting proliferate, feeding into a society that sees an increase in people self-defining as spiritual but not religious. The absence of data from chaplains and Deans of Spirituality is a gap in the research. Musicking is giving students a sense of meaning and purpose which is only infrequently associated with a clearly Christian frame. There are clear benefits from participation and these map onto the UKES skills;

Undoubtedly there is a sense of an enduring tradition operating across the period of the festival, that also links it with the Christian traditions of the past. The link between the participants and the works sung may have changed in terms of belief, but remains in terms of their relationship to their wellbeing (eudaimonia). In an age when identity, both corporate and personal, is often fragmented and difficult to achieve, the festival provides a way for both individuals and the Cathedrals' Group of universities to reveal their identity to the wider community which has attracted members of that wider community into musicking activities in HEIs. The festival is clearly operating as a musical chain of memory in the evolution of the Christian tradition that underpins the Cathedrals' Group.

Structure of the Report

The full report is in four chapters.

Chapter One introduces the context and the need for the research

Chapter Two will explore the findings from an online survey of festival participants. Each of the five dimensions of wellbeing is examined from a quantitative and a qualitative perspective and then brought together in a summary and discussion.

Chapter Three is a comprehensive thematic analysis of qualitative data from Cathedral Group Vice Chancellors, Choir leaders and Chaplains.

Chapter Four will summarise the research findings, offer recommendations, point to further research and a conclusion.

Addendum: UKES mappings, Corporate Reputation and a Community Participation analysis of this data. Other data are archived separately at the University of Winchester.

Appendix 1: On-line questionnaire in full

Appendix 2 – 12: Qualitative analysis tables

A MUSICAL CHAIN OF MEMORY

THE CATHEDRALS' GROUP CHOIRS FESTIVAL 2018

REV PROFESSOR JUNE BOYCE-TILLMAN, MARIA BUSEN-SMITH, PROFESSOR STEPHEN CLIFT, DR DAVID M WALTERS



RESEARCH REPORT

The Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival

Participating Universities



CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

CHAPTER ONE: Setting the Scene	1
The Cathedrals' Group of Universities	1
The 2018 Choirs Festival.....	3
Research Aims.....	5
Research Methods	6
Response Rates	6
CHAPTER TWO: The participant experience – the On-Line Survey	7
Introduction	7
Survey Design	7
Distribution	7
Analysis Methods	8
Testing: The Five Dimensional Model of wellbeing.....	9
1. Physical wellbeing (PW)	14
Summary - Physical wellbeing.....	15
2. Mental wellbeing (MW)	15
Summary – Mental Wellbeing.....	17
3. Social Wellbeing (SW).....	18
Summary – Social Wellbeing	20
4. Spiritual Wellbeing (SpW)	21
Religious Affiliation	22
Summary – Spiritual Wellbeing.....	24
5. Sense of Achievement (SA)	24
Summary – Sense of Achievement.....	28
Summary of Chapter Two.....	29
CHAPTER THREE: Intention, process, dilemmas and achievements	31
Introduction	31
Semi-structured interviews: Process and Findings.....	31
Statements from Vice Chancellors	31
Festival Founders.....	35
Theme 1: Evolution of a Tradition.....	35
Theme 2: The professional identity of the College Choir Music Director	39
Theme 3: Festival/Church Colleges and faith foundation	40
Theme 4: Choir/Festival and musical growth.....	42
Music Directors.....	42
Theme 1: The Choirs Festival	42
Theme 2: The professional identity of the Cathedrals Group music director	46
Theme 3: Choir involvement and quality of life	48
Theme 4: Festival/HEI and corporate values.....	49
Theme 5: Choir/Festival and musical growth.....	51
Summary of Chapter Three	52
Conclusion.....	53

CONTENTS cont...

CHAPTER FOUR: Moving on - Findings, recommendations, further research and conclusions	55
Introduction	55
Further Research	58
Overall Conclusion	59
References	61
Addendum	65
Higher Education Academy UK Engagement Survey.....	65
Corporate reputation and affiliation	65
Community Participation	66
Appendix 1: Questionnaire.....	69
Appendices 2 - 12	83
APPENDIX 2: Qualitative survey feedback for music-making (skills/achievement.....	84
APPENDIX 3: qualitative survey feedback for social well-being	91
APPENDIX 4: qualitative survey feedback for physical well-being	96
APPENDIX 5: qualitative survey feedback for mental well-being.....	98
APPENDIX 6: qualitative survey feedback for spiritual well-being	103
APPENDIX 7: qualitative survey feedback on music provision	106
APPENDIX 8: UKES skill mappings	116
APPENDIX 9: qualitative survey feedback for corporate reputation/affiliation.....	118
APPENDIX 10: Qualitative survey feedback for community participation	123
APPENDIX 11: Qualitative survey feedback, other	126
APPENDIX 12: Semi-structured interview prompts and project aim mappings	129

A MUSICAL CHAIN OF MEMORY

CHAPTER ONE: Setting the Scene

Introduction

Singing has often established the underlying values of a community including a religious tradition. The theologian Bernard Meland describes how expressive forms, like stories and songs, are both formed by and serve to shape the *mythos* of a community (Meland 1976 p113). This mythos precedes and supports the values of a particular community - the “qualitative dimension of the historical experience” (Meland 1976 p118). They *body forth* the tradition. A material and embodied act transmits the history of a group of people and informs their identity - what they value and cherish, what motivates them. It is about the *intentionality* of a community (Clarke 1994 p8). How far does the Cathedrals’ Group Choirs Festival continue to embody the fundamental principles of the foundation of the HEI’s that make it up?

The Cathedrals’ Group of Universities

Higher Education in the UK had a Christian foundation from the beginning, in medieval Oxford and Cambridge – with three underlying principles:

- Love of Knowledge
- Formation in a strong community of learners
- Usefulness to society

These universities had chapels and regular Christian worship. A strong community of learners was based on collegiality and the formation of students within a hospitable, ethical and godly community. The third aim was the serving of the public good – a vocational vision with the pursuit of knowledge that is useful to society. Their development would have been influenced by Thomas Aquinas 1225 – 1274, who at the time in 1246-7 was reworking Aristotle’s concept of eudaimonia (often translated wellbeing). He was helped in this by Robert Grosseteste’s¹ Latin translation of Aristotle’s *Nicomachean Ethics*. Many see Aquinas as Christianising Aristotle’s concept by adding to eudaimonia the contemplation of the Divine.

This thinking was still present in the religious foundations of the mid-nineteenth century which make up the Cathedrals Group. Chapel worship would have been compulsory and much musical activity would have been concentrated on chapel services. The collegiate sense of a relatively small community of learners undertaking formation together made them similar to the colleges of Oxford and Cambridge.

As most of them were concerned with the training of teachers for church schools, music would have been an important subject in the curriculum, particularly as playing for a hymn would have been an essential part of school life. This would have made reading Western classical notation necessary which would have been a core part of the course.

¹ Robert Grosseteste was Bishop of Lincoln is remembered in the name of one of the Cathedrals Group Universities.

By the time the choirs' festival started, the secularisation of the wider society (Taylor 2007) had affected each of the colleges in a huge variety of ways. The present post secular society, opens up new opportunities for universities to explore a variety of world views. The term post-secular, invented by Charles Taylor (2007) was taken up by Pope Benedict XVI. It is not clear whether the term points to the fact that Western society never did fully secularize or that a new phenomenon is appearing. The term reflects a society which is having to come to terms with the peaceful co-existence of sacred and secular world views and a shift from seeing the religious simply as a remnant of an older world order. This is reinforced in the West by the upsurge in migratory communities with differing world views which include a notion of the sacred. It is reflected in the growth of de-institutionalized religious groups both fundamentalist and more liberal and the personal descriptor of spiritual but not religious. Habermas (2008) critiques the failure of the secularism that characterised modernity and calls for a dialogue between differing world views. The festival could play an important part in this debate in giving deep insight into a Christian worldview and preparing students for a world of diverse world views and frames of reference.

Alongside this, there have been the changes in the Higher Education sector which made these small colleges gradually acquire university status with an inevitable increase in size. This made the nature of a community of learners very different and meant teaching courses taking their place alongside a huge expansion of the curriculum areas covered often in modular degrees. Crucial within these changes was the place of chapel and faith in College/University life and the place of musicking (Small 1998) inside or outside of the curriculum, together with the philosophy that underpins it. All of these developments are reflected in this report.

The significant report, *Christianity and the University Experience: Understanding Student Faith*, (Guest et al 2013) identified how, although only 28.8% of students in their chosen universities - Durham, Leeds, Kent, Derby and Chester (the only one in the Cathedrals' group) – self-defined as Christian, Christianity was a relatively stable identity during university. The report saw faith as still vital in university life. It did not see students as losing religion and suggested that religion had become what the sociologist Grace Davie called 'vicarious religion'; this concerns the idea that students are passively benefitting from the religious practices of a few and using their own faith in personal crises. The report looked primarily at chaplaincy provision. It is unfortunate that, for the festival report, we had little access to chaplains, so have not been able to examine this in more detail.

The report (Guest et al 2013) did not look at music practices and the music and, in particular, the festival could well play a significant part in this facet of religious identity and may be, in itself, a form of spirituality that reinforces identity without demanding commitment of any kind. Settings of the Requiem Mass text, such as the Berlioz Requiem, may still provide comfort for people who would not subscribe to the doctrine underpinning them; it functions for them like a religious ritual may once have done:

Works like the great Mahler symphony with its evocation of chaotic life and the finality of death allow us to remember human sacrifices without being told what to think. (McElvoy 2014 p. 15)

The relation between identity and meaning and purpose appears in this study, which is often identified as an important part of wellbeing.

The idea of wellbeing has been developed by positive psychologists such as Maslow (1967) and Rogers (1976) and theologians such as Rowan Williams (2018). In his ecology of wellbeing he

sees human beings having to work out a right relationship with their body, the natural world, their social world and the cosmic sphere. In the growth of the descriptor spiritual but not religious. There is a growing literature on the spirituality of the arts (Boyce-Tillman 2016). This spirituality acknowledges the useful functions of religion, which de Botton sees as fostering community and providing coping strategies for pain and suffering, concluding

There might be a way to engage with religion without having to subscribe to its supernatural content. (De Botton 2012 pp5-6)

De Botton's hope is that that the arts might be as effective as religion in their ability to guide, humanize and console. The arts inform the search for meaning without engaging in metaphysical belief systems (De Botton 2012 pp32-7). They are an area where students can explore develop their own meaning making systems in the area of the spiritual and/or religious. This relates to their own sense of identity. John Dewey (1934) saw an important place for the aesthetic experience in a fragmented world as providing a coherently meaningful experience. (Westerlund 2002 p191). It can set up situations for discovery of meaning:

[Music] does not offer meaning but triggers the effort to produce the meaning. (Voegelin 210 p165)

The "predicament of the modern mind" is that it is "at a loss to know what life is all about." (Holmes 1987 pp3-4). Holmes links this with secularisation, suggesting that universities could be a place where meaning is created rather than discovered (Holmes 1987 pp9-11). Here the place of *paradox* needs deep exploration which is the way some people see the Requiem – it challenges their own worldview. He sees how a religious worldview can give purpose and coherence to people's lives in an age of egotism and materialism (Homes 1987 pp16-17), in the form of insight into other people's positions.

From the past and the present we can draw certain features that we will seek to explore in this study:

1. Ethical behaviour
2. A sense of meaning and purpose
3. Autonomy – being able to make wise decisions and manage behaviour – often called in contemporary government speak as satisfaction.
4. Contemplation
5. Relationship with spirits of the ancestors and celestial beings
6. Relationships of mutuality, respect

The 2018 Choirs Festival

Established in 1982, the annual Choirs Festival (the Festival) is the Group's oldest collective tradition. Having evolved as an integrated gathering of choirs, chaplains and vice chancellors², it follows a three-day weekend pattern hosted in rotation by different member institutions.

A centrepiece concert, often but not exclusively in a church or cathedral setting, features choirs from as many universities as wish to participate, usually ca.75%.

² Vice-chancellors' meetings have been de-coupled from the Festival for a number of years but are still scheduled in close proximity to it.

It is thus a large-scale undertaking. The 2018 Festival was hosted by Newman University and included customary meetings for chaplains and vice chancellors. The Festival concert normally reflects the Group's Christian heritage and usually opens with pieces chosen by the attending choirs.

This part of the 2018 programme celebrated traditions of religious music spanning 600 years and included works/arrangements by the Group's own music directors (see Table 1). This level of diversity typifies the event and affirms the Group's commitment to inspire through sacred music heritage.

Table 1: 2018 Festival Choirs and the 2018 repertoire

HEIs (Programme order)	Repertoire	Genre
York St. John University	'Goin' home to God' arr. Steve Barnett	A cappella arrangement of a spiritual.
Bishop Grosseteste University	'As long as I have music' by Don Besig	Contemporary choral work with piano accompaniment in popular style.
University of St. Mark and St. John	'As you are' by Rag n Bone Man	Contemporary choral work with piano accompaniment in popular style.
Newman University	'O Salutaris' by Sir Edward Elgar	19C Latin anthem in late-Romantic, English church style.
University of Chester	'It's a Mystery' by Matt Baker, arranged by the composer for the Festival performance.	Contemporary, cantata-like choral work (multi-sectional) inspired by the Chester mystery plays.
University of Winchester: Music Centre	'I will light a candle' by Will Todd	Contemporary, a cappella choral work in formal style.
St, Mary's University Twickenham	'Agnus Dei' from <i>Missa Argentina</i> by Alwin Michael Schronen	Contemporary a cappella choral work in Renaissance contrapuntal style.
Liverpool Hope University	'Didn't my Lord deliver Daniel?' arr. Richard Allain	A cappella arrangement of a spiritual.
University of Cumbria	'Lean on me' by Bill Withers, arr. Graeme Danby	Contemporary choral work with gospel influence.
Canterbury Christ Church University	'Audivi vocem de coelo' by Duarte Lobo	Renaissance a cappella motet.
University of Chichester	'Justorum Animae' and 'Coelos Ascendit Hodie' by Sir Charles Villiers Stanford	Early 20C, a cappella Latin motets in Renaissance contrapuntal style.

In the second half of the concert choirs join forces to perform a large-scale work, chosen by the host, which usually exceeds their individual reach. In 2018, it was the monumental, rarely-staged and highly challenging *Grande Messe des Morts* by Hector Berlioz, 'The Berlioz Requiem'.

Research Aims

The Choirs Festival Research Project belongs to a Cathedrals Group (the Group) initiative to expand networking among its HEIs and examine existing collaborations.

In an increasingly competitive market the Group's capacity to form alliances among its members is a valuable asset with scope to grow and enhance student experience/engagement, strengthen recruitment, stimulate research and support preparation for TEF assessments by pooling expertise and raising esteem for good practice.

Festival was chosen as a case study because of its long-established collaborative history and on-going currency and also because its history reflects changes in this sector of British HE. The latter is evidenced by close alignment with the UK Engagement Survey (UKES) which is the subject of a recent report by the HEA (2016). The UKES gathers information from Y3 undergraduate students about non-curricular participation in higher education (HE) (for example, in music, sports and volunteering) to measure its value-added impact on 4 transferable skill-sets: academic skills, career skills, active learning skills and civic skills. Sector-wide UKES findings are publicly available from the HEA and providers can access their own results for internal purposes, e.g. to illuminate NSS scores and inform their TEF context statement. The UKES affirms the value of collaborative, extra-curricular arts-based ventures like the Festival to students and reflects the research's broader relevance to the sector. (See appendix 1)

The research was based at the University of Winchester and operated jointly with Canterbury Christ Church University. This research followed an Arts and Health conference³ at Newman University in September 2017. This report covers an eight-month period of funded data collection and analysis ending in August 2018. Overall the aims of the research support the Group's networking goals, reflect its commitment to quality of life and to the UK Engagement Survey (UKES).

Aims

1. To examine the impact of HEI choir membership and Festival participation on singers' and their well-being in the following dimensions:
 - a. physical
 - b. mental
 - c. social
 - d. spiritual
 - e. musical development and achievement
2. To gather and correlate opinion from vice chancellors, founders, singers, music directors and chaplains about the Festival's contribution to music provision, student experience and engagement (UKES skills), corporate affiliation/reputation and community participation.
3. To identify findings: collaborative challenges and benefits in common.
4. To extrapolate recommendations for the Cathedrals Group as a whole.

The research aims govern this report. It will also have a research legacy of ca. 2 years' duration.

³ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jKaLiBHZihI>

Research Methods

A mixed methods design was ethically approved at the University of Winchester in mid-February 2018. Data was collected in three concurrent phases as follows.

1. **Questionnaire: mixed (Appendix Two).** A mixed response-item online questionnaire was made available to participating singers straight after the Festival.
2. **Festival statements from vice chancellors: qualitative.** 16 (100%) of the Group's vice chancellors were invited to send a short Festival statement to the research team. The response period ran from March to May 2018.
3. **Semi-structured interviews: qualitative.** Representatives of 12/16 Cathedrals Group HEIs received an interview invitation, with distribution by role as follows: 12 music directors (including one whose choir did not attend the 2018 Festival), 6 Festival founders, 3 chaplains and 1 audience member. Potential interviewees were identified through a process of purposive sampling based on their association with the Festival tradition and/or attendance in 2018. Interviews were conducted between March and June 2018.

Response Rates

Table 2: Festival Participating Cathedral Group Higher Education Institutions

Canterbury Christ Church University	University of Chester
Leeds Trinity University	University of Chichester
Liverpool Hope University	University of Cumbria
Newman University	University of St. Mark and St. John
Roehampton University	University of Winchester
St. Mary's University Twickenham	York St. John University

75% of the Group's HEIs contributed data to the research. The following table shows response rates for all data sets:

Table 3: Response rates by research instrument

Research instrument	Participant numbers by role
Questionnaire	Singers, comprising students, staff and members of the community: n = 68 (33% response rate)
Festival statement	Vice Chancellors: n = 8 (50% response rate)
Semi-structured interview	Music Directors: n = 7 (58% response rate)
	Founders/founder generation: n = 5 (83% response rate)
	Chaplains: n = 2 (66% response rate)
	2018 Audience 855 Member: n = 1 (100% response rate)

CHAPTER TWO: The participant experience – the On-Line Survey

Introduction

This chapter will examine the results of the online survey (Appendix Two) which concerns participant's wellbeing (eudaimonia) - examining the effects of physical, mental, social and spiritual achievement and their sense of achievement. These are examined by quantitative and qualitative methodologies and reveal interesting continuities in the area of wellbeing which has been part of the Christian foundation of UK Higher Education.

Survey Design

The 57 response-item anonymous survey for Festival singers was designed in January 2018. Its text, which comprises 4 sections, can be found in Appendix 2 with the results.

The first section, 'About the Festival', consisted of 11 yes/no items and 2 open questions inviting 3 'positive' and 'negative' reactions in key-words/short phrases. Closed items covered continuity of Festival attendance (to indicate history of participation/loyalty), whether singers met their VC over the weekend, financial contribution (reflecting inclusion/HEI investment), organisation, feeling prepared, and involvement in the after-concert party and church service (reflecting patterns of social involvement). Respondents were also asked to identify their university.

Apart from question 14 which asked for short reasons why singers joined their choir, the survey's second and third sections 'About Your Choir' and 'About your experience of singing in the Festival' each comprised 15 Likert-style items to gather opinion about the perceived contribution of these experiences to 5 dimensions: social, physical, mental and spiritual well-being, and musical (sense of) achievement. 10/30 items were negatively worded to improve the reliability of the measure.

The survey's fourth section, 'About You', covered independent variables as follows: age, gender, whether or not singers were students (to gauge civic/community engagement and identify student music specialists), levels of education and occupation among non-students, music background (see below), religion and frequency of attending a place of worship and ethnicity. Item 56 invited final, free observations about the Festival.

Items 49-53 on musical background were to gauge whether choir involvement was extending prior investment in music (e.g. as indicated by ability to read a western score, and/or history of taking exams or playing in a band), fostering musical self-determination, promoting inclusion or producing conditions which reduce likelihood of music drop-out.

These are prominent themes in current music education discourse and pertinent to HE recruitment as the E. Bacc, which excludes music, impacts subject provision in schools.

Distribution

11/16 Cathedrals Group HEIs (68%) sent a choir to the 2018 Festival. The questionnaire, with contextual information, was made available to the estimated 229 singers who took part (240 - 11 music directors) through Bristol Online Surveys, facilitated by the Sidney de Haan Centre at Canterbury Christ Church University.

The online link was available between 25.2.2018 and 30.4.2018 and distributed by music directors who agreed to facilitate after receiving a verbal and written rationale from the research team.

Analysis Methods

Content analysis coding was applied to the open questions (2, 3, 14 and 56) to sort the data and map it, where appropriate, onto dimensions from Aims 1 and 2:

AIM 1: Physical wellbeing, 2. Mental wellbeing 3. Social wellbeing, 4. Spiritual wellbeing 5. Sense of Achievement (see Appendices 2 - 6)

AIM 2: Music provision (see Appendix 7); Corporate mission/identity (see Appendix 9); Community participation (see Appendix 10).

An 'other' category was created for remaining responses (see Appendix 11 and 5). Musical development/achievement statements were clustered and mapped onto UKES skills (see Appendix 8). Distribution of coded data across Research dimensions is shown in Table 6.

The survey questionnaire included two sections of statements with Likert response scales to assess firstly, participants' experience of choral singing (with some items referring to the choir they were singing with currently), and secondly, their experience of taking part in the Choirs Festival and the evening performance event (including the combined choirs' performance of the Berlioz Requiem).

Questionnaire items in both Likert response sections were written to assess five hypothesised dimensions of choral singing relating to:

1. Physical wellbeing (**PW**)
2. Mental wellbeing (**MW**)
3. Social wellbeing (**SoW**)
4. Spiritual wellbeing (**SpW**)
5. Sense of Achievement (**SA**)

In all cases a distribution of answers across the response scale was observed but in general positive statements tend to elicit agreement or strong agreement and negatively worded statements disagreement or strong disagreement (negative statements are given in *italic*).

The figures in the body of the tables are percentages for ease of interpretation, but these values need to be treated with caution given that the sample is less than 100. The figures in bold represent the modal response⁴ to the statement.

Tables 4 and 5 provide an indication that participant in the choirs responded consistently to the five sets of items designed to measure physical, mental and social wellbeing together with their spiritual experience of singing and sense of achievement.

⁴ This is very close to the mean.

Testing: The Five Dimensional Model of wellbeing

Table 4 reports the distribution of answers to the first set of items organised by dimensions and the levels of agreement. Figures in bold represent the modal response to the statement. The figures in the body of the table are percentages for ease of interpretation, but these values need to be treated with caution given that the sample is less than 100.

Table 4: Experience of choral singing

	Strongly Agree (SA)	Agree (A)	In Between (IB)	Disagree (D)	Strongly Disagree (SD)
PW Enhances general sense of physical wellbeing	47.1	41.2	10.3	1.5	-
PW Helped to improve my breathing	29.4	50.0	14.7	5.9	-
<i>PW NO difference to my physical health and wellbeing</i>	-	5.9	19.1	42.6	32.4
MW Helps me feel calmer after a stressful day	45.6	38.2	11.8	1.5	2.9
MW Dealing with issues of anxiety and depression	14.7	27.9	36.8	11.8	8.8
<i>MW NOT improved my personal wellbeing</i>	-	2.9	10.3	32.4	54.4
SoW People I regularly socialise with outside the choir	36.8	39.7	11.8	10.3	1.5
SoW Know everyone in my choir by name	27.9	32.4	23.5	13.2	2.9
<i>SoW I feel lonely and isolated in my choir</i>	1.5	2.9	1.5	29.4	64.7
SpW Singing an uplifting experience	73.5	23.5	2.9	-	-
SpW Adds to my sense of meaning and purpose in life	35.3	35.3	22.1	1.5	5.9
<i>SpW NO real spiritual dimension to my experience of singing</i>	7.4	11.8	17.6	27.9	35.3
SA Enjoy the challenge of learning new pieces	55.9	41.2	2.9	-	-
SA Develop my musical understanding and skills	45.6	45.6	4.4	2.9	1.5
SA NOT satisfied with the musical standard of my choir	-	2.9	7.4	38.2	51.5

Table 5 reports on a related set of items organised into the same five themes, but specifically worded in relation to the Festival and participating in the joint choirs' performance of the Berlioz Requiem.

Table 5: Experience of the festival and performance

	SA	A	IB	D	SD
PW I felt energised and more alive at the end of the evening	33.8	27.9	30.9	5.9	1.5
PW Participating in the Festival promoted my physical wellbeing	23.5	42.6	20.6	13.2	-
<i>PW I felt physically tired by the end of the evening</i>	54.4	27.9	11.8	5.9	-
MW I mood was more positive at the end of evening	38.2	45.6	10.3	5.9	-
<i>MW I felt more depressed at the end of the evening</i>	-	2.9	8.8	30.9	57.4
<i>MW At times when singing in the Festival felt anxious</i>	7.4	23.5	10.3	47.1	11.8
SoW People in my choir socially supportive during the Festival	60.3	32.4	2.9	2.9	1.5
SoW When singing Berlioz I felt part of a larger whole	57.4	32.4	2.9	5.9	1.5
SoW Came away from the Festival having made new friends	2.9	26.5	25.0	38.2	7.4
SpW Taking part in the Berlioz spiritually uplifting	38.5	30.9	19.1	8.8	5.9
SpW I felt tingles in my body listening to other choirs	23.5	35.8	25.0	8.8	7.4
<i>SpW During the Festival NO feelings of being spiritually uplifted</i>	4.4	10.3	10.3	45.6	29.4
SA Sense of achievement from taking part in the Festival	64.7	30.9	2.9	1.5	-
SA Festival made me feel proud to represent my university	54.4	38.2	5.9	-	1.5
<i>SA Dissatisfied with the performance of my choir in the Festival</i>	1.5	2.9	14.7	30.9	50.0

To test this further a set of items was designed to assess the five hypothesised dimensions (a 'component'). For each component, correlation matrices were produced and the first principal component extracted for each thematic set of items.

On the basis of the examination of each of the four hypothesised dimensions of wellbeing and the one associated with musical achievement associated with singing, the top four loading items for each dimension were included in further principal components analysis, with five components extracted and subject to Varimax rotation. The results are given in Table 6 below. For clarity of interpretation, item loadings < 0.5 are omitted. The results are interesting in partially supporting the five-dimensional model, and the following tentative labels can be given to the five dimensions:

Physical health and wellbeing associated with singing: All four of the physical wellbeing items load on component one, but especially those items that specifically refer to physical health and wellbeing, and improvements in breathing. In addition, one of the 'achievement' items loads on this first factor and this suggests that the reference to musical skills in the context of choir membership suggests the physical skills involved in singing. The negative loading of one 'mental wellbeing' item is also of interest, as again it suggests that this item was interpreted as referring to wellbeing in a more generic sense.

Positive experiences during the Festival: All of the items loading strongly relate directly to participants' experiences of the Festival and the performances of individuals and the massed choirs singing the Berlioz requiem. It is notable that themes relating to the physicality of the event as well as a sense of achievement and connection with other people taking part are brought together in this component.

Quality of the social experience provided by choir membership: The third component is strongly defined by three of the 'social' items and point to a sense of friendship and support within individual choirs. Few people actually reported feeling lonely and isolated within their groups, and most felt that members of the choir were supportive, but there was some variation in the degree of positivity about these statements, which accounts for this emergent pattern.

Singing as a spiritual experience: The fourth component is the clearest of the five and relates to the degree to which participants experienced singing as having a spiritual dimension, with two of the three items relating to the Festival, and the massed choirs singing the Berlioz Requiem. The only 'spiritual' item that does not align with this component is the statement about 'tingles in my body'. While this item did load strongly with other spiritual items as seen in Table 6, in the context of a wider range of items it loads more strongly with other 'physical' items. This suggests that the experience of tingles may be given different interpretations by different singers depending on their spiritual or religious outlook.

Mental wellbeing benefits from singing: Finally, component five is defined by three items describing mental state or mood. This captures the commonly expressed idea that singing can raise mood and release feeling of stress. The item relating to 'depression' can perhaps be understood as asserting that far from feeling more 'depressed' participants felt a greater sense of wellbeing at the end of the evening.

Table 6: Five factor solution for selected items from the questionnaire

Items	Rotated components				
	1	2	3	4	5
Singing in my choir enhances by general sense of physical wellbeing	0.79				
Regular singing in my choir has helped to improve my breathing	0.78				
Singing in my choir has made no difference to my physical health and wellbeing	-0.71				
Singing with my choir has not improved my personal wellbeing	-0.63		-0.41		
Being a member of my choir has helped to develop my musical understanding and skills	0.59	0.42			
I gained a sense of achievement from taking part in the Festival		0.86			
When singing in the Berlioz <i>Grande Messe de Mort</i> I felt part of a larger whole with all the people around me		0.84			
I experienced tingles in my body when listening to the other choirs singing		0.68			
Participating in the Festival event promoted my sense of physical wellbeing	0.43	0.66			
There are people in my choir I regularly socialise with outside the choir			0.83		
I feel lonely and isolated in my choir			-0.83		
People in my choir were socially supportive during the Festival			0.67		
Performing in the Festival made me feel proud to represent my university			0.48		
I am not satisfied with the standard of my choir	-0.45		-0.46		
During the course of the Festival I had no feelings of being spiritually uplifted				-0.86	
There is no real spiritual dimension to my experience of singing in my choir				-0.77	
I found the experience of taking part in the Berlioz <i>Grande Messe de Mort</i> spiritually uplifting		0.55		0.66	
I felt more depressed at the end of the evening compared with earlier in the day					-0.73
My mood was more positive at the end of the evening compared with before the start					0.65
Singing can help me relax and feel calmer after a stressful day					0.60

In Table 7 below, the qualitative findings from questions 2, 3 and 14 are presented and foregrounded under each wellbeing dimension.

- Question 56 (also qualitative), which invited free comments at the end of the survey, typically reiterated feedback associated with the other 3 items. It is referenced in Question 2, 3 and 14 paragraphs where appropriate.
- Quantitative findings from all 4 sections of the survey are integrated in Question 2, 3, and 14 paragraphs where they best illuminate the data. Full results in Appendix 1.

Table 7: Qualitative Analysis – All Dimensions

Festival and Choir Participation Survey: distribution of qualitative statements by factor							
n = 68	Question 2	Question 3	Question 14	Question 56		Question 3	Question 56
	3 positives about The Festival	Reverse negatives producing positives ¹	Reasons for joining your choir	Final responses, neutral & positive		3 negatives about the Festival (excl. col. 3)	Final responses negative
AIM 1 DIMENSIONS							
1. Physical well-being *	1	0	0	1 + 1		14	3
2. Mental well-being *	24	0	35	7		6 ³	0
3. Social well-being*	58	0	24	0		9	1
4. Spiritual well-being *	14	0	2	2 + 1		0	1
5. Musical Development: skills/achievement*	82	0	41	4		8	0
AIM 2 DIMENSIONS							
Music provision*							
(a) Festival venue/ orchestra	61	0	N/A	1		0	0
(b) Festival repertoire/ rehearsal	37	0	N/A	7 + 4		17 ⁴	13
Combined (a) & (b) responses	18	0	N/A	2		2	0
(c) Sustaining life-long music participation	0	0	44	0		0	0
UKES skill mappings ²	11	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A
Corporate reputation/mission*	39	0	24	2 + 2		8	0
Community participation*	6	0	10	2		0	0
OTHER: Festival event							
Scheduling	0	2	N/A	0		5	0
Facilities	1	12	N/A	0		5	2
Access/inclusion	0	0	N/A	0		2	0
Marketing/audience	0	0	N/A	0		3	0
Organisation	11	0	N/A	1		3	0
Miscellaneous	14	0	N/A	2		0	0

1. For example, 'none' (can think of no negatives).
2. Music development/skill responses (see Aim 1) were consolidated to 11 groups for UKES mappings. For example, the responses 'Singing in the Symphony hall' and 'Singing in a great venue' were assimilated with similar answers to one set which was mapped onto Academic and Active Learning Skills.
3. These responses were associated with scheduling (2), programme (2) and inclusion (2).
4. Some responses referred to more than one factor.

- * Paired or clustered dimensions in singers' statements were disaggregated to produce table totals. For example, 'Excellent reputation and welcoming family-like group of people' gave one result for corporate mission/reputation and another for social well-being. Factor pairings between musical development (aim 1) and aspects of Festival provision (aim 2) occurred in 78/82 possible instances, for example, 'I was given the opportunity to perform (practical skill) in a prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra' (provision). This level of paired frequency is uncharacteristic of the rest of the sample.

1. Physical wellbeing (PW)

Table 8 gives the loadings > 0.4 on this component for the physical wellbeing items and shows five of the six items loading strongly, with four items with loadings in excess of 0.7. Given the high loading of the first item 'Singing in my choir enhances my general sense of physical wellbeing' it is not surprising that the third negatively worded item loads highly, but interestingly, participants also endorse the idea that singing enhances breathing, and that the specific experience of singing in the Festival enhanced a sense of physical wellbeing and led to feelings of being 'energised and more alive'.

Table 8: Physical wellbeing component scores

Physical wellbeing items	First component loading
Singing in my choir enhances my general sense of physical well being	0.83
Regular singing in my choir has helped to improve my breathing	0.75
Singing regularly has made no difference to my physical health and wellbeing	-0.74
Participating in the Festival promoted my sense of physical wellbeing	0.71
I felt energised and more alive when I was singing during the evening	0.60
I felt physically tired by the end of the evening performances	-

As shown in Table 6, this factor is anomalous in producing only **3 responses** to Question 2 (Three **positives** about the Festival), for example, that it was an energising experience, and **17 responses** to Question 3 (Three **negatives** about the Festival). With regard to the latter, 7/17 statements make explicit reference to the length of the joint-choir work which is exceptional for a requiem setting and requires the choir to project over a huge, dramatically striking orchestra. In comparison, quantitative responses are less polarised but nevertheless varied.

On one hand, 66.1% felt that participating in the Festival promoted their physical well-being (Question 30), and 61.7% agreed that they felt more alive and energised while singing, with 30.9% in between and 7.4% disagreeing (Question 36). On the other hand, 81.3% agreed that they felt physically tired at the end of the performance (Question 32).

Summary - Physical wellbeing

For the physical wellbeing items, the large majority of participants agreed that singing helped to enhance their wellbeing, and also that singing helped to improve breathing, though endorsement was less strong. Consistent with this pattern, a majority of participants disagreed that singing had made no difference to their physical wellbeing.

A majority of participants report positive physical experiences during the performance, with feeling 'energised and more alive' at the end, and also that their physical wellbeing was enhanced, but this is qualified, not surprisingly, given the long day of preparations for the evening performance, also feeling tired by the end of the evening.

With regard to Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) no participants made an association with physical well-being. However, responses to quantitative questions 15 (singing in my choir enhances my general sense of physical well-being), 17 (regular singing in my choir has helped improve my breathing) and 28 (Singing regularly in my choir has made no difference to my physical health and well-being) cast a different light on the matter, as all produce agreement higher than 70% that HEI choir participation benefits their health.

Set in context, these results may be explained by the fact that physical tiredness was pronounced at the end of the performance but mitigated to an extent by the thrill of a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to perform the Berlioz Requiem. On a deeper level, this evidence illuminates a dynamic debate about the evolving character of the Festival, its creative customisation by music directors and the amount of effort expected of participants over a very compressed weekend.

In the formation of persons, universities would include physical activity and physical elements are seen as more significant in a world that is more concerned with body than the age in which the colleges originated. Responses in this area include improvement in breathing in particular and there is much research to support this aspect of singing.

2. Mental wellbeing (MW)

Table 9 gives the component loadings > 0.4 for the mental wellbeing items. Again, five of the six items show substantial loadings with the meaning of the component clearer when the signs are reversed.

So, a negative loading for the first item 'singing has not improved by personal wellbeing' meaning that those high on this component have experienced a wellbeing benefits. The overall pattern, therefore, suggests that singing can enhance feelings of personal wellbeing, and reduce feelings of stress, anxiety and depression.

It is particularly interesting that those participants who in general find that singing helps them relax and has helped them with issues of anxiety and depression, on the day and evening of the Festival, also felt the mood enhancing properties of singing.

The lack of a strong loading for item six is of interest as feelings of anxiety in the context of the performance was clearly specific in nature and unrelated to more general considerations of stress and lower mental wellbeing in daily life. Some 'anxiety' in the context of performance is understandable and may well help to motivate efforts to ensure a good performance.

Table 9: Mental wellbeing component scores

Mental wellbeing items	First component loading
Singing with my choir has not improved my personal wellbeing	0.74
My mood was more positive at the end of the evening compared with before the start	-0.70
I felt more depressed at the end of the evening compared with earlier in the day	0.67
Singing can help me relax and feel calmer after a stressful day	-0.63
Attending my choir has helped me in dealing with issues of anxiety and depression	-0.44
At times when singing in the Festival I felt anxious	-

In the qualitative responses, mental well-being codes included positive moods/feelings/experiences, liking, enjoyment, music-making fun, excitement, pride and a sense of fulfilment including reaching a milestone. Enjoyment of meeting/catching up with friends was classified as social. An indirect relationship between mental well-being and esteem characteristics of the concert could sometimes be inferred from Festival provision feedback (see Appendix 7, Table 1). In these cases, epithets such as ‘the amazing symphony hall’ were understood to describe an object or context and distinguished from phrases such as ‘experiencing the orchestra’ or ‘the amazing sound we made’ which privilege involvement/inner response. The former were excluded from mental well-being codes and the latter included. 5/6 negative responses to Question 3 were associated with music provision and discussed in the relevant section below.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival) The positive effect of the 2018 Festival is captured in 24 responses that refer to inner feeling/emotion and therefore fit mental well-being codes, for example: ‘It gave me the experience of performing in the Symphony Hall which was a class venue and once in a lifetime experience’. These responses are augmented by another 7 from Question 56. However, as noted above, the mental well-being factor excludes music provision statements associated with the reputation of the orchestra, venue and work performed (e.g. ‘Singing in the Birmingham symphony hall with such a huge orchestra!’) whose potential contribution to mental life is not counted because the experience of being moved is not explicit. Arguably, this split between concert wow-factors and their mental consequences owes something to the process of qualitative method, and it is worth noting that if these factors are combined they produce 147 (24 + 7 + 116) positive statements, many expressing deep appreciation of the opportunities afforded by the event. The extent and character of this feedback reflects strong appreciation of a successful weekend and suggests that the Festival tradition may, for some participants, be regarded with enduring affection. This inference is supported by quantitative evidence from Question 13, where 92.6% agreed they would look back on the Festival as a highlight of their time at university, and Question 41 where 83.8% agreed that their mood was more positive at the end of the evening than at the start, with 10.3% in between, and 5.9% disagreeing.

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) After sustaining life participation (44 responses) and music-making (41 responses), mental well-being (35 responses) emerges as the third strongest reason for joining an HEI choir. Participants use a wide range of epithets to describe how they are moved by choral singing, for example, liking/loving (music), delight, passion,

highlight, fulfilment and happiness. The majority of statements exceed 10 words and offer reasons for judgements, for example: 'I have been participating in the Festival for several years now and it is the musical highlight of my year. It gives an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, to sing is very uplifting.' Responses such as this suggest that choir membership is sometimes a complex psychological affair and associated with a broad range of needs and aspirations. This is borne out by the spread of co-factors in multi-valent mental well-being statements, the foremost being: music-making (25); music provision, e.g. the Festival participation reference in the statement above (22); social opportunity (13); sense of attachment to the HEI (11). The impact of singing on mental life is also captured by Question 20, where 41.6% of singers reported that choir helped them overcome issues of anxiety and depression (with 36.8% in between), and Question 24, where 83.8% agreed that singing helped them relax and feel calm at the end of a stressful day.

Summary - Mental Wellbeing

In relation to mental wellbeing, a clear majority of participants agreed that singing helped them feel calmer after a stressful day, and disagreed that singing had not improved their personal wellbeing.

The third item that singing had helped to deal with issues of anxiety and depression was responded to differently with the modal answer being 'in between' which may indicate that the issue of anxiety and depression was considered not personally relevant. It is notable, that 14.7% agreed strongly, and 27.9% agreed, suggesting some experience of mental health challenges.

Mentally, the Festival was experienced in a positive way, with a majority reporting that their mood was more positive at the end of the evening, with no feelings of being depressed. The anxiety item was responded to with a great range of replies, but in general participants did not feel anxious during the evening, although approximately a quarter did feel some anxiety. This is likely to be 'performance' related, and is to be expected given the demands of the event.

The mental/psychological element is similarly strong in two ways. One is that people are stretched by their engagement in a large work and people's musical skills were developed, displaying a love of knowledge and a concern to develop it. The other area is emotional where people describe a variety of emotional benefit particularly the dealing with depression, which is a considerable problem in contemporary higher education. There is also evidence of anxiety before performance but how to manage difficult emotions over a period. This shows how students are learning to manage their moods through musical performance – developing autonomy.

The fact that much of this work is outside the formal curriculum students are making choices to engage in musicking. There are so few choice-making opportunities in our university curricula, which are dominated by instrumentalism. While knowledge may be situated in the controlled environment of the defined modules with their declared learning outcomes and the demands of the State, Wisdom is engendered by negotiating routes through the wider community of university life. It is perhaps best explored through extra-curricular activities (Macintyre 2007):

Students take responsibility for their own learning when they participate in out-of-class activities and events that enrich the educational experience.
(Kuh et al 1994 pxi)

3. Social Wellbeing (SW)

Table 10 reports the component loadings for the social wellbeing items. Here only four of the items showing loadings of > 0.4. Those that don't load strongly have more of a factual nature that might relate to factors other than a general issue of social wellbeing and whether this is enhanced by choir membership. It may be, for example, that whether a choir member knows everyone in a choir by name depends on the size of the choir and the length of membership. Similarly, coming away from the Festival having made friends may reflect a variety of situational contingencies that don't reflect the issue of the social benefits of singing together with other people on a regular basis. It is reasonable, on the basis of this analysis, to disregard these items.

The pattern of the four loading items is of interest as they do reflect the extent to which participants feel that their own choir is socially supportive, inclusive and friendly, and provides a circle of friends outside the context of choir meetings (although this may pre-date choir membership). More interestingly, those participants who feel more bonded to their individual choir, were more likely to endorse a feeling of being part of a larger whole during the Festival performance of the Berlioz Requiem.

Table 10: Social wellbeing component scores

Social wellbeing items	First component loading
I feel lonely and isolated in my choir	-0.87
People in my choir were social supportive of one another during the Festival	0.82
There are people in my choir I regularly socialise with outside the choir	0.68
When singing in the Berlioz <i>Grande Messe de Morts</i> I felt part of a larger whole with all the people around me	0.44
I came away from the Festival having made new friends I will keep in touch with	-
I know everyone in my choir by name	-

In the qualitative data, social well-being codes included meeting people, making friends, forming bonds, desire to work/be in a group, being reunited, integrating, the after-party or journey and/or having fun in these contexts. Joining an HEI choir to 'sing with others' was understood to be social. Statements referring to 'musical interaction' or similar were taken to express ensemble experience and classified as music-making.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival) After music-making and music provision, social well-being received the highest number of responses for this question, 58 overall. In the context of $n = 68$, it suggests that the Festival is highly-regarded as a social occasion. Within this set, bonding with singers' own choirs, meeting new people and enjoyment of social events such as the journey or after-party are foregrounded. 24 statements express a sense of community with other Cathedrals Group choirs and were therefore co-coded for sense of corporate affiliation. At 41%, they form a significant sub-set, demonstrating the value participants attach to meeting their peers across the sector, even for a short time, in a setting where common endeavour breaks the ice. This finding may have implications for overcoming isolation in HE and resonates with 50% of vice chancellors' statements which refer to common identity across the Group. Quantitative evidence also highlights social cohesion, for example, 92.7% agreed that people in

their choir supported each other during the Festival, and 89.8% that they felt part of a larger whole during the Berlioz (Question 31).

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) 24 responses associate social well-being with joining a choir and 15 of these (62%) with sustaining life participation in music. For example, the following statement refers to the ‘enabling’ function of the HEI choir:

‘Love of music and choral music. I enjoy the social aspects of a choir and within the university context it enables staff and students to mix across the institution. And this choir is one of the highlights of my time there’.

This 35-word response integrates 4 codes (social well-being, mental well-being, sustaining life participation and corporate affiliation/reputation) and as such, captures a tendency for the social dimension of choir membership to contribute to a nexus of benefits (see Table 5, col. 2) and offer multiple advantages.

The value of socialising to choir members is corroborated by quantitative data, for example, 76.5% agree that they regularly socialise with members of their choir (Question 19), 60.3% know everyone in their choir by name (Question 26) and only 6% feel lonely and isolated in their choir (Question 25).

Table 11: Factor cross-references for social well-being (redacted from Appendix 3)

Social well-being cross references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Cross-references					
Music-making	4	17	0	1	0
Mental w.b.	5	13	0	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	0	0	0
Spiritual w.b.	2	2	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	0	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	0	N/A	0	3	1
Festival music Provision (a + b)	4	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	15	0	0	0
Corporate	24	7	0	3	0
Community	3	1	0	0	0

Question 3 (Three negatives about the Festival) 4/9 responses in this set concerned insufficient time to socialise. 2 participants were critical of other choirs, i.e. that some appeared to be under-rehearsed (1) and that the dynamic of the concert programme was disturbed by one choir having more exposure than the others (1).

While these views are greatly outnumbered by those expressing community with other choirs (24) they tap into a long-standing undercurrent of compromise surrounding music training and inclusivity which (according to some of the Founder and Music Director interviews) remains an issue today despite having been addressed diplomatically, constructively and sympathetically over the years.

This tendency is associated with the remit and membership of the Group’s choirs having changed and diversified, including their relationship with college chapels, leading to pronounced contrasts in goals and training styles which seem to disturb a handful of singers.

Summary - Social Wellbeing

The social wellbeing items show a strong level of consistency. A large majority socialise with members of their choir outside choir sessions, and a majority claim to know the names of everyone in their choir. In addition, a very large majority of participants disagree that they feel lonely and isolated in the context of their own choir.

The picture that emerges is that the choirs participating in the Choirs Festival provide a supportive social environment for their members, with only a very few members, perhaps those who are relatively new, feeling they are not part of the group.

Socially, the experience of the Festival and performance was a positive one, with members of the choirs supporting one another, and individuals feeling part of a larger whole beyond their individual choir, when singing together in the Berlioz requiem. The third item stands in contrast to the other two, however, with some participants feeling they had made new friends and others not.

The notion of being part of a large community in a prestigious venue is an area where the social and spiritual interact. This may be a reference to Turner's (2004) component in spirituality – *communitas*, where sharing a common experience leads to a sense of liminality (Turner (1969, 1974) – a different way of knowing and being (Boyce-Tillman 2009):

Art uproots us into virtual reality.... Time in the standard sense of *khronos* [authors italics] is suspended, and space is irrelevant because the viewer/listener/reader is encapsulated in the art, the virtual space provided by the artists. (Galtung 2008 p54)

Singing the Berlioz as a massed choir and large orchestra meant socialising within a large group through musicking and having this communal spiritual experience. This could be associated with experience of entrainment (Boyce-Tillman 2000 Harmonious musicking activity having a shared pulse can produce an experience of 'entrainment' (Leonard 1978) and actually make those participating more like one another. This is why many rituals have included music so prominently.

The social element is clearly very high on the agenda, both within the choirs and across the Cathedrals group. It is clear that music is playing an important part in creating a community of learners with a sense of mutuality and respect – not least in the area of skilled musicians helping the less experienced and universities with expertise passing this on to other universities. Looking at the variety of styles in the first half of the concert the respect that participants felt towards the variety of styles offered with very little sense of competition between the various choirs.

Similarly, music directors are often hourly paid for a limited time and have little sense of belonging. For many of them the chance of collaborating and learning from other directors is extremely significant and cements their relationship with their individual university. The Vice chancellors also have a sense that the Cathedrals' group needs to have a sense of a wider community of universities with a similar history. This may be because of the commercialisation of higher education but also there is a real sense of the distinctiveness of their tradition and maintaining a connection with the ancestors.

4. Spiritual Wellbeing (SpW)

Table 12 reports on the items relating to whether singing engages with spiritual dimensions of life and the extent to which participants may gain a sense of spiritual wellbeing from singing. All six items show strong loadings, and with the first three this clearly reflects the fact that the items include the words 'spiritual' or 'spiritually'.

More interesting, however, are the second three loadings which suggest that the word 'uplifting' has spiritual connotations, and that feelings of tingling in the body are interpreted as having spiritual significance. Equally, it is very striking that the sense of being a member of a choir and singing with others 'enhances my sense of meaning and purpose in life' is a view aligned to a spiritual outlook.

Table 12: Spiritual Wellbeing component scores

Spiritual wellbeing items	First component loading
During the course of the Festival I had no feelings of being spiritually uplifted	-0.88
I found the experience of taking part in the Berlioz Requiem spiritually uplifting	0.80
There is no real spiritual dimension to my experience of singing in my choir	-0.76
I experience tingles in my body at times when listening to other choirs	0.66
I find singing an uplifting experience	0.65
Being a member of my choir adds to my sense of meaning and purpose in life	0.64

In the qualitative data, codes for spiritual well-being cover thrill, inner wonder, the ineffable and quality of religious experience. As in the case of mental well-being, an indirect relationship between spiritual well-being and esteem characteristics of the event can sometimes be inferred from Festival provision feedback (see Appendix 7, Table 1). In these cases, epithets such as '*to sing in a phenomenal setting*' are understood to describe a resource or context. They differ from phrases like '*It was thrilling to have such a large orchestra*' which are understood to reflect quality of feeling.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival) This factor, like physical well-being, has an anomalous response distribution. 14 statements were coded for Question 2, of which 2 referred to God/worship. The majority expressed a form of religionless spirituality, for example: '*The last note of the Berlioz when the conductor (name of conductor) smiled at us all!*' This quality, i.e. of escape from the everyday or a sense of transcendence, dominated this factor.⁵ As outlined above (see Mental Well-being) the relatively modest number of spiritual well-being statements in the qualitative data set may be attributable in part to the coding process. For example, '*Being*

⁵ Boyce-Tillman's research into spirituality in various contexts, resulted in identifying a number of strands that people put together as a meaningful frame for their life (Boyce-Tillman 2016 pp74-8). Two of them could be seen to be religious (Narrative and Tradition) and people who include these in their frame would see themselves as spiritual and religious. Those who do not would identify as spiritual but not religious.

able to sing with so many other people clearly expresses appreciation of the large choir and is classified with music provision but may have been spiritually-orientated by the respondent.

Given that music provision is routinely described in highly appreciative terms, such as *'amazing venue'*, *'fantastic orchestra'*, or *'phenomenal setting'* it may be reasonable to assume that spiritual well-being was better served by the Festival than content analysis has revealed. This is borne out by quantitative data, where 58.8% agreed to feeling tingles in their body when singing the Berlioz (Question 34) and 75% disagreed that they had no feelings of spiritual uplift during the Festival (Question 39).

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) Two responses were coded for this item. One referred directly to relationship with God and the other, to being 'uplifted'. Quantitative evidence lends considerable perspective here, with 97% of respondents reporting that they find singing an uplifting experience (Question 16), 70.6% finding that choir adds meaning and purpose to their life, and 63.2% disagreeing that there was no spiritual dimension to singing with their choir (Question 29).

Religious Affiliation

In the section of the online survey entitled *About You*, participants were asked about their religious affiliation.

Which of these best describes you?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Prefer not to say	1	1.5	1.5	1.5
	Pagan	1	1.5	1.5	2.9
	Humanist	1	1.5	1.5	4.4
	Agnostic	1	1.5	1.5	5.9
	Atheist	3	4.4	4.4	10.3
	Christian	45	66.2	66.2	76.5
	Buddhist	1	1.5	1.5	77.9
	Jewish	1	1.5	1.5	79.4
	Spiritual but not religious	5	7.4	7.4	86.8
	Other religion	2	2.9	2.9	89.7
	Not religious	7	10.3	10.3	100.0
	Total	68	100.0	100.0	

Table 13: Religious identification of participants in the survey

Group	Frequency	Percentage
Christian	45	66.2
Not religious (humanist, agnostic, atheist, not religious)	12	17.6
Other religious group (Buddhist, Jewish, Pagan, other religion)	5	7.4
Spiritual but not religious	5	7.4
Prefer not to say	1	1.5
	68	

Which of these best describes you? * Do you attend a place of worship? Crosstabulation

Count

		Do you attend a place of worship?					Total
		Daily	Once a week	Some times	Once or twice a year	Never	
Which of these best describes you?	Prefer not to say	0	0	1	0	0	1
	Pagan	0	0	1	0	0	1
	Humanist	0	0	1	0	0	1
	Agnostic	0	0	0	1	0	1
	Atheist	0	0	0	1	2	3
	Christian	4	26	10	4	1	45
	Buddhist	0	0	1	0	0	1
	Jewish	0	0	1	0	0	1
	Spiritual but not religious	0	1	1	2	1	5
	Other religion	0	1	0	1	0	2
	Not religious	0	0	1	2	4	7
Total		4	28	17	11	8	68

This was further interrogated by asking about their attendance at a place of worship which might indicate a level of commitment

Table 14: Religious identification of participants in the survey by attending a place of worship

Group	Frequency	Attending a place of worship		
		At least once a week	Sometimes / once or twice a year	Never
Christian	45	30	14	1
Not religious (humanist, agnostic, atheist, not religious)	12	0	6	6
Other religious group (Buddhist, Jewish, Pagan, other religion)	5	1	4	0
Spiritual but not religious	5	1	3	1
Prefer not to say	1			
	68	0	1	0

What we see in these figures is that the group singing is still predominantly subscribing to the descriptor Christian, with a majority of these attending church regularly which might include attendance at Chaplaincy events in the university. This may be the result of self-selection for an event with a Christian frame. Nearly 15% subscribe to a different faith or define as spiritual but not religious, and attend a place of worship at least once or twice a year. A larger number self-define for a more non-religious descriptor and surprisingly attend a place of worship sometimes. In the light of these figures it is perhaps surmising that there is less mention of the word God in the comments. Without more in-depth interviews it would be difficult to understand why this might be. It is also interesting to reflect whether this would be similar to figures at the time when the Festival was started and Chapel worship was better supported in the Colleges; but we have evidence to support these reflections.

Summary - Spiritual Wellbeing

The three spirituality items are consistent but show interesting subtle variations. Virtually all of the participants regarded singing as 'uplifting' and a large majority strongly agreeing. A majority also regarding singing as adding a sense of 'meaning and purpose' to life a phrase regarded as being 'spiritual' in character. The third negatively worded item explicitly mentions spirituality and a majority disagree that singing has no spiritual dimension with a third strongly disagreeing. Approximately a fifth of the sample, however, agree with the negative statement indicating that while singing may be experienced as 'uplifting' and adding 'meaning and purpose' this is not necessarily interpreted in a spiritual, and perhaps even less, a religious way.

The spiritual area is complex and where the change in the society surrounding the university is most marked. In the mid nineteenth century, British society was largely Christian with a dominance of the Anglican church as the established church. In this time, western society has attempted to secularise and then – faced with the increasing presence of string traditions within Western culture – post-secularisation with an understanding that wellbeing includes this dimension. But Christianity has not held the prominent position that it held at the foundation of the universities; many traditions have appeared and the descriptor spiritual but not religious became more common. There was a sense in some of the data that music gives them some sense of meaning and purpose. The item on feeling sensations of tingling in the skin is of interest, as here well over half of the participants reported such experiences, and these may serve to enhance the sense of singing having a spiritual dimension.

So in the data from this research we have some respondents using the word God but others using descriptors like uplifted. We have one choir largely using community members because of the predominance of Islam amongst their students. There is some data about the varied relationships with the Requiem text. For some (probably a minority), it was a devotional and in tune with their own belief system. For others – even in the use of Latin – it introduced them to a cultural past in a way of deep understanding. They became aware of the faith practice of their ancestors. Others were carried along with the varied emotions of the narrative. The cathedral venue of most of the festivals also connected participants in a profound way with their ancestry.

5. Sense of Achievement (SA)

Finally, Table 13 reports on the items design to assess a sense of achievement associated with choral singing. All six items have loadings in excess of 0.4, and show that participants value opportunities for learning and developing skills from singing and did experience a sense of achievement and pride in participating in the festival. There is a sense however, that this depends on a feeling that the choir they are a member of is of a sufficient standard and is capable collectively of producing a good standard of performance.

Table 15: Achievement component scores

Achievement items	First component loading
Being a member of my choir has helped to develop my musical understanding and skills	0.75
I gained a sense of achievement from taking part in the Festival	0.73
Performing in the Festival made me feel proud to represent my university	0.69
I am not satisfied with the musical standard of my choir	-0.68

I enjoy the challenge of learning new musical pieces for performance	0.49
I was dissatisfied with the performance of my choir in the Festival	-0.42

The qualitative data included in the coding included music-making and musical development. Codes included singing, performing, attentive hearing/listening, directing, being part of, taking part in, working or interacting in a related activity.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival) The most significant trend for this factor is that 79/82 statements coded for music-making were multi-valent and of this large sub-set, 78/82 respondents paired it with an aspect of music provision (e.g. access to ensembles, location, repertoire, rehearsal/performance experiences) often considered in some way exceptional, for example: 'It gave me the experience of performing in the Symphony Hall which was a class venue' or 'Singing such an inspiring and unforgettable work as the Berlioz. Inspired choice made the weekend quite unforgettable.' Mental well-being was the next largest co-factor for music-making with a presence in 15/82 statements, often magnifying provision characteristics, e.g. 'The opportunity to be reunited with my choir: having not seen them in four months, it was wonderful to have this event in the location to see and perform with them again.'

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) Music-making was cited as a reason for joining an HEI choir in 41 responses to Question 14, the second highest factor overall. In multi-valent statements the most common co-factor was music provision, which referred to the choir's role in sustaining life participation in music (e.g. starting again, recovering skills, keeping up a hobby). This was coded in 34/41 statements and associated with social well-being in 13 cases, e.g. 'I was part of a similar kind of choir before I came to university and wanted to continue with choral singing. I also thought it would be a good opportunity to be social.' (Time/opportunity markers are underlined). In terms of well-being in general, music-making as a reason for joining an HEI choir was coupled with mental-well-being in 25 statements, social well-being in 17 and spiritual well-being in 2, suggesting that benefits of choral singing are perceived to be multi-faceted.

In terms of sustaining past or present investment in music, the sample of 68 included 13 music students (Question 47a) and a relatively even mix of current students and a mix of people who are from the wider community or have past associations with the university. Survey questions dedicated to participants' music history/narratives show on one hand that HEI choirs offer access to music to participants who do not hold music qualifications (34.1% - Question 49) or play an instrument (26.5% - Question 50). At the other end of the spectrum, it also provides opportunities for graded exam holders (73% - Question 50a) and relatively confident music readers (73.5% – Question 53) to apply their skills to new challenges and repertoire.

Despite singers having disparate backgrounds and skill-sets, quantitative evidence from Section 2 of the survey reveals high consensus about the quality of choir training. For example, 97% enjoy challenging new repertoire (Question 18), 89.7% are happy with the standard of their choir, and 91.2% think that their choir has developed their music skills and understanding (Question 26). Overall, taking the standards achieved at the 2018 Festival and survey results into account, it is clear that HEI choirs across the Group provide high quality, value-added choral/musicianship training to participants with a wide range of skill sets. The fact that most if not all 2018 singers performed in the Berlioz requiem was an impressive testament to the strength of transferable competence and confidence instilled by music directors. This is corroborated by 58.9% of singers agreeing, despite the evident difficulty of the Berlioz, that they did not experience performance anxiety during the Festival (Question 33).

Question 3 (Three negatives about the Festival) Compared with 82 positive responses, this item produced 8 statements for music-making (< 10%) all associated with the length and demand of the joint-choir work (Berlioz). As repertoire is a resourcing factor, they will also be discussed with music provision (b) under Aim 2, where repertoire/rehearsals are the primary classification and foregrounded.

Music provision, for the purpose content analysis, was associated with three sub-factors:

- Festival venues and ensembles: for Questions 2, 3 and 56.
- Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events: for Questions 2, 3 and 56.
- Provision that sustains life participation in music: for Question 14.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival). 116 positive responses for Festival music provision are recorded on Table 6: venues and ensembles, (a) = 61; repertoire and rehearsals/performance events, (b) = 37; (a + b) = 18. This is the highest response rate across the survey and augmented by 14 neutral/positive responses to Question 56. Predictably, music-making (e.g. performing, singing) is the strongest co-factor in multi-valent music provision statements, occurring in 42 (a), 20 (b) and 16 (a + b) cases. As noted above (see Mental and Spiritual Well-being), it can be inferred from the laudatory style in which Festival provision is often described, for example *'overwhelming piece of music'*, that well-being benefits are sometimes projected onto resources and overlooked in their own right. However, it is nevertheless clear that flagship events such as the Festival have the potential to carry a banner for music at a time of national decline in schools, and in this context make a highly-valued contribution to the lives of younger singers in particular.

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) To complement Question 14, which asked participants why they joined their HEI choir, a music provision factor to gather opinion about its contribution to lifelong music engagement was created. 44 statements were classified to it and contain a wide range of time/opportunity markers with narrative import. For some, joining their HEI choir was a straightforward decision, e.g. *'I like to sing classical music and it is on a good day for me'*. In other cases, it extends prior investment of time/funding in singing or music (34 responses), for example, *'I have always sung in choirs and the chamber choir seemed fun and prestigious'*, or *'I have sung in choirs most of my life'*. In 15 cases, social co-factors are emphasised, for example, *'I work part-time after normal office hours, so the choir is my chance to integrate more fully with the University & meet like-minded folk.'* Some singers are tempted to join out of loyalty to the Festival, for example,

'I joined the choir in this festival because I had done 5 previous Festivals and they were so much fun that I wanted to be a part of the festival again. I plan to be a part of every festival for as long as they continue to go on for.'

For others, the HEI choir is their first experience of choral singing or a point of resumption after a long gap, for example,

'I've always enjoyed singing but never joined a choir, so I thought it'd be a fun thing to do. And it is!' and 'I loved singing in a choir at school – it has taken me 50 years to get back to regular choral singing. I did not even know it existed until a friend told me, and then I joined 3 years ago, as an alumna.'

Finally, some singers place emphasis on mental well-being benefits (22 responses), for example:

'I enjoy singing and performing music in general. It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an environment I have always felt

accepted and valued. Over the years many of my friends have been made through singing in the King Alfred Singers.'

Qualitative evidence associating the Group's HEIs with continuity of musical life is also supported by quantitative findings. For example, 73.5% of respondents said they had been involved with the Festival before 2018 (Question 4), 98.5% would attend again (Question 5) and 95.6% said that they gained a sense of achievement from the Festival (Question 44).

Quantitative results for music training throw a wider contextual net around the data, revealing that 34.1% had no academic qualifications in music (Question 49) and 26.5% did not play an instrument (Question 50). However, results for music literacy show that just 5.9% claim to have no competence at all, that 20.6% can follow the notes with help and 73.5% classify themselves as readers.

A basic correlation shows that choir membership is extending prior investment in music for many participants, and that most singers with no music qualifications or ability to play an instrument must somehow have picked up the rudiments of music reading, a skill their choir may have helped them develop. Conversely, and in terms of recruitment, results may indicate that non-readers exercise self-censorship and tend not to join Festival choirs in the first place because they feel they do not have the necessary training.

This resonates with one of the interviewed music directors who did not bring his choir to the 2018 Festival because they would not be able to manage the Berlioz, which in turn impinges on the widely-acknowledged, sometimes thorny issue, that the joint-choir work at the Festival on one hand has tremendous affective potential and on the other may tax some singers or HEIs beyond their capacity.

Returning to music provision and sustaining life participation, the HEI choir emerges as a significant value-added resource that mitigates against music drop-out, supports Group loyalty and enriches artistic lives. It may even play a part in some singers' choir redemption stories as in the case of the respondent who picked up again after 50 years.

Question 3 (Three negatives about the Festival) Music provision (b) attracted an atypical concentration of 17 negative responses, of which 6 referred to various musical frustrations (e.g. characteristics of the part they sang). 8 statements foregrounded the physical effort of managing the vocally demanding Berlioz requiem, a view echoed in negative statements from Question 56 where respondents focused, among other things, on the pattern of rehearsals and breaks. 2 Question 3 responses iterated a classic challenge associated with the joint-choir work, corroborated by some music directors and founders in their interviews, that its level of difficulty and/or use of Latin may exceed some choirs' skill sets and/or become a source of friction.

The point about Latin harks back to the Church Colleges era when it was common to embed in the timetable acts of daily worship which were accompanied by a chapel choir that also attended the Festival. As music and worship practices differed from one institution to the next, there was inevitable variation in the extent of their familiarity with Latin repertoire which remains the case today.

In addition, some Festival choirs were/are not chapel choirs, and were/are unfamiliar with worship genres of Western Christianity. Overall, these variations have the positive effect of diversifying the Festival on stage but on the other hand, may lower the accessibility of the joint-choir work.

Summary - Sense of Achievement

The Festival clearly added to participants' sense of achievement, with large majorities agreeing and strongly agreeing with the positive statements on achievement and pride and disagreeing with the negative statement regarding dissatisfaction.

The items relating to 'achievement' show a very clear pattern that by and large most member of the choirs enjoy the challenge of learning new material, feel they are developing musical skills, and are satisfied with the musical standard of their choir. The principal sources of variation relate to the degree to which participants endorse or disagree with these statements, suggesting for some that there may be scope for increasing the challenge and standard of their choir.

The place of music in the various universities in this area that is most diverse. Some have retained a strong music course, based in the Western classical tradition with requirements for people to read notation. Others have no music course at all and no paid music director of their choir. Others have popular music or music theatre courses, reflected in some of the pieces in the first half of the concert. One university felt that the absence of such a course prevented them joining in. Others with little skill in this area were carried along in the Requiem by the large group of people who could read the notation. The works that have been easier in the history of the festival because it is easier to be carried along by music in a more predictable tonal idiom. Some explorations of original pieces composed for the festival in more atonal and Avant garde idioms have been regarded as not particularly successful. These idioms so central to the Avant garde in the late twentieth century proved too unpredictable for singers less skilled in western classical notation.

The value the universities place on music is also reflected in the huge variety of employment practices for musical directors and how much money is invested in the festival by the participating universities (how much participants have to pay) and by the hosting university. Underlying some of the variety are two other factors. One is the role of the chapel in university life. The festival originated in a college which saw the chapel choir and organist as important enough to have scholarships in this area. It was from one of these valued members of the college community that the idea came. In the early days there was a variety of choirs – some of them from the chapel and some from music courses. Now less are from the chapel and more are from extracurricular activity.

Some universities have retained music courses of some kind; but the number of courses based on the Western classical tradition is declining. Popular music courses, music and musical theatre and music production courses have replaced them. Other have abandoned it altogether often because of expense and its demands for space. The Western classical tradition was firmly rooted in the Christian tradition with churches of various theologies being the main employers of composers and performers for much of its life. Students familiar with this tradition have less difficulty with the style of pieces chosen for the main work, as they will be familiar with it. However, the move away from this tradition means that even music to music students the Christian links will be less clear. The establishing of extra-curricular *musicking* has enabled universities to have a group of musicians for religious occasions such as graduation, Foundation Days and carol services. Sean Steel (2015) looks for a restoration of a Dionysian⁶ spirituality within education (in an article primarily concerned with American education) through the

⁶ Nietzsche used the concepts of Apollonian and Dionysian to analyse aspects of Western culture. Dionysus, Greek god of theatre, wine and ecstasy, Nietzsche viewed as suppressed in Western culture and revealed by journeys to the underworld where dark, primordial, irrational, or unconscious functions of experience resided. Apollo (associated with higher civilisation, music, healing, prophecy and law) he related to reason, harmony and beauty (Huskinson 2004 pp. 16–18, Boyce-Tillman 2013).

medium of music. This he relates to 'the loss of self-awareness that occurs in the best musical experiences' which might be true of music freed of the controls of a curriculum. Musicians can lead us in joyful choruses. (Steele 2015 p 78).

However, we do see two aesthetics operating from the beginning. Some musical directors saw it as rewarding people for service to the college and others sent their 'best' choir. Ethical rather than aesthetic values governed who was invited to come. The conference in which this research was born concentrated in the growth of applied arts in the cathedrals group. This links well with the notion of ethical behaviour and serving the public good. Pascale (2005) describes two aesthetics existing in singing programmes:

- A classical perspective emphasising performance, perfection and virtuosity – the standard or 'taproot' aesthetic that has been recognized in music education since its inception in the mid-1800s.
- The second is an aesthetic for singing which stresses community building, diversity, group collaboration and relationship. (Pascale 2005)

This is most clear in the diversity of items in the first half of the programme and the description of the intention behind them. It is also shown in the way leadership is exercised within individual choirs. Some have the traditional conductor/choir relationship underpinning them while others have edged towards more democratic ways of running what is an extracurricular society – more like a community choir. There is clearly an awareness of this in some of the comments from music directors with conflicting views as to which philosophy should or does underpin the festival. As ethical action in the wider community becomes more part of the cathedrals group it is not clear how this will affect the form of the festival. What is clear is that the festival supports a sense of collegiality that was present in the much smaller originating colleges. An inclusive community is created with a diversity of students including access for disabled students. The assembled group includes, staff, students, community members, chaplains and alumnae/i. The individual choirs provide small communities in the wider university community, particularly for valuable for vulnerable students in areas such as mental distress and student retention when relations with a particular course is difficult.

Summary of Chapter Two

The links between music and health have been debated for a long time (Podolsky, 1939), but feature in many contemporary studies (Preti and Boyce-Tillman 2014). The first survey of the wellbeing effects of a university choir (in a Cathedrals' Group university) was done in 2001 (Clift and Hancox 2001). The data shows overwhelmingly that students feel that their wellbeing is enhanced by the festival. As evidenced in studies of community choirs by the Sydney de Haan centre. The physical effects are largely concerned with breathing as seen in work with older people with chronic obstructive pulmonary disorder (Clift et al 2013). Social wellbeing is clear with singing forming effective community for many students – which Storr sees as the fundamental purpose of musicking (Storr 1993). This compares well with other community choirs (Morgan and Boyce-Tillman 2016, Hallam et al 2011). This in line with the way that singing has been a significant part in community formation in most Christian traditions, a way of forming a congregation into the body of Christ. The enhancement of Mental wellbeing is also clear in the data as it is in many initiatives in singing for health (Clift and Morrison 2011). This includes a sense of meaning and purpose and achievement identified in this survey. This is also part of the spiritual dimension which is acknowledged by many responses, although probably not in the form that it would have been when the universities were founded. These findings present a strong case for maintaining singing traditions in HE in an age concerned with the wellbeing of the student community.

CHAPTER THREE: Intention, process, dilemmas and achievements

Introduction

The rest of the data included in this research reflected aim 2:

Aim 2: To gather and correlate opinion from **vice chancellors, founders, singers, music directors and chaplains** about the Festival's contribution to music provision, student experience and engagement (UKES skills), corporate affiliation/reputation and community participation.

This data was all qualitative in origin including unstructured statements from Vice Chancellors and semi-structured interviews with others involved in the festival. These were analysed thematically.

Semi-structured interviews: Process and Findings

Design

Interview prompts are tabulated in Appendix 12, their primary rationale being to address Research Aims 1 and 2. In keeping with semi-structured style, they were not regarded as definitive nor was their sequence prescriptive. Rather, the phrasing and flow of questions followed the conversations. For context, music directors were asked, additionally, to describe their association with the Festival and confirm how they were employed by their HEI.

Invitations

Potential interviewees were identified through a process of purposive sampling based on their association with the Festival and/or attendance in 2018 and comprised music directors (including one whose choir did not attend the 2018 Festival), chaplains, a member of the audience and Festival founders. Information Sheets, interview invitations and consent forms were e-mailed to representatives of 12/16 (75%) Cathedrals Group HEIs between late February and April 2018 after the Project's rationale had been explained verbally. Interviews were scheduled between March and June 2018 on receipt of signed consent.

Method

The majority of interviews were conducted by phone and retrieved from a tele-conference recording facility organised by the University of Winchester. Two were recorded and saved on other devices and one which failed to record was summarised in note form shortly after the conversation. All recordings were stored on a secure server at the University of Winchester before being sent to an external transcriber. Texts were analysed according to the principles of grounded theory, with researcher-coding rather than data-coding being adopted. Main and subordinate themes and codes for festival founders and music directors are presented on Tables 7 and 8 below.

Statements from Vice Chancellors

16 (100%) of Cathedrals Group vice chancellors were invited to send a short Festival statement to the research team to illuminate its contribution to the Cathedrals Group brand and corporate mission. The response period ran from March to May 2018. There was a 50% response to this call for data. The 8 statements received are anonymised and tabulated below. Content analysis was applied to the texts, from which 5 codes emerged:

1. music participation (9)
2. value-characteristics (7)
3. well-being (5)
4. community purpose (1)
5. common identity (8).

All have strong resonance with survey findings and semi-structured interviews and reflect strong, continuing advocacy for the Festival which, as noted in some of the founder interviews, was instrumental in securing its early health and survival.

Table 16: Vice Chancellors' Festival Statements

HEI 1	<p>The choirs' festival is an exceptional opportunity for student participants to perform at an outstanding venue – often a major cathedral or a concert hall (MP) and will provide them with an enduring memory and highlight (WB) of their undergraduate experience. It also represents a defining annual marker of the cultural (and for some, spiritual) (WB) capital generated by our universities. (CI) It is an inspiring and unique event, and a treasured event in my annual calendar. (VC)</p> <p>74 words. 4 codes: music participation; well-being; common identity; value-characteristics.</p>
HEI 2	<p>"Having the choirs of the 15 church universities sing together (MP) is still the most powerful witness (VC) to the distinctive educational purpose of our universities. A public symbol of the unity we share." (CI)</p> <p>32 words. 3 codes: music participation; common identity; value-characteristics.</p>
HEI 3	<p>The Festival is a wonderful and important expression (VC) of our shared Foundation and identity. (CI)</p> <p>14 words. 2 codes: value-characteristics; common identity.</p>
HEI 4	<p>The Choirs Festival is important to our University because it gives us the opportunity to work together towards a common end (CI) which manifests a wider commitment to our place and being as a University with a Catholic Foundation. Its contribution to the wider Cathedrals Group is the way in which it allows us to signify our solidarity as institutions with Church foundations, (CI) as well as the way in which we can make a broader contribution through combined artistic endeavour (MP) to the communities we serve. (CP)</p> <p>84 words. 3 codes: common identity; music participation; community purpose.</p>
HEI 5	<p>As a relative newcomer, I have only one Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival on which to base my comments but it was a wonderful celebration of musical excellence (MP) and a truly memorable occasion for all concerned. (VC)</p> <p>35 words. 2 codes: music participation; value-characteristics.</p>
HEI 6	<p>The annual Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival provides a unique opportunity for students to come together, (CI) showcase their considerable talent, further develop skills (MP) and confidence (WB) and to gain an invaluable experience of performing in outstanding venues. (MP) The event both inspires and equips them to pursue their ambitions and to aim high. A truly valuable event. (VC)</p>

	54 words. 4 codes: common identity; music participation; well-being; value- characteristics.
HEI 7	<p>The Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival provides a valuable opportunity (VC) for students to come together for a weekend of rehearsals leading to a performance of a major choral work as well as performances (MP) by their own university choirs. (CI) It is well known that singing in a choir offers positive physical outcomes and mental health benefits and this Festival gives students, who might not usually choose to do so, (WB) an opportunity to perform with bigger groups and make wonderful music. (MP)</p> <p>78 words. 4 codes: value-characteristics; music participation; common identity; well-being.</p>
HEI 8	<p>The annual Cathedrals Group Choirs Festival is both an inspiring and uplifting event (VC) which has a positive impact on so many individuals' wellbeing. (WB) Despite having limited time to rehearse collectively, the choirs never fail to deliver powerful performances with amazing sound in magnificent locations. (MP) This Festival demonstrates impeccably the example of great teamwork by collaborating with colleagues from other faith-based universities. (CI)</p> <p>61 words. 4 codes: value-characteristics; well-being; music participation; common identity.</p>

Conclusion

The festival's longevity has been dependent on support from senior management in the Cathedrals' Group, both in terms of finance, organisation, encouragement and employment of appropriate staff to keep their institutions' participation assured. Although religion has not figured highly in studies of HE in the UK, it is now receiving more attention (Guest et al 2013) as this data shows, both from scholars and policymakers and leaders in HE, which includes VCs. They are interested in the negotiation of appropriate provision for students who define themselves as religious, non-religious or spiritual but not religious. These responses from VCs reveals this concern and how the festival responds to this.

In the data, highest on the list is the value placed on musical participation by the VC's which will reflect their own experiences of musicking. As most of the institutions will have a requirement that VC's to have at least respect for or possibly participation in a particular Christian religious tradition, it is likely that these leaders will have had some experience of music associated with worship in some way; they will quite possibly have been part of religious musicking in some way. The religious traditions associated with the group all hold music in high esteem as a significant tool in worship.

In a time when it would inappropriate to make Chapel attendance compulsory, musical events in the chapel or cathedral became an important way of continuity within the chapel tradition. For some of the group, musical events like carol services or singing a service in their local cathedral would have been an important part of maintaining the religious tradition in the harder years of secularisation in the wider society. Many of their students too would have felt and do still feel able to sing religious music without being able to subscribe the belief system underlying them. Having a carol service, for example, was one of the few ways of maintaining their religious foundation when debates about religion, secularisation and spirituality were producing unclear conclusions.

This is clearly linked in the data with responses in the area of identity and, in this case, a common identity. Peter Hemming (2011) identified the value of religious traditions and practices as operating what Hervieu-Leger (2000) called “a chain of memory”. From a time when the institutions were relatively small and the proportion of students subscribing to a Christian belief system considerable, there grew a sense of the need to present a shared identity to the wider society as these conditions changed. This is another example (of what we saw above) of Turner’s (2004) *communitas* as a strong sense of religious identity represented by communal activity - in this context, musicking. Many Christian churches hold large services at festivals, such as Christmas and Easter, and the assembling of a large group of people from the surrounding community has given many people a sense of uplift, even in the context of secularism. Rowan Williams distinguishes between society’s current relation to religion as divided into two groups - patrons (visiting but not committed) and subscribers (those who are committed to the religious community) (Williams 2012 p87). The patrons are often drawn to these large religious festivals because of the music. If we look at phenomena such as the Television Programme *Songs of Praise*, we can see how important corporate singing has been in projecting a common Christian identity to the world.

Also in some of these statements there is evidence of the heritage approach to their foundation highlighted in the Church of England’ Education Office’s advisory document for governors:

Other Cathedrals Group institutions chose to focus on other [than a Christian ethos] aspects of their life as a university community chiefly referencing their religious foundation as an historical or heritage feature, for example, ... as having built strong community links with the area they now serve. (Church of England 2016 p7)

Clearly the singing of works associated with a Christian heritage, (and often in cathedral, a Christian heritage building). In summary, the VC’s clearly, almost from the very beginning of the festival and, certainly now, saw the value of this maintenance of a common identity expressed to the wider world through musicking,

The valuing statements in the data are associated both with uplift, inspiration, treasured and significant memories. The *Christianity and the University Experience: Understanding Student Faith* project (Guest et al 2013) aimed to explore the impact of the university experience – educational, social and religious – on students’ beliefs and values. In these statements it is clear that the VCs see the festival as having a considerable and memorable impact. In an HE context, which is increasingly beset with increased bureaucracy and controlled curricula, senior management appears to be aware of the need for events that will rise above these limitations and have memorable impact. This is the Dionysian element outlined above in the work of Steele and concerned with joyous celebration. The notions of uplift with its spiritual and mental implications has clear significance for these senior managers, when students wellbeing is so often seen to be increasingly fragile.

Wellbeing statements in the data bear this out. The trends within them reflect those found in the questionnaires. They concern increased confidence and talent and skill development, both in music and teamwork. We will see from the music directors below that a considerable amount of very skilled teamwork is required to make the festival work; at least some of the VCs are aware of this and see it as important part of Christian activity. There is also the encouragement of students to make wise and discerning choices in these statements. One of the universities has the motto drawn from medieval texts - *Wisdom and Lar* (Wisdom and knowledge). While knowledge may be situated in the controlled environment of the defined modules with their declared learning outcomes, wisdom is engendered by the capacity to make choices (Macintyre,

2007) and explored engendered by negotiating routes through the wider community of university life:

[Wisdom combines] knowledge, understanding, good judgement and far-sighted decision-making. (Ford 2007 p1)

Some of these statements show that VCs are aware of the richness of extra-curricular musicking in developing wisdom through extra-curricular musicking.

Only in one statement in the data is there the notion that we saw at the beginning of the report of service to the world. At the foundation of the University of Berlin in 1810, Wilhelm von Humboldt⁷, then Secretary of State for Religion and Public Instruction in Germany, wrote that the new university was to concern itself with moral culture and therefore to engage in 'spiritual and moral formation.' (Higton 2012 p50). Higton, drawing on the community formation of Christian Eucharistic liturgy similar to Turner (2004) sees the place of learning in the shaping of the wider society – the common good (Higton 2012 p215-6). He sees the risk involved of not embracing this service intention as that universities will become complicit in a violent and oppressive society (Higton 2012 p216)⁸. Other contemporary writers, such as Harkness (2003) see a move away from a theologically focussed university to one concerned with Divine work in the wider world. Clearly some of this thinking underpins the VCs statements in the areas of community service and common identity.

The VCs clearly see a number of reasons for maintaining this festival based on the Christian traditions of their institutions. We are hoping that this research will enable them to see that their hopes for the event are fulfilled in their staff and student participants. This should ensure their continued support for an annual festival of this kind.

Festival Founders

5 interviewees who participated in the Choirs Festival as music directors at its inception⁹ and/or during its first decade have been designated founders for the purpose of this study. All exerted a founding influence on the Festival in its first, experimental decade, helping to establish frameworks and practices that are still familiar today. Themes and codes from analysis of the texts are presented on Table 7 which also confirms the incidence of codes across the data set.

Theme 1: Evolution of a Tradition

The three subordinate themes for this item are related chronologically and reflect a tendency among founders to construct a narrative round the early history of the Festival: Canterbury '82 and beyond; Westminster Abbey; Legacies. As these participants were all employed at different times, and 4 of them in different locations, their recollections overlap and dovetail historically. In

⁷ Van Humboldt was the initiator of the German notion of Bildung, often translated as formation, which underpins much of the education system.

⁸ This recalls the thinking of King Alfred the Great who saw education as an antidote to violence. One of the Cathedrals Group was originally named after him and still retains this name for a quarter of the university.

⁹ In the absence of records, there is broad consensus among founder interviewees that the Festival tradition predated a 1989 Church Colleges commemorative event in Westminster Abbey. The retired music director at Christchurch Canterbury, where the idea of an annual music gathering is considered to have originated, places the first event in 1982.

THEME 2 The professional identity of the CC Music Director	Management	1. Early networking 2. The versatile CC MD 3. Ad hoc organisation/hospitality in early Festival era 4. Singers were: (i) from ITT (education) courses - 3 ; (ii) from UG music programmes – 4 ; (iii) widely-recruited non-specialists - 5 ; (iv) from chapel - 5 ; (v) from chamber/other choir ... 5	8 23 13 11
	Artistic role and satisfaction	5. Festivals competed for funds/resources 6. Joint piece could be controversial and/or unsuitable for some choirs 7. Peer/student network became a valued professional resource 8. MDs customised Festivals 9. Taught/composed commissioned works 10. Advocacy of MDs/chaplains important to early health/survival of the Festival. 11. Event exceeded/still exceeds capacity of individual HEIs: adds value 12. Repertoire presumed musically literate choir 13. Festival is absorbed into MD narratives	5 12 17 8 8 12 21 13
THEME 3 Festival/Cs and faith foundation	<u>Festival/CCs mediated:</u> (i) An evolving brand	1. Choirs sang at religious services during Festivals 2. Repertoire reflected faith foundation 3. Event/choir supported by (i) senior management - 7 ; (ii) chaplains - 2 . 4. Festival became adjunct to CC religious identity 5. CCs' commitment to quality of engagement (mental, social) upheld by the Festival 6. Distinctiveness of Festival experience was/remains valued. 7. Rebranding era and (i) re-naming - 5 ; (ii) decoupling of the chapel - 6 ; (iii) reframing of music/choir traditions - 3 .	9 24 9 8 20 9 10
	(ii) Religionless spirituality (RLS) and vitalising power of music (VPM)	8. RLS/VPM engendered by live performance	4
	(iii) Religionless & religionful spirituality (RLS & RFS) and vitalising power of music (VPM)	9. Laissez faire: spiritual experience is matter for the individual 10. Majority of singers in early days practising Christians. 11. The CC inclusivity paradox/identity crisis	7 6 7
THEME 4 Choir/Festival and	Musicianship	1. Stretched through challenge of new commissions/occasion 2. Devt. through high expectation e.g. musical complexity or singing with orchestra	10 10 2

musical growth		3. Mixed setting carries singers along by ear 4. Devt. through student leadership	5
	Sustaining life participation	5. For ITT students Funding/subsidy to attend and/or scholarships 6. Through transfer of music-reading skills. 7. For specialist music students 8. For non-specialists	5 8 19 14 3

On the one hand, some of today's music directors note that this aspect of the Festival tradition, i.e. its huge breadth, is now strained to the point of exclusion. The antecedents of this phenomenon will be explored below with Theme 2.

In connection with standards, some interviewees noted that value expectancies surrounding the Festival changed as it evolved. Interviewee I for example, equated a 'good show' with giving singers a rewarding, semi-formative experience rather striving for perfection.

'It can be, can't it, a good show, but it depends how you get there and with the rehearsal limitations it's difficult to put a good show on without some extra sort of help or, I don't know, choosing the work carefully..... I prefer people to enjoy their music and feel that it was rewarding to rehearse this and to perform it and if it's not perfect, so what?'

On the other hand, the Festival's capacity to offer exceptional, peak or lifetime experiences (e.g. with visiting conductors, in prestigious venues, via commissioned works) by combining the Colleges' forces also emerges from founders' accounts and was described as follows by Interviewee K whose view resonates with 116 expressions of appreciation, in the 2018 singers' survey, of esteem-factors and resourcing at the 2018 Festival.

'You do get a meeting of all sorts of people in the choir so you get current students, past students and members of the wider community who also might be past students as well. You've got this extraordinary mix of people. I think one of the things is, I'm not sure there were many other things, maybe football supporters would say the same. But there's something about being carried away on some great cloud of something bigger than you, in singing with a large group of people, even more so than with a small group of people.'
And: *'I think what I said earlier of being taken up in something, some event which is beyond you involving other people and the beautiful building, a beautiful building in which, as T. S. Eliot says, prayer has been valid for a very long time. That for me would be an engagement with spirituality.'*

In the early, experimental era, the musical reach of the event sometimes overstretched singers (so a few disasters were recalled) and conversely, choirs sometimes exceeded themselves (giving triumphs) (T1 Code 4) creating a complex, non-predictive dynamic that all music directors regarded as rewarding but not without risk.

Emergence of an incipient peer network (T1 Code 13) among founders was also noted, a legacy from the early years that is taken up in Theme 2.

T1 Codes 1 and 12 allude to the chapel tradition, which had a direct bearing on the Festival if chapel choirs attended. It also influenced the repertoire sung which, with very few exceptions, expressed the faith identity of the Colleges (see Theme 3). It is also reflected in the Westminster Abbey theme, the chosen location for the 150th anniversary of the Church Colleges' foundation. Interviewee H refers to the event as follows:

'It was the 150thth anniversary of the founding of the church colleges of higher education and it was held in Westminster Abbey at three o'clock in the afternoon. That was a big occasion. If you look at the programme for that, you'll see that the choir was made up of singers from the church colleges. The church colleges as they were in 1989.'

In summary, the Founders see the festival as maintaining a tradition by a continuous process of evolution. The data shows how the changes in the centrality of the chapel tradition have affected the evolution of the festival.

Theme 2: The professional identity of the College Choir Music Director

The professional identity theme emerged from codes associated with founders' management and artistic direction of their choirs (2 subordinate themes). The range of their professional involvement is captured through a classic researcher code, 'The versatile CC MD' (T2 Code 2), for although none spoke directly about the reach of their role per se, it was clear that the Festival depended on a highly flexible outlook and capacity to multi-task. Founders, for example, dealt with finance, Festival organisation (e.g. contact and communication), transport, pastoral care of their singers, accommodation, the Festival programme (including involvement in commissioning and writing commissioned works), conducting, adapting to the Anglican context (familiarising themselves with the large repertory of music that accompanies and defines worship in the tradition), teaching and developing curricular and extra-curricular music. Interviewee L for example, refers to the challenge and rewards of discovering a new body of music as follows:

'It was a learning curve for me. When I was going to church, I was a chapel goer, and it was a Methodist non-conformist choral tradition. I was both happy that students were involved, because of the pedagogical aspect of it; but also relieved that these people were, actually, largely coming from a tradition that they understand completely and wanted to both preserve and develop. It was a win-win situation for me'.

Interviewee L also aligns the start of the Festival itself with his instigating a system of organ and choral scholarships in his College, leading to one of the newly-endowed students mooted the idea of a collective event. From this seed, embedded in the Interviewee's professional narrative (T2 Code 13) the whole tradition grew.

'Something like that, yes. There was a growing tradition of student involvement, and one of the active students in '82, '83 - around about that time - was an organist called (name of student) It was his suggestion, I think, possibly to me, which I then took forward; that we should invite other chapel choirs to come to Canterbury for a weekend and celebrate good fellowship; and if we could persuade the Cathedral to do something in the Cathedral during the course of the weekend. That was it, really; that was the start of the Choirs Festival.'

The embedding of the Festival in professional narratives is also noted by other founders and connected with the annual cycle of involvement (from one Festival to the next over the years) or their professional specialisms, for example, in composition (Interviewee K) or as an organist (Interviewee I). Insofar as the Festival became an annual focal point for founders, an informal professional network coalesced round the planning process, supporting social and artistic well-being. Interviewee L describes it as follows.

'I really enjoyed the socialising with students and the mixing together of staff and students; of just being aware that you're not isolated.... So this was good. No, I tend to think it was lovely. There were some very wonderful, memorable

moments, I think, in the years that I took part. Not because of me; I mean other people'.

This evident symbiosis between founders' professional practice and the Festival supported their role in customising the events (T2 Code 8), which up to the present day is responsible for wide-ranging programmes of the breadth shown in Table 1.

T2 Code 12 identifies statements that allude, overtly or indirectly, to the expectation that singers needed, at the very least, to have acquired a basic capacity to follow a score to survive as chapel singers or participate in the Festival even though some founders attest to it not being a pre-requisite. It is sometimes associated in the coding with the titles of works founder music directors chose to conduct, for example, the Mozart *Requiem* or Fauré *Requiem* or various Anglican anthems, and is implicit in Interviewee I's statement that:

'Now you know the chapel choir was often small and often struggling, so we couldn't compete with places like [name of college] who is a large music department.'

This founder viewed the Festival as an opportunity to give something back to his singers and likewise, Interviewee K refers to the position of those with less training/experience with a positive undertone as follows:

'Many of them read the dots to a certain extent, they know that they go up and down but they wouldn't be able to change a G to a G-sharp, for example They will be following the crowd. The musical things mean that some people will get an experience of a lifetime that they will never forget and may never even be able to repeat.'

Interviewee L concurred that choirs found their own levels, for example, through the repertoire chosen for them. The range was very wide, requiring specialised competencies dating back to the Renaissance on one hand and familiarity with oral traditions which lent themselves to learning by ear on the other.

'There was a big difference at times in the executant level of engagement, where you had (name of college) at one end of the spectrum and somebody else at the other. I can't remember a name to put to that - and style of music: (name of music director) would be mainly advocating Victoria and Palestrina or whatever, and other people would be having much more spiritually orientated, popular works.'

While close comparison can be drawn between the extract above and the 2018 repertoire list (see Table 1) which could give the impression that time has stood still, it belies the fact founders were working in a more unified religious and cultural context (see Theme 3) where singers' instincts and enculturation supported their participation, while music directors today are stretched further artistically by having to reconcile the tastes, preferences and backgrounds of far more diverse cohorts with teaching the long, notated, joint-choir work for the Festival. This, and other themes associated with diversity, are taken-up again in the music directors' section.

In summary, the changes in the chapel tradition had an effect on the place of music directors, especially their employment. Developments in the place of the Western classical tradition in the wider society had an effect on the musical skills of the incoming students

Theme 3: Festival/Church Colleges and faith foundation

Of the three subordinate themes associated with this main theme, the first (that the Church Colleges/Festival were mediating an evolving brand) is the most heavily coded. Here, the fact

that repertoire reflected the faith foundation of the Colleges group (T3 Code 1) has a high presence and is supported by numerous references to References to Christian works emanating from both Anglican and Roman Catholic traditions, both ancient and modern, in founders' interviews. T3 Code 2 has the second highest presence and is a precursor of the Group's championing of well-being. As the concept was not in circulation at the time, the code is expressed thus: Church College's commitment to quality of engagement (e.g. mental, social) upheld by the Festival. It is captured in references to fun, bonding, marvellous experience, abler students helping their peers along and a general sense of value. Interviewee H expressed it as follows and in relation to another question, referred to reception of the 2018 Festival in very similar terms.

'As I said, I think the students that I've worked with all valued it greatly for all sorts of ways, musical, social particularly, I think. There was a lot to be said for meeting people from other colleges, and perhaps other parts of the country, and other walks of life.'

and of 2018:

'I was able to speak to a couple of students who had actually participated in the Birmingham festival which was good. They said it was wonderful. What they really enjoyed was meeting the other people, and singing as a whole, large number of altos or sopranos so that they had to join with everyone else.'

In terms of institutional recognition of the Festival, founders confirm that it was supported by chaplains and vice-chancellors in the early years (T3 Code 3) and in this regard, Interviewee L attributes the coupling of the Festival to vice chancellors' annual meetings to his own senior management. However, as fast as corporate recognition for the Festival evolved, its other source of support, the chapel tradition which punctuated daily life on campus, began to decline to the extent that the once 'compulsory' activity required 'last ditch attempts to make the chapel more central'. Interviewee K continues:

'Then we got all debates about; what does it then actually mean to be an Anglican college? For all the 1990s there was that dilemma, which started to resolved a little when we had a new principal, (name of principal). We started to look at ethics and volunteering and virtues and all of those things. In that interim the chapel was declining and then so what do you do? That was a real debate, really.'

The fate of the chapel affected College and Festival traditions which mediated spirituality through music and by default, impinged on singers. Two subordinate themes serve these founders' recollections and highlight a process of secularisation, re-branding and market re-positioning that took place around the millennium. In the words of interviewee J:

'No, it didn't stay the same. No, when it became the (name of university), it was sort of secularisation a bit, really. It was no longer the same place, really.'

Secularisation, in time, generated an 'inclusivity paradox/identity crisis' (T3 Code 11), insofar as the certainties of the 1980s, that most, if not all choir members would be Christian, with 'a sort of Christian motivation' (Interviewee I) to sing, could no longer be assumed. For example, interviewee H says of the early Festival years 'I think, in practical terms, pretty well everyone was', [a Christian] while Interviewee L notes that:

'Having this conversation, it does bring into relief the decline in formalised engagement with religious practice, in the institutions that purport to be

church founded institutions; and how music actually - the musical tradition - survived, whilst the tradition of collective worship has actually declined.'

This identity crisis/inclusivity paradox extended to the Festival which, since its inception, mirrored chapel practice by including a Sunday service over and above the Saturday concert. As time went by therefore, new generations of non-Christian singers were drawn into a participatory sacred setting. To deal with this, Interviewee K refers (in so many words) to non-Christian singers adopting a kind of detachment in performance to enable them to engage with the repertoire feelingfully, as musicians, without it becoming an expression of faith. This is termed religionless spirituality in one of the subordinate themes.

'Now, it may be that they won't subscribe to it beyond the piece, but they will have - very powerfully and intensely have engaged with a particular form of Christian theology which they may or may not subscribe to.'

Thus, the Festival quickly became an adjunct to a Group identity (T3 Code 4) which was evolving to welcome all comers while being based on a Western Christian base.

In summary, the dilemmas of secularisation are clear in the data, with the loss of commitment to the Christian belief system among the students and the need for greater inclusivity in terms of both sensitivity to different belief systems and a variety of musics. This raises debates about the nature of the Sunday service which has always been part of the festival

Theme 4: Choir/Festival and musical growth

This theme comprises two subordinate themes: Musicianship and Sustaining Life Participation and contains codes which, for the most part, evidence musical contexts factually. For example, T4 Codes 5,6 8 and 9 confirm that the Colleges' choral and Festival traditions sustained engagement for teacher trainees, specialist musicians and non-specialists, sometimes underpinned by College scholarship schemes.

Founders refer to musicianship being stretched through opportunities to sing with orchestras or in new commissions (T4 Codes 1 and 2) and, given the character of many of the works to which they allude, participation must have been sustained for many singers through transfer of existing music-reading skills to the context.

Balancing this, founders refer to less confident readers (or possibly non-readers) being able to participate and exceed expectations of themselves by following the lead of their peers (T4 Code 3). All founders refer to the substantial benefits of rising to a challenge, usually afforded by the joint choir work.

In summary, the data in this area includes greater depth in the areas of past growth and potential future growth. The data affirms the learning engendered by rising to a challenge and the appropriate idioms for this musically diverse community of students.

Music Directors

7 Research interviewees were current music directors, employed on a range of full-time, part-time fractional or hourly contracts. Themes and codes from analysis of these texts are presented on Table 8 which also confirms the incidence of codes across the data set.

Theme 1: The Choirs Festival

Like festival founders of the previous generation, current music directors are unanimous in their support and admiration of the Festival, and particularly its power to offer peak/lifetime experiences which exceed the capacity of individual HEIs (Codes T1 1,2,6,7 and 14).

They confirm that its planning and programme draw on their creative input (Code T1 9) and are mutually appreciative of constructive developments such as the ice-breaking Friday afternoon rehearsals of 2018 which were described thus by (Interviewee D),

I think the value of that afternoon session before dinner was that everybody gelled', corroborated by Interviewee A, who stated: 'It was new, and it was really welcome'.

On a deeper level, this development realised suggestions from a music directors' meeting the previous year which was described by Interviewee A as

'a really good session on what is the festival for and what does it mean'.

With regard to the way the Festival defines itself, where 'Festival' is understood to refer to preparation, the event, the programme, the framework of the weekend and mix of participants who make it happen, Theme 1 foregrounds the fact that the joint choir work, which, as noted by founders, was never without risk.

It produced both triumphs and a few disasters over the years, remains a mixed blessing in its potential to challenge and inspire on one hand and over-stretch singers and/or the time available for learning on the other (T1 Code 8).

Table 18: Semi-structured interview themes and codes for Music Directors

Main themes	Subordinate themes	Codes	Occurrences
Choirs Festival THEME 1	2018 Festival	1. Remarkable occasion 2. Repertoire complemented the location 3. Musical entrainment raised achievement 4. Friday/on-stage integration of choirs broke the ice 5. Impressive setting celebrated achievement of solo choirs	7 3 3 2 5
	Festival in general/2018	6. Professionally rewarding 7. Massed choir brings joint work (2018 = Berlioz) into focus 8. Joint work may be controversial and/or unsuitable for some choirs	10 6 15
	Festival in general	9. The event/practices evolve 10. Competes for funds/resources 11. Choirs not always well-integrated 12. An eclectic stage 13. Cements (alumni) loyalties 14. Event exceeds capacity of individual HEIs: adds value	15 13 1 5 8 9
	Stuff of legend	15. Peak/lifetime experience	8
The professional identity of the CG Music Director THEME 2	Management	1. Festival impacts/complicates HEI choir management 2. Strategic use of social media supports the choir 3. MD sets/applies membership criteria: (i) non-selective; (ii) auditioned 4. The multi-tasking/multi-occupational MD 5. Broader HE trends impinge on MD role(s) [e.g. tastes/choices (i); student debt (ii); facilitating value of music (iii); market characteristics (iv);	10 4 8 39 26

		portfolio development (v); cohort characteristics on entry (vi)]	
		6. MD agency augmented by peer-group	8
	Creative practice	7. Festival is absorbed into MD narratives	21
		8. MDs customize Festivals	12
		9. Festival(s) are a point of self/choir evaluation	7
		10. MD must narrow skill gaps	5
		11. MD sets example/is a role model	6
		12. MD is artistic mentor	3
		13. MD must adapt to spectrum of customer needs	9
		14. MD strives for excellence	4
Choir involvement and quality of life	Music Directors' well-being	1. MDs' peer circle/the Festival sustains professional WB	15
		2. Festival supports professional SWB	10
		3. PWB is a natural co-benefit of singing	2
		4. Different leadership styles are respected	3
THEME 3		5. Job satisfaction from choir's WB is on a par with music-making	5
	Singers' Well-being	<u>In the HEI choir:</u>	
		6. Vocal health exercises are integral	4
		7. SWB is a reason/ advertised reason for joining	5
		8. WB ought not to eclipse the subject value of music.	3
		9. SWB is a (significant) co-benefit	11
		10. No reports of health benefits from choir	4
		11. MWB comes from (i) growth of confidence; (ii) enjoyment; (iii) sense of achievement; (iv) heightened self-awareness.	18
		12. WB of choir is a deep/legitimate goal of the MD	19
Festival/HEI and corporate values	Festival/HEI mediates:	1. Repertoire reflects faith foundation	15
	(i) Cathedrals Group brand	2. CG tradition makes tacit assumptions re: (i) absorbing load of joint piece incl. Latin; (ii) music literacy; (iii) annual commitment; (iv) extent of HEI facilitation.	15
		3. One family as singers	8
THEME 4		4. Festival is adjunct to CG identity	12
		5. HEIs/VCs in touch with the event	3
		6. Ethos of mutual acceptance	9
	(ii) Religionless spirituality (RLS) and vitalising power of music (VPM)	7. RLS/VPM have place in choir	18
		8. MDs examine textual connotation and affect	8
	(iii) Religionless & religionful spirituality (RLS & RFS) and vitalising power of music (VPM)	9. Sunday service (and brand?) lacks definition	3
		10. Laissez faire: spiritual experience is matter for the individual	12
		11. RFS&RLS find expression in the Sunday service	2
		12. The CG inclusivity paradox	6
		13. Signs of self-censorship	4

Choir/Festival and musical growth THEME 5	Intersects with MWB	1. Musical confidence thrives on challenge	6
	Musicianship	2. Improves in the long term 3. Devts. through peer mentoring 4. Devts. through optional extension work 5. Responds to high expectation/example of MD or other singers 6. Devts. in the consultative choir	4 3 2 11 6
	Sustaining life participation	7. For specialist students 8. For non-specialist students 9. Festival experience good for specialists' CVs 10. Through funding/subsidy for students attending the Festival 11. For staff 12. For members of the public/community 13. Music/choir competes with other priorities 14. Maintained sector music is in decline (instrumental lessons/AL/in schools)	14 11 1 4 8 10 7 5

Interviewee F, whose choir did not attend the 2018 Festival described his position thus:

One of the consequences is that they [current members of the choir now that the music course has closed] can't read music. So when works come out which are, say, the Berlioz from this last year, it makes it quite difficult to teach it, because we're starting from quite a low literacy point. So that's a part of it. Secondly, I think coupled with that is that there is, on the whole, quite a lack of interest in classical canonic music. So whilst that's my background and I love it to pieces, we are starting from quite a - from positions from the students from a whole variety of cultures who aren't very engaged by it.

The observations concerning literacy and taste have long precedents dating back to the founders' times and make it likely that other HEIs have had fallow years over the Festival's 36-year history for similar reasons. Two of the universities participating this year have maintained classical music courses; Others have fought to maintain them but lost. A number of music courses have been developed such as World Musics and Performing Arts, but these have not maintained the grasp of Western classical notation that their predecessors had required and developed. The development of music or musical theatre courses have succeeded in some contexts. Some universities have no courses in music in the curriculum. This has meant the rise of more orate¹⁰ musical traditions (Morgan and Boyce-Tillman 2016) within the universities – some from other cultures such as the Gospel traditions - and, at least one of the choirs in the 2018 festival was entirely orate in its approach. It is likely that this will alter the balance of orate and literate participants in the festival. This is already working well for the first part of the concert but poses problems for the shared piece. It may be that directors will seek to find or commission pieces that include both literate and orate elements (Boyce-Tillman 1998, 2016b pp205-212).

¹⁰ Orate traditions operate without writing anything musical down. Many well established musical traditions such as the djembe and dundun traditions of Africa are two examples of this. Boyce-Tillman attempted to do this with a number of pieces written for the festival in 1998-2006 (Boyce 2016a pp205-212). These received a mixed reception. Some valued the innovation but others saw the festival as introducing students to the masterpieces of the Western classical canon of musical works.

It is, however, worth considering that there is a strand in the thinking about the spiritual in music that would see the Western classical canon as the supreme expression of Christianity, or even spirituality in general. These great, unchallenged masterpieces, are indeed the greatest in the entire history of world music. This is the 'genius' view of Western canonic sacred music set out by Stephen Arnold (2014), in explaining the increasing popularity of sacred music in a secular world. He, helpfully for this research sees this elevated view of the Western classical tradition as the reason for its achievements outside of the Christian frame in which it originated:

the *genius* of an art form that, when perfected, appeals to those needs, desires and doubts that are experienced by all thinking and truly human individuals. (Arnold 2014 pp. 10–11).

Although this thinking has been challenged (Boyce-Tillman 2016a) by a number of authors, it still persists, often in unconscious or unacknowledged form in people's thinking, especially those enculturated within this tradition. It is often aligned with a value system that sees notated traditions as superior to orate traditions (Ong 1982). It is this line of thought that may mitigate against any change in choosing shared works outside of the Western classical canon.

That the Festival has survived so long is a testament to the creative and student-centred thinking of all its music directors who allude to it having evolved as a result of the collective agency of the group (T1 Code 9) which is artistically disparate. For example, Interviewee O expressed a preference to prepare secular pieces with his choir, or

'chosen pieces particularly to do with the ambience of the building we were in and so on' while Interviewee C reported that *'I ... find myself wondering what the festival is for. I see it, I suppose - - I think, as cathedral universities, perhaps we should all be representing ourselves with sacred music.'*

Programming aside, most music directors acknowledge that the Festival's success and longevity also owes something to a less explicable but powerful phenomenon, that the familiar idioms of tonal music are able to draw all singers along (T1 Code 3), diffuse differences and bring difficult music into focus in a short time (T1 Code 7). Overall, given the current watershed in higher education, defined by the latest Green Paper and introduction of the Teaching Excellence Framework (DBIS 2015), it is perhaps an opportune moment for music directors to bring their experience of the Festival to bear on the music literacy question and each other's circumstances, and from these perspectives discuss how best to adapt the Festival to current contexts and assure its future.

In summary, the changing nature of the cathedral universities has challenged the creativity of the music directors. The diversity apparent in the individual choral pieces has to be accommodated in the piece sung together. The choice recently of tonal pieces has, for the present, managed to achieve a degree of musical inclusivity.

Theme 2: The professional identity of the Cathedrals Group music director

The two subordinate themes defining the professional identity of music directors refer to management and creative practice, and both are heavily coded and diverse. The scope of the coding itself is a tribute to the quality of commitment exercised by music directors, including hourly-paid staff whose role is no less complex for the boundaries of their contract. Although, like the founders, no music director enumerated the parameters of their choir and Festival roles,

allusions to a plethora of essential tasks were enmeshed in their narratives and assimilated to a code (T2 Code 4) which has the highest number of occurrences in the theme.

A cluster of T2 codes (1,10 and 13) pick up the inclusivity issue above. Here, the challenge of narrowing skill gaps in mixed-ability choirs is sometimes complicated by the need to teach the joint-choir Festival work and possibly train the same choir for chapel commitments too.

Interviewee E put it as follows:

'If I'm there to reflect the diversity of the [name of university], without a form of music degree, and attract a choir that's made up of people from the community, from a range of different courses the two significant barriers to that are its strong allegiance with the chaplaincy and the need to rehearse something of the particular calibre that happens with the Cathedrals Groups.'

The allusion above to diversity of choir membership overlaps with another prominent code, (T2 Code 5, 25 occurrences), which concerns the impact on music directors' roles and practices of the new higher education market. It subsumes a range of factors, including reconfiguration of subject provision in schools and LEAs which music directors associate with applicant numbers, cohort identities and expectations. On this matter, Interviewee A stated:

'They're much more customers within the higher education system', and Interviewee C, 'the market has shifted a lot and some people are interested in music without being a performer', and (of applicants' attitudes to debt) 'I love music, but actually I'm not going to take the risk. I don't want to take this kind of vocational, creative subject when actually it might not lead to an income which I can pay my debt with.'

Balancing these managerial and artistic challenges are references in music directors' interviews to imaginative problem-solving and high standards of care for colleagues and students. For example, they have strengthened their network over the years, as described by Interviewee B below.

'If I was to put a message out to the choir directors with an issue or problem, I know they would come back with advice and support and I know that's there, so it's brilliant.'

Other examples of positive professional action abound across the data set. For example, some music directors use the Festival to engage in formative self-evaluation with their choir (T2 Code 9) as evidenced by Interviewee E who lost some singers before the 2018 Festival on account of the difficult joint piece, and found they returned afterwards:

'I think that those who were just scared off by Birmingham perhaps have got a sense from the students that it was a good thing. So, the choir is in a relatively good place.'

This Interviewee, and others, also confirmed that the Festival draws on and impacts their professional narratives (T2 Code 7). For example, as hosts they are able to stage works they might not otherwise have an opportunity to conduct, and as choir leaders they are able to arrange, produce editions or offer their own compositions for the Festival stage. Another example comes from Interviewee B who uses social media to support her own and a student-led choir of another HEI, affording singers the opportunity to rehearse at home and access recordings of modelled passages (T1 Code 2).

In summary, it is clear that music directors are highly committed to counteracting the pressure of change and adapting their practice to new conditions and demands. As Interviewee D put it:

I think the biggest thing about the choirs' festival is the fact that it needs to be recognised that there is a heck of a lot of work in the background that goes on, in terms of putting it on, and those who host it really need as much support as possible.'

In summary, on balance, this theme presents a picture of highly successful, creative resourcefulness which is enabling most choirs to maintain their connection with the Festival, with a small number finding it difficult to reconcile with their circumstances.

Theme 3: Choir involvement and quality of life

The two subordinate themes for this code refer to music directors' well-being and their perception of students' well-being.

Music directors confirm that their general well-being is served by their peer network, (T3 Code 1), which, among other things, mitigates isolation. In the words of Interviewee C:

'It's useful to sound out your troubles and then to discover that they have the same concerns. Actually, that you are all, in your own places, facing the same sleepless nights and worries about quality, about numbers, about engagement, and about artistic quality, and all those other questions of identity that we talked about with the institution.'

Some music directors express their appreciation of the group by placing emphasis on the social opportunities offered (T3 Code 2) while others refer to mutual respect. For example, Interviewee A:

Thanks to [name of another music director] in Birmingham, we've started to have fairly regular meetings, so it's been nice to meet and get to know the other choir directors. Apart from one or two choir directors that I've known from the past in any case, it's been good to get to know more of them.

Interviewee B: *It's that mutual respect almost, which has been really, really good.*

The Festival itself and singers' well-being are also associated by music directors with job satisfaction and professional achievement. In Interviewee A's words:

'That's an interesting question. Certainly, it gives me a sense of personal fulfilment, satisfaction, something like that. I've actually, having been able to prepare the choir and take a group of relatively diverse students to an event like the festival, so it's an achievement.'

And for Interviewee B:

'When I see them socialising outside the friendships they form in the choir they become their support network for each other. That, for me, is the biggest achievement. That's the bit that I try and nurture and I get the greatest job satisfaction from.'

The high regard placed by music directors on the professional well-being of their peer group is reflected also in their aspirations for singers. Here, the highest occurring code (T3 Code 12) refers to their considering singers' well-being a deep/legitimate concern and facet of their practice. They describe it in widely varying ways, for example, mental well-being (T3 Code 11) has four different connotations across the data set (enjoyment, achievement, confidence and heightened self-awareness), and general well-being is associated with a broad range of outcomes and advantages, such as: *'broadening horizons'* (Interviewee A);

‘to see that enjoyment coming through in their faces’ (Interviewee D); ‘In conjunction with the wellbeing team, there’s a whole other variety of people who come and do it’ (Interviewee F); ‘Then that allows me to do musical things for them instead of being metronomic, but also to feel entitled to be in the space.... to take pleasure in being in the space! (Interviewee C); ‘I’m trying to develop a mindfulness practice with choir. I haven’t got very far with it, where using your past experience can then feed into the musical performance’ (Interviewee B).

The strength of music directors’ concern for this facet of student engagement helps illuminate and explain high ratings for well-being dimensions in the singers’ survey, it being probable that choir members respond to an ethos established by their conductor which becomes integral to the group’s identity.

In summary, the terms of employment for musical directors are very diverse, with some having only a few hours to maintain an extracurricular choral group which only meets for two hours a week. What the data shows is that they have been extremely committed and creative to keep their university participating in the festival. Nel Noddings work on the ethics of care (Noddings, 1984, 1992) shows that ‘caring-about’ must underpin classroom practice to engender an atmosphere in which ‘caring-for’ can flourish (Noddings 2002, pp23-4). It is clear in the data that the choir directors’ integrity in dealing with their choir has a clear impact on the atmosphere within the choir.

In their leadership they demonstrate the skills that Sarah Morgan (Morgan & Boyce-Tillman 2016 pp96-8) sets out as necessary for a community choir, which include the skills traditionally supported in music training, such as the Conductor with a musical focus. Other roles are more various. The *Catalyst role*, like the Conductor, is action-oriented but concerns a desire to create change, a focus on community (Pascale 2005) with an understanding of group dynamics, balancing challenge and support, and with an inclusive approach to the project. The *Organizer*, pays attention to maintaining system and order, with strengths in the area of administration and management, a role sometimes devolved to a member of the choir. Where the focus on music meets values is the role of the *Muse*, who is concerned with the long-term wellbeing of the musical group. The roles of *Muse* and *Catalyst* demand a high level of empathy and interpersonal skills, while those of the *Conductor* and *Organizer* involve close attention to detail and technicality. These musical directors show a range of skills well beyond those of a musically trained conductor.

Theme 4: Festival/HEI and corporate values

This theme concerns the faith identity of Cathedrals Group universities. The first subordinate theme gathers music directors’ views about its relationship with their practice, the context being that all have a responsibility to the chapel (sometimes with a different choir) and provide music for seasonal events such as Founders Day and Christmas apart from the Festival.

The Christian identity of the Group usually (but not always) influences HEIs’ self-selected repertoire for the first half of the Festival concert (T4 Code 1) and is routinely reflected in the joint choir work which, in scale and complexity, depends on all singers being able to follow a classical western score to a greater or lesser extent (T4 Code 2). With regard to their license to choose repertoire (T4 Code 4), music directors note an ethos of constructive compromise surrounding the interface between music and faith (T4 Codes 3 and 6). For example, Interviewee E selected repertoire based on mystery plays for the 2018 Festival, anticipating that the blend of theatrical and Christian content would satisfy both the religious and secular sides of the event.

This kind of planning supports a musically diverse Festival programme, as confirmed on Table 1, and of this Interviewee C states:

'I think I need to simply say, well, we're one kind of creature and they're another kind of creature and there's a validity to that as long as it's well done and sincerely meant.'

Interviewee B also finds value in the climate of acceptance and mutual endorsement that allows participants to perform without barriers on stage (T4 Code 3).

'There isn't a 'We're better than you', there's none of that there, and they're all applauded for their own different way of working, which is really lovely, and it gives me a sense of oh, it's okay to do what I do and the way I do it because they've said it is, if you see what I mean.'

The second and third subordinate themes in this set gather music directors' views on music and spirituality in the context of their performing Christian religious music with singers/to audiences of unknown faith persuasions. In meeting this challenge artistically, 6/7 music directors feel that close, sensitive attention to lyrics (T4 Codes 7 and 8) is essential to delivering musically vitalising, spiritually rich, religionless outcomes (their baseline goal) that can also be religionful to believers (T4 Code 10).

However, this laissez-faire outlook (that musical taste and spirituality are matters for the individual) while cohesive in spirit, may conceal self-censorship (T4 Code 13) among singers who choose not to join their HEI choir for reasons of perceived exclusion, for example, because they do not read music (and would have to learn a lot in a short time), or do read music and think they will be under-stretched, or because sacred repertoire lies at odds with their beliefs.

The laissez-faire ethos (T4 Code 10) and closely-related inclusivity paradox (T4 Code 12) are coded 11 and 6 times respectively in the data set and as such, have a significant presence. In the words of Interviewees D, F and E:

'You're in a situation where, of course, the reason for existence of the choir is to sing Christian music and with an hour's rehearsal each week on a Wednesday lunchtime, which is all I get, trying to prepare for a carol service when I don't have a choir until October, is quite a challenge. I think that these students come in and think well no, we don't sing Christian music'.

... and

'I'd wonder too, with that, and this is somewhere which could be quite interesting to head down, whether within those disciplines which are more therapeutic the religious element might be something which some are less happy with, or less concerned with, or at least it causes some problems. That's just a hypothesis.' 'With that, too, I think there's the little twist in the literacy element, in that those who are very good, who have come out of a choral tradition, or a music - say, the National Youth Choir, or something, beforehand. I find that they are then less interested in the choir element and would want to do something individually or in a smaller group as a consequence.'

... and

There's me coming and doing something accessible, something that I do by rote, and then they're suddenly having to learn a mass, a requiem mass. But a lot of this is something that the choir, the chaplaincy and the [name of

University] have to deal with, aside from the Cathedrals Group event. But it is quite a significant event, if you can imagine, for a choir which only meets – and I have to also point out that this choir only really meets for an hour and a half once a week in term time in the evenings.

Interviewees' language (e.g. reference to hypothesising) reflects just how difficult it is to know whether students are exercising simple preference in not joining an HEI choir or acting on a perceived sense of exclusion. The context for Interviewee D's statement is that ca. 50% (an estimate) of the intake at his institution is Muslim which, he speculates, is a distancing factor from his choir.¹¹ Yet another perspective emerged from a different interviewee's reflections on the Festival Sunday service (which was infrequently referenced in general), suggesting that generically inclusive events please nobody.

Some of my students are non-believers and one or two quite militantly so, I think; others are very devout and were also unsatisfied. I've got a couple of quite strong Catholics and Anglican...

You didn't please anybody?!

Didn't please anyone. The [name of a faith group] were angered by its generic lack of grip. (Interviewee C)

In summary, the survey and balance of opinion among music directors suggest that the benefits of the Festival, while very highly valued indeed, could be better adapted to the characteristics of some of the Group's choirs, it being understood that certain HEIs are very comfortable with its demands and find them completely consistent with their aspirations.

Theme 5: Choir/Festival and musical growth

This theme has two subordinate themes, musicianship and sustaining life participation in music. As in the case of founder interviews, some of these codes gather factual evidence, for example, that HEI choirs provide access to music for non-specialist students, staff and members of the community as well as specialist students (T5, Codes 7,8,11,12). These code occurrences range from 8-11, indicating that among this 43% sample of the Group's universities, extra-curricular, curricular and outreach functions are served more or less equally. Regarding attendance, the perennial problem, that conflicts of commitment impact choir participation is noted 7 times across the data set (T5 Code 13). For example:

'Even if they were rather good musicians beforehand, and we've had many who are very fine, that they're part-time students now is probably because they are working in the gaps in between, and so find it hard to attend. But also that they're required to be in supervisions as part of their course, which also further diminishes the amount of time that they have available (Interviewee F).

In the case above, matters of attendance add weight to this music director's decision not to bring his choir to the Festival, compounded by the difficulty of the joint piece, relatively low music literacy levels and changes in students' tastes. Interviewee C corroborates the wider influence of patterns of music provision in schools on HEIs. For example:

'They [applicants] tend to come from Kent, Brighton area, South Essex, and South East London. I mean, really, in quite a majority it seems, and in that area, music lessons have declined. In the [name of LEA provider] which is the

¹¹ In the interests of balance, it should be noted that this choir has a high community presence and that students may be influenced by generational factors as much as anything else.

state school provider, the number of children taking lessons has more than halved in about three years.'

Balancing this downward trend, is evidenced by from some music directors that their mixed-ability choirs respond well to a consultative style of music leading and, where available, peer mentoring among singers themselves (T5 Codes 2 and 6). Strategies of this type offer innovative solutions to musicianship and choral training at a time when groups are less musically homogenous than they used to be, and according to Interviewee O, they sometimes arise spontaneously in any case:

'Part of the good point about being in a choir is that the stronger members will help the weaker members. Without me necessarily organising that sort of thing, the altos will go off and decide they're going to have a note-bashing couple of hours among themselves. Obviously, the stronger singers help the weaker singers. Yes, I think it might be true to say that compared with 20 years ago, the level of music reading is - people are certainly less confident and possibly weaker than they were in the past. There's obvious reasons for that; with music-writing software and all that sort of thing.'

In summary, the data shows that the changes in the growth of the festival, have generated changes in leadership style that we have already seen above. It is caused a growth in community based support systems, which, in itself, has made the social wellbeing of the choir more developed.

Summary of Chapter Three

Two chaplains from the same HEI were interviewed for the Research and one audience member who is, incidentally, a member of the clergy and attended the 2018 concert because a family member was singing. As a very small, divided sample (2 + 1 participants) it could not produce distinctive themes, subordinate themes and codes under the process of grounded method, so intersections with those of the music directors structure the commentary below.

When asked how far they regarded the Festival a religious event, the chaplains' responses diverged according to their mode of involvement: one was a choir member and sang in the Berlioz (Interviewee L) and the other experienced the concert from an audience perspective (Interviewee M). As a singer, Interviewee L spoke of having a 'spiritual' rather than 'religious' experience.

This remark resonates with the assertion of all music directors, that they confine matters of interpretation and affect to musically vitalising, spiritually religionless goals (T4 Codes 7 and 8). It is also consistent with observations from Interviewee N, the audience member, who regards a requiem setting '*as piece of music, just as a piece of music in its own right.*' As a musician, this interviewee also concurred with the many Festival 2018 survey responses praising esteem-characteristics of the concert hall, and corroborated music-director feedback that Festival events offer peak/lifetime experiences (T1 Code 15):

'Stunning venue.... I think for the universities, coming together for a piece of that size, I would imagine the singers will remember it forever.'

In contrast to the other two respondents, Interviewee M associated the concert with a religious experience in the sense of supporting her vocational and pastoral commitment to students.

'In terms of, yes, sitting and supporting the choirs I think. Yes, it feels, yes, our very presence there, the reason why we are there and supporting them is due to the foundation, our faith foundation.'

Furthermore, on the matter of sacred pieces in a secular world, Interviewee M perceived their having a quasi-educational value with potential to illuminate a faith position and encourage tolerance:

'Well, I think very important in terms of understanding someone else's experience of God as the Aura Majesty of their experience expressed through a Requiem, expressed through the Messiah or any religious work. Often you will see someone else's face at work, and the drama of those stories is brought out through that work.'

This view offers a constructive response to questions about inter-faith tolerance raised by music directors, for example, that singers may decide not to join an HEI choir because Christian repertoire does not reflect their values/beliefs (see Interviewee D, p.40) or that it is compromised by commercially-driven imperatives:

'The problem that all faith-based universities have, or all of the Cathedrals Group have... is a strong affirmation of our Anglican identity and, at the same time, a compliance with all legislation to do with diversity and a strong emphasis on inter-faith tolerance and diversity.... and that means that there's always a confusion between what is, I think, a commercially driven realism and a soft, idealistic statement.' (Interviewee C)

Neither chaplain felt able to elaborate at any length on matters of singers' social well-being, but Interviewee L confirmed that from a personal point of view, he valued the opportunity to catch up with his peers at chaplains' meetings at the Festival once a year and for the most part, felt a stronger bond with them than with his choir. He did, however, refer to a kind of 'music socialisation' within the choir, reflected in T1 Codes 3 and 8, whereby singers are empowered to participate by following the aural lead of others

Although the data here is not very extensive we see a reinforcement of previous themes the valuing of co-operative activity and the wellbeing effects of community belonging to the students. There is here a greater use of ideas of the metaphysical in an understanding of the significance of the festival (Boyce-Tillman 2016a p74). There is clearly scope for much more research here, especially in relation to the appointment at some institutions in the group of a Dean of Spirituality to replace or in addition to a Dean of Chapel.

Conclusion

In this chapter, there is a strong sense of an evolving tradition – a chain of memory - the mythos of a community - an ongoing tradition of musicking originating in the church's strong tradition of song in worship. There is an ongoing high degree of value ascribed to this as a way of establishing a corporate identity and a community purpose – not dissimilar to the way that singing has defined various Christian traditions. Musical participation is valued by VCs for its contribution to student wellbeing (already borne out by the findings of Chapter Two). This research makes singing an important tool in an age of increasing evidence for student problems in the area of health and wellbeing.

This is well served by the music directors' embracing of a nurturing leadership style, which we have already seen is reflected in the values of their students in terms of relationships of mutuality and respect. However, the cost of maintaining the tradition of the festival has become increasingly complex in the context of the decline of a musical presence associated with the

Western classical canon in the HE curriculum. This has resulted in music directors feeling overwhelmed by the demands, both in terms of notated music with a group of students unfamiliar with the tradition but also in the organisational and financial demands of organising an individual choir's participation; this is greatly increased when their university is hosting the festival. This is compounded by hourly contracts and the necessity of combining work in the university with other teaching commitments. This is a very different situation from a time when each of the colleges would have had a full-time director of music with responsibility for both a music course and chapel music (which, in some places, was maintained by bursaries and scholarships and still is in some places).

Their positions are protected by the concern of VCs for corporate values and image; but the fragility of their employment contracts may stand in the way of future musical growth or radical change. This research reveals the need for support for the development of co-operative and collaborative practices within this group. It is an opportunity for the peer support which characterised the data from the questionnaires.

All the data discussed in this chapter reveals a strong sense of the festival of continuing in some (possibly changing way) of expressing the spiritual identity of the Cathedrals' Group. This too may colour the reshaping of the festival and reveal fault lines in the way that the sacred in music is perceived – particularly in relation to traditions other than the Western classical canon.

CHAPTER FOUR: Moving on - Findings, recommendations, further research and conclusions

Introduction

This report has looked in detail at a longstanding tradition within the Cathedrals' Group of universities. Both the world in which they are situated and their own internal structures have changed a great deal over this period. We have therefore identified here continuities and discontinuities in the present with the past.

The data collection was broadly in the area of wellbeing (eudaimonia) but some concerned the maintenance of a tradition in a world vastly changed from the circumstances of their foundation. We have sought to identify and examine reasons for a current growth of interest in sacred music in recorded and concert form despite a decline in church attendance. This chapter addresses Aims 3 & 4 of the project:

To identify collaborative challenges and benefits in common. To extrapolate recommendations for the Cathedrals Group as a whole.

Findings 1

Music directors' excellent practice and resourcefulness are largely responsible for stabilising the Festival tradition.

Data from music directors suggests that certain student singers may be deterred from joining an HE choir on the basis of perceived exclusion factors rather than simple preference. Although music directors are able to turn to their peer network to discuss these and other challenges they face, those on part-time or fractional contracts who lack an underpinning music department are particularly stretched and conflicts of interest have tipped one into non-engagement with the Festival.

Recommendation 1: Music directors would benefit from central support.

Four examples are offered as to how that support might be offered:

- i. Further strengthen their peer network;*
- ii. Formulate proposals to re-shape the Festival, expand its choral/musical reach, mitigate preparatory pressure and equip it for an excellent future;*
- iii. Examine, with middle or senior management, whether findings surrounding inclusivity from this Report have wider implications for the Group and how mechanisms for sharing their insights and excellent practice, including peer mentoring and use of social media for self-directed learning (in this case, rehearsal) can be established;*
- iv. Explore whether scope exists to reward student engagement in the Festival, music or performing arts across the Group through the Trinity Arts Awards scheme which valorises extra-curricular or community engagement and may incentivise people to join.*

Findings 2

Participation in the Choirs' Festival is a much-valued experience for singers and contributes significantly to HEI loyalties.

This raises a question as to whether and how the benefit might be spread.

Recommendation 2: To examine across the Group whether it is feasible to devolve and expand the festival:

- a) **Devolve** aspects of Festival organisation and/or production/recording to student teams (mentored by experienced technicians for example, from HEIs with music technology courses) to provide work experience in complex settings and possibly contribute to coursework assignments/projects, student satisfaction and thereby the NSS.
- b) **Expand** the remit of the Festival, for example, to showcases, student exhibitions/installations, student/alumni research seminars or music careers sessions to reward achievement, encourage participants to network across the Group and extend public awareness of the event from the middle Saturday to the Friday and Sunday or possibly beyond.

Findings 3

Evidence suggests that the Festival and choir participation have deep, possibly enduring effects on mental and spiritual well-being

These effects interact with social fulfilment, music-making and attachment to an HEI. This finding plays into the higher education debate as to whether universities should take more responsibility for the welfare of their students, especially at times of crisis. It points to possible advantages of expanding opportunities to sing for the pleasure of making music, for a specific function (such as a sacred service or graduation ceremony), or for relaxation/meditation.

One of the interviewed music directors is already collaborating with the well-being team of his HEI and attending their sessions, and another is an enthusiastic advocate of singing for mental/social benefit. An important caveat here, is that health-driven and artistically-orientated practices are complementary, serve different ends/temperaments, and depend on different techniques: they do not replicate each other's functions.

Recommendation 3: Raise awareness of the benefits of singing to mental health and wellbeing

- (a) *There is a great variety of different singing traditions, associated with different purposes. In the literature these are not always differentiated. In this regard, it would be useful to identify among the Group's many activities (including the Festival) those most likely to support sector-specific recommendations for mental welfare as outlined, for example, in the Student Mental Wellbeing in Higher Education Good Practice Guide (2015) and raise awareness of them among students, academic staff, personal tutors, counsellors, the SU and other professionals with a remit to support mental health.*
- (b) *To consult staff and students about the scope of current provision, including the Festival, various choirs, singing at events and services or for relaxation and well-being, and formulate proposals for broadening involvement in singing across the Group in general. For example, occasional pop-up, drop-in or 'from scratch' events can offer an extra layer of opportunity to singers who cannot manage a weekly commitment.*

Findings 4

The festival was shown to affect the social wellbeing of a majority of participating singers but only a small percentage were aware of the Cathedrals' Group

Over 80% of singers connect the benefits of the Festival with their social well-being, associating it both with the cohesion of their own choir and the opportunity to bond/network with groups from other HEIs. However, only 36.8% of singer respondents to the survey were aware of the Cathedrals Group before attending the 2018 Festival.

Recommendation 4: To encourage marketing teams to do more to impress the social wellbeing aspect of the brand on students and members of the community.

Findings 5

Social fulfilment is foregrounded in singers' motivation for joining their choir.

Singers also value meeting their peers from other HEIs at the Festival, even for a very short time. Furthermore, the successful mentoring of one of the Group's student-led choirs by an experienced music director at another university via social media, demonstrates the efficacy of using digital tools to expand the Group's collaborative culture.

Recommendation 5: Use of Social media and digital tools to enhance the community of choirs within the Cathedrals Group

Findings 6

A significant proportion of students would want further collaboration activities

As findings for social well-being suggest that a significant proportion of students and/or community members would grasp with alacrity opportunities to engage in collaborative activities across the Group's network (e.g. in research, the arts or volunteering) it is suggested that standing agenda items be created at relevant strategic meetings to identify interests/conditions in common and mechanisms for raising awareness of them, particularly among the student body.

Recommendation 6: Choirs Festival as a standing item on relevant committees in the Cathedrals' Group

Findings 7

The Festival stage celebrates a long-established choral tradition and has featured commissions over the years.

There is potential to extend this form of investment to experienced student composers in HEIs with music courses, through for example, a Festival Scholarship to create a piece of choral or instrumental music for a coursework folio which is performed the following year. Student conductors might also be recognised and rewarded thus.

Recommendation 7: To foreground and recognise student achievement in composing and/or conducting at the Festival through a Festival Scholarship scheme.

Further Research

A recent study in Higher Education Quarterly (Elwick and Cannizzaro, 2017) alludes to a 'real dearth of literature relating to profound happiness in higher education' and proposes that 'flourishing, well-being and contentment should be legitimate goals of higher education' (p.204).

The Cathedrals' Group, as a champion of well-being, is in a strong position to respond this line of inquiry which could afford opportunities to students/alumni/staff or community singers to join a research team at their HEI. It would entail academic staff with oversight of wellbeing and research testing the feasibility of conducting case studies with relevant performing arts staff, including music directors. Data collected here for the Festival Research may be able to contribute.

Work in this field also has scope to contribute to UKES research, for journals or the HEA, investigating why it is that extra-curricular participation enhances students' skill development (as outlined in the HEA's 2016 report) rather than detract by over-straining their time. The Group's UKES teams, with their access to 16 HEIs and critical mass, may wish to discuss with the HEA whether they would support a collaborative study of this type

The choral traditions celebrated at the Festival extend prior investment in music for some and foster music self-determination and autonomy. They also contribute to the narratives of singers who do not hold music qualifications, play an instrument or participate in other groups, or those resuming after dropping-out. They have considerable value-added worth for their participants and enable their HEIs to make a cultural mark in singers' lives and in an area of practice which is levelling out in the maintained school sector.

This aspect of choir membership taps into a line of research in the social psychology of music concerning patterns of life participation in music, including circumstances that cause and alleviate drop-out in classical music (e.g. Pitts and Robinson, 2016). The repertoire performed at the Festival and by HEI choirs across the year places the Group in a ready-made position to engage with it, especially as singers span a wide range of ages and join choirs for diverse reasons.

It would make an interesting cross-institution research with high scope for publication and offer those music directors with a remit to engage in research, and possibly student singers too, an opportunity to investigate an aspect of their practice. The range of involvement across the Group's HEIs would guarantee, (as evidenced in music director interviews) a broad range of exemplar material which would highlight innovative practice.

Research Recommendations:

- 1. Staff with strategic oversight of research, be put to their teams and/or music directors to ascertain levels of possible interest in an extended research project into innovative singing practice across the group.***
- 2. To compare the place of the Festival in singers' wellbeing with threshold choirs and community choirs of various kinds.***
- 3. To seek outputs focusing on life-long patterns of music participation and factors which mitigate against drop-out.***
- 4. More systematic examination of the attitudes of chaplains and Deans of Spirituality towards singing, especially works with a sacred origin.***
- 5. To interrogate the possibility of shared works that include both orate and iterate musical traditions to achieve effective musical inclusivity***

Overall Conclusion

As a treasured and resilient tradition, the Cathedral Choirs' Festival has much to offer future generations of staff, students and members of the community served by the Cathedrals' Group, particularly through the collective power of its HEIs to celebrate the excellent practice on a large stage and conversely, apply wider benefits back to the day-to-day life of the Cathedrals Group of Universities.

This report has looked in detail at this longstanding tradition. Both the world in which they are situated and their own internal structures have changed a great deal over this period. We have identified here continuities and discontinuities with the past. This is particularly true in the areas of the Christian faith as a belief system, the place of chapel worship and the place of the Western classical music tradition in the curriculum. There is a deep continuity in the role of music in the wellbeing and formation of students, the encounter with the tradition in which they sit in perhaps a more cultural way and the formation of collegial spaces in which students can feel they belong to a community of learners with a sense of meaning and purpose.

It has identified within its data how it has maintained the three Christian pillars that have underpinned HE in the UK since its medieval beginnings and which were revisited in the formation of the Colleges in the nineteenth century. There is a clear love of knowledge which is reflected in the sense of achievement in all the data – whether that is students being stretched to their limits and learning from their peers and elders or institutions achieving a magnificent performance in a prestigious venue.

The data shows that the festival does have positive effects on many students' wellbeing, particularly mental and social. Furthermore, UKES results indicate that activities such as singing and the Festival improve academic, civic, active learning and career skills and thereby impact academic performance and possibly NSS scores where intersections with credit-bearing assignments exist.

The strong presence of social elements in students', staff's and founders' data would indicate the significant role music can play in the formation of a strong community of learners. An inclusive community is created with a diversity of participants including access for the disabled. What is clear is that the festival supports a sense of the collegiality that had been present in the much smaller originating colleges, including staff, students, community members, chaplains and alumnae/i. These small communities within a wider university community, are particularly valuable for vulnerable students in areas. They help with mental distress and increase student retention, when relations with a particular course becomes difficult. Usefulness to society is less clear, although in the area of wellbeing, musicking clearly is playing a part in the developing life skills of students who will use these in the wider world.

A recent document seeking to contemporise the Christian foundation of the Cathedrals Group describes a vision as based around four key elements:

Wisdom, community, hope, and dignity (Church of England 2016 p5)

This report has already highlighted the value of student choice in extracurricular activities as associated with wisdom. Community is a new form of the collegiality of the original vision of for Church HE. Hope is there is in the students' sense of wellbeing and dignity in the respect and support offered to difference between the institutions. It is clear that Vice Chancellors value the choice making required of students in activities, many of which are extracurricular, leading to a grasp of their own personal and musical autonomy. The festival encourages ethical behaviour in its inclusivity, lack of competition, and the centrality of collaboration to bring an extremely

complex undertaking to a successful conclusion. Relationships of mutuality and respect are clearly formed which requires a range of skills on the part of music directors, far beyond those traditionally taught in choral conducting courses and including compassion and nurture.

Esteem-characteristics associated with Festivals make a profound impression on singers and will leave an indelible mark in their memories of university. They are connected with investment in prestigious locations/resources, the dedication and excellent practice of music directors and the artistic expertise of the choirs themselves which, in the case of those reviewed for this Project, meet typically for just two hours a week. Consensus among singers, music directors and vice-chancellors about the quality of performances is universally high, mirroring indications for reputational gain and well-being. For example, student satisfaction and pride to represent an HEI at the Festival sit at 90%+ and a sense of achievement and willingness to attend again are both rated higher than 95%. These enviable statistics are an impressive return on investment, considering that the Festival is a mid-year event and does not afford a great deal of time to prepare.

Musical inclusivity and respect is clearly posing problems for a festival that has traditionally had a notated Western classical “masterpiece” as its central work; with changes in the nature of HE music courses, as well as the absence of any music in the curriculum of some institutions, this will need to be addressed as the festival evolves. Alongside this is the question whether the shared work or all the works should be religious in origin in some way.

This last area raises the area of the religious foundation and where this fits in a postsecular society. There are clear spiritual elements in students’ data and in VCs aspirations for the experience of the festival. Little of the data mentions God but words like uplifting proliferate, feeding into a society that sees an increase in people self-defining as spiritual but not religious. The absence of data from chaplains and Deans of spirituality is a gap in the research. Musicking is giving students a sense of meaning and purpose which is only infrequently associated with a clearly Christian frame. There are clear benefits from participation and these map onto the UKES skills; but there are also challenges in this area and suggestions have been made for further research and possible changes.

Undoubtedly there is a sense of an enduring tradition operating across the period of the festival, that also links it with the Christian traditions of the past. The link between the participants and the works sung may have changed in terms of belief, but remains in terms of their relationship to their wellbeing (eudaimonia). In an age when identity, both corporate and personal, is often fragmented and difficult to achieve, the festival provides a way for both individuals and the Cathedrals’ Group of Universities to reveal their identity to the wider community and that this has attracted members of that wider community into musicking activities in HEIs. The festival is clearly expressing the mythos of the Cathedrals’ group and operating as a musical chain of memory in the evolution of the Christian tradition that underpins the Cathedrals’ group.

References

- Arnold, Stephen (2014), *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, Farnborough: Ashgate.
- Boyce-Tillman, June (1998), *The Call of the Ancestors*, London: The Hildegard Press. (written for the church colleges choirs festival in Winchester)
- Boyce-Tillman, J.B. (2000), *Constructing Musical Healing: The Wounds that Sing*, London: Jessica Kingsley.
- Boyce-Tillman, June (2009), The Transformative Qualities of a liminal Space created by musicking, *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, Vol. 17 No. 2 Fall, pp. 184–202
- Boyce-Tillman, June (2013), 'And still I wander ... A Look at Western Music Education through Greek Mythology.' *Music Educators Journal*, Vol. 99 No. 3 March, pp. 29–33 <www.namfe.org>.
- Boyce-Tillman, June (2016a). *Experiencing Music – Restoring the Spiritual. Music as Well-being*. Oxford: Peter Lang
- Boyce-Tillman, June (2016b). Unchained Melody: The Rise of Orality and Therapeutic Singing. In Welch, Graham, Howard David M. and Nix John eds. *The Oxford Handbook of Singing*, Oxford: Oxford University Press 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199660773.013.70
<http://www.oxfordhandbooks.com/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199660773.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780199660773-e-70>
- Church of England Education Office (2016), *Making the Most of our church Universities: The role of Foundation Governors*, London: Church House www.cuchofengland.org/education
- Clark, Linda J., (1994) *Music in Churches: Nourishing your congregation's musical life*, Herndon, VA: The Alban Institute
- Clift, S.M. and Hancox, Grenville (2001), The perceived benefits of singing: findings from preliminary surveys of a university choral society, *Journal of the Royal Society for the Promotion of Health*, 121, pp248-256
- Clift, Stephen and Morrison, Ian (2011), Group Singing Fosters Mental Health and Well-being: Findings from the East Kent "Singing for Health" Network Project," *Mental Health and Social Inclusion vol. 15, no. 2*, pp88-97.
- Clift, Stephen, Morrison, Ian, Morrison, Coulton, Simon, Treadwell, Pauline, Page, Sonia, Vella-Burrows, Trish, Salisbury, Isabel, Shipton, Matthew, Skingley, Ann (2013), *A feasibility study on the health benefits of a participative community singing programme for older people with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease*, Canterbury: Canterbury Christchurch University
- Davie, G. (2007), *The Sociology of Religion*, London: Sage.
- De Botton, Alain (2012), *Religion for Atheists; A non-believer's guide to the uses of religion*, London and NY: Hamish Hamilton
- Department of Business, Innovation and Skills (2015) *Fulfilling our Potential: Teaching Excellence, Social Mobility and Student Choice*. Sheffield: Department of Business, Innovation and Skills.
- Dewey, John (1934), *Art as Experience*, New York: Minton Balch and Co.

- Elwick, A. and Cannizzaro, S. (2017), Happiness in Higher Education. *Higher Education Quarterly*, 71/2, pp. 204-219.
- Ford, David (2007), *Christian Wisdom*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Galtung, Johan, (2008) Peace, Music and the Arts: In Search of Interconnections, Chapter 4 in *Music and Conflict transformation: Harmonies and Dissonances in Geopolitics*, London: I. B. Tauris pp 53-60
- Guest, Mathew, Aune, Kristin, Sharma, Sonya & Warner, Rob (2013), *Christianity and the University Experience: Understanding Student Faith*, London: Bloomsbury
- Habermas, Jürgen (2008), Secularism's Crisis of Faith: Notes on Post-Secular Society, *New Perspectives Quarterly*. vol. 25 pp17-29
- Hallam, Susan, Andrea Creech, Helena Gaunt, Anita Pincas, Maria Varvarigou, and Hilary McQueen (2011), *Music for Life Project: The Role of Participation in Community Music Activities in Promoting Social Engagement and Well-being in Older People*, Sheffield: NDA Research Programme
- Harkness, T. (2003), Authentic and Inclusive Catholic Schools: Some Challenging Contexts, *Australian eJournal of Theology* (<http://dlibrary.acu.edu/research/theology/ejournal/Issue3/Harkness.htm>, accessed 2/6/2007).
- Hemming, Peter (2011), The Place of Religion in Public Life: School Ethos as a Lens on Society. *Sociology*. (45.6): pp1061-1077.
- Hervieu-Leger, Daniele (2000), *Religion as a Chain of Memory*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Higton, M. (2012), *A Theology of Higher Education*, Oxford: OUP.
- Holmes (1987), *The Idea of a Christian College*, Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company
- Huskinson, L. (2004), *Nietzsche and Jung: The Whole Self in the Union of Opposites*, Hove and New York: Brunner-Routledge.
- Leonard, George (1978), *The Silent Pulse*, New York: E.P. Dutton.
- McElvoy, Anne (2014), Music minus affectation: The Joy of the Proms, *Evening Standard* Aug 6th <http://www.standard.co.uk/comment/anne-mcelvoy-music-minus-affectation--the-joy-of-the-proms-9651090.html> Accessed July 4th 2015.
- MacIntyre, Alasdair (2007), *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory*, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Maslow, Abraham. H. (1967), The Creative Attitude. In Mooney R.L. and Razik T.A. (eds.) (1967) *Explorations in Creativity*, New York: Harper and Row, pp40–55.
- Morgan, Sarah and Boyce-Tillman, June (2016), *A River rather than a Road: The community choir as spiritual experience*, Oxford: Peter Lang.
- Meland, Bernard, (1976) *Fallible Forms and Symbols*, Philadelphia: Forum Press.
- Neves, J. (2016) *Student Engagement and Skills Development: the student engagement survey 2016*. York: HEA.

- Noddings, Nel (1984), *Caring, a feminine approach to ethics & moral education*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Noddings, N. (1992), *The challenge to care in school: an alternative approach to education*, New York: Teachers College Press.
- Noddings, Nel (2002), *Starting at Home: Caring and Social Policy*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Ong, Walter, (1982), *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word*, London and New York: Methuen
- Pascale, L.M. (2005), Dispelling the Myth of the Non-Singer: Embracing Two Aesthetics for Singing, *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 13, pp165–75
- Pitts, S. and Robinson, K. (2016), Dropping in and dropping out: experiences of sustaining and ceasing amateur participation in classical music, *British Journal of Music Education*, 33/3, pp.327-346.
- Podolsky, E. (1939), *The doctor prescribes music: The influence of music on health and personality*, New York, NY: Frederick A. Stokes Company.
- Preti, Costanza and Boyce-Tillman, June (2014), *Elevate, Using the Arts to uplift people in hospital*, Research Report, University of Winchester
- Rogers, Carl (1976), *On Becoming a Person*, London: Constable.
- Small, Christopher (1998), *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening*, Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press
- Steel, Sean, *The Birth of Dionysian Education (Out of the Spirit of Music)*, (Part Two Philosophy of Music Education Review Vol 23 No.1 Spring 2015, 2015), pp67-81
- Storr, Anthony (1993), *Music and the Mind*, London: HarperCollins
- Taylor, Charles (2007), *A Secular Age*, Cambridge MA and London: Belknap Press of Harvard University
- Trinity College, London (2018) *Arts Award*. Available at <http://www.artsaward.org.uk/site/?id=64>
- Turner, Victor (1969, 1974). *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-structure*. Baltimore: Penguin Books
- Turner, Victor (2004) <<http://www.creativeresistance.ca/communitas/definingliminality-and-communitas-with-excerpts-by-victor-turner.htm>> Accessed June 25th 2004 Unpublished paper.
- Universities UK (2015) *Student Mental Wellbeing in Higher Education Guide*. London: Universities UK.
- Voegelin, Salome (2010), *Listening to Noise and silence: Toward a philosophy of sound art*, New York and London: Continuum
- Westerlund, Heidi (2002), *Bridging Experience, Action, and Culture in Music Education*, Studia Musica 16, Helsinki: Sibelius Academy
- Williams, Rowan (2012), *Faith in the Public Square*, London: Bloomsbury.
- Williams Rowan (2018), Lecture at Holy Rood House, July.

Addendum

In the interest of gaining additional insight from the online survey data, qualitative analysis was also undertaken in the following additional three domains:

1. UK Engagement Survey
2. Corporate reputation and affiliation
3. Community Participation

Higher Education Academy UK Engagement Survey

The research undertook an additional mapping of the results on the 8 Cathedrals Group HEIs who participated in the 2015 UK Engagement Survey (HEA, 2016) comprising 25% of the national sample. This rate of involvement reflects the value attached by the Group to activities such as sports and societies which contribute to student engagement and quality of life.

Currently voluntary, and completed alongside the NSS, the UKES measures participation rates among undergraduates in volunteering, extra-curricular activities, paid work and caring, and calculates the value-added benefit of this involvement on students' academic, civic, career and active learning skills. With regard to the Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) UKES results are sufficiently substantial to support HEIs' context statements for assessment and ranking.

Appendix 8 demonstrates that experience offered by the Choirs Festival, as evidenced by singers' qualitative statements on the survey, can be applied to all four UKES skill sets. For example:

- **Academic skills:** thinking critically and analytically, which manifests in music problem-solving at the Festival.
- **Active learning:** i.e. becoming an independent learner, which manifests in adapting to the exceptional context and working effectively with others, especially in the joint-choir work.
- **Civic skills:** which manifests in tackling real-world complex problems, such as stage-craft and organisation of the Festival (especially for the host).
- **Career skills:** which manifests in hard, subject expertise for music specialists, and soft skills for non-specialists.

2016 UKES results show that involvement in non-taught activity > 11h per week, had a greater impact than taught activity overall on generic skill development. In this cohort, academic skills were 7% better for students who participated in non-taught activity than those who didn't, career skills were 15% better, and civic and active learnings skills 5% better each. All these results were statistically significant (HEA, 2016) and attest to the currency and hidden value of events such as the Choirs Festival which have multi-modal skill benefits. Further research is recommended.

Corporate reputation and affiliation

Although not part of the five dimensions, codes were analysed for corporate reputation and affiliation cover a sense of belonging to universities/choirs in the Cathedrals Group, reference to and/or sense of connection with peer groups/choirs from other universities and allusion to prestige factors/reputation.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival). 39 responses were classified to this factor, of which 24 (61%) were associated with social well-being, the strongest co-factor in multi-valent statements. In these cases, singers referred to a sense of friendship, common purpose or community with their peers from around the country and were inspired (in some cases deeply) by the collective character of the event, for example,

'There was a great sense of community amongst the universities', or 'Friendship with other singers from all over' or 'I was able to feel a sense of belonging – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the huge collective choir from all walks of life. We were all able to contribute to the Performance and work together as a team. Although, most of the people in the room were strangers from different parts of the country we all seemed united by the music and the goal to perform'.

On one hand, this evidence is supported by quantitative items, for example, Question 36 where, despite the short duration of the event, 29.4% of singers said they had made friends at the Festival with whom they would keep in touch, with 25% in between. On the other, it contrasts with Question 12, where only 36% of respondents said that they were aware of the Cathedrals Group before attending the Choirs Festival.

Returning to Question 2, other qualitative statements referred to the hospitality of the host university, to the Festival's reputation and to opportunities to mix with colleagues from their own or other institutions. Named reference to respondents' own university also qualified for inclusion. In the context of $n = 68$, 39 expressions of corporate awareness overall (57%) is fair to good and complements the finding that 92.6% were proud to represent their university at the Festival (Question 40).

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) 24 responses were assimilated to this item. The majority were selected because respondents refer with appreciation to their institution, or because references to the Festival/reputational matters/mixing with others in their institution are included. For example,

'I enjoy singing and performing music in general. It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an environment I have always felt accepted and valued in. Over the years many of my friends have been made through singing in the King Alfred Singers'.

This response is also typical of those which contribute to mental well-being, the most significant co-factor for corporate reputation/affiliation with a presence in 11/24 statements, and social well-being which is implicated in 7/24. It is interesting that corporate affiliation/reputation tends to be defined by statements which reveal, (incidentally) whether participants are students, members of staff or community members. Against this parameter, mental and social co-benefits are very evenly distributed which suggests that they are cross-generational and have potential, through singers' advocacy and enthusiasm, to contribute to reputational gain in a wide range of settings.

Community Participation

Community participation is the primary classification for self-identified alumni. Community statements are classified as such by content, especially permeability of HEI boundaries. It is not assumed that they are voiced exclusively by community participants.

Question 2 (Three positives about the Festival). 6 community participation responses are associated with this question. They express, in various ways, appreciation of the outreach opportunities and sense of belonging afforded by the Festival. For example,

'It is often not an experience obtainable for amateur musicians so I valued the chance to perform in such a place' and 'Experiencing the wonderful migration of similarly minded people from the various universities and enjoying the general comradeship from the different corners of the country'.

All 6 responses are associated with well-being co-dimension (mental, spiritual and social) indicating that the Group's mission to enhance quality of life reaches beyond HEI boundaries.

Question 14 (Reasons for joining your HEI choir) All 10 community participation responses to this question are associated with a music provision co-factor, sustaining life participation in music. 5 participants were developing a habit acquired at university by joining the choir, one was seeking a new hobby, one joined specifically to access the 2018 Festival, one referred to networking with a local choral group and another to recommendations from family or friends.

Overall these responses, as a set, indicate that life continuities tend to figure highly in these participants' motivation for joining an HEI choir.

Appendix 1: Questionnaire

 THE CATHEDRALS GROUP	
 UNIVERSITY OF WINCHESTER	 Canterbury Christ Church University

CATHEDRALS GROUP CHOIRS FESTIVAL QUESTIONNAIRE

Cathedrals Group: Survey of choir members from Cathedrals Group University attending the 2018 Choirs Festival, Newman University, February 2018

Dear Choir Member

Thank you for participating in this survey! We are very interested to gather feedback from you following your participation in the Choirs Festival in Birmingham at the end of February.

There are a few open questions so you can tell us about your experience in your own words, and then some simple statements we would like you to think about in relation to singing. You will see that we are interested in the extent to which you feel that singing has had benefits for your physical, mental, social and spiritual wellbeing, and also your learning and achievements in music.

The questionnaire is completely anonymous and you do not need to give your name. The information gathered is for a research project directed from the University of Winchester and has received ethical approval from the university. The data gathered will be analysed and a report prepared. A brief summary of the findings from the study will be made available to you through your choir leader in the autumn 2018.

SECTION A

ABOUT THE FESTIVAL

1. Which university did you represent in the Choirs Festival? (options provided for ticking)
2. Please give us THREE positive highlights for you of being part of the Choirs Festival (please think about all aspects of your experience in being in Birmingham)

3. Please tell us about any negative aspects or experiences of the Choirs Festival for you

- | | | |
|--|-----|----|
| 4. Have you attended any Choirs Festivals in previous years? | Yes | No |
| 5. Would you attend the Festival next year if you had the opportunity? | Yes | No |
| 6. Did you make a contribution towards the costs of attending the Festival? | | |
| | Yes | No |
| 7. Did your choir meet with your Vice-Chancellor during the Festival? | Yes | No |
| 8. Overall, was the Festival well organised? | Yes | No |
| 9. Did you feel well prepared for the Festival before arriving in Birmingham? | | |
| | Yes | No |
| 10. Did you attend the Festival church service following the Festival? | Yes | No |
| 11. Did you attend the social event/party after the Festival? | Yes | No |
| 12. Were you aware of the Cathedrals Group before attending the Choirs Festival(s)? | | |
| | Yes | No |
| 13. Will you look back on the Choirs Festival as a highlight of your time at university? | | |
| | Yes | No |

SECTION B

ABOUT YOUR CHOIR

Before answering the specific items below, please tell us what your main reasons were for joining the choir you are part of in this Festival?

Thinking about your experience of singing in your choir, do you agree or disagree with the following statements? PLEASE NOTE SOME STATEMENTS ARE NEGATIVELY WORDED SO TAKE CARE IN REPLYING

1. Singing in my choir enhances my general sense of physical wellbeing

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

2. I find singing an uplifting experience

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

3. Regular singing in my choir has helped to improve my breathing

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

4. I enjoy the challenge of learning new musical pieces for performance

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

5. There are people in my choir I regularly socialise with outside the choir

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

6. Attending my choir has helped me in dealing with issues of anxiety and depression

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

7. Being a member of my choir adds to my sense of meaning and purpose in life

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

8. Singing with my choir has not improved my personal wellbeing

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

9. I am not satisfied with the musical standard of my choir

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

10. Singing can help me relax and feeling calmer after a stressful day

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

11. I feel lonely and isolated in my choir

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

12. Being a member of my choir has helped to develop my musical understanding and skills

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

13. I know everyone in my choir by name

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

14. Singing regularly in my choir has made no difference to my physical health and wellbeing

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

15. There is no real spiritual dimension to my experience of singing in my choir

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

SECTION C

ABOUT YOUR EXPERIENCE OF SINGING IN THE FESTIVAL EVENING EVENT

Please indicate your response to the following statements about your experience of the Festival event on Saturday evening using the five-point scale from Strongly disagree to Strongly agree. PLEASE NOTE SOME STATEMENTS ARE NEGATIVELY WORDED SO TAKE CARE IN REPLYING.

1. Participating in the Festival event promoted my sense of physical wellbeing

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

2. When singing in the Berlioz *Grande Messe des Morts* I felt part of a larger whole with all the people around me

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

3. I felt physically tired by the end of the evening performances

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

4. At times when singing in the Festival I felt anxious

Strongly agree
Agree
In between
Disagree
Strongly disagree

5. I experienced tingles in my body at times when listening to other choirs singing

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

6. I was dissatisfied with the performance of my choir in the Festival

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

7. I felt energised and more alive when I was singing during the evening

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

8. I felt more depressed at the end of the evening compared with earlier in the day

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

9. I came away from the Festival having made new friends I will keep in touch with

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

10. During the course of the Festival I had no feelings of being spiritually uplifted

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

11. Performing in the Festival made me feel proud to represent my university

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

12. My mood was more positive at the end of the evening compared with before the start

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

13. People in my choir were socially supportive of one another during the Festival

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

14. I found the experience of taking part in the Berlioz *Grande Messe des Morts* spiritually uplifting

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

15. I gained a sense of achievement from taking part in the Festival

Strongly agree

Agree

In between

Disagree

Strongly disagree

SECTION D

ABOUT YOU

Age

under 20	1
20 - 29	2
30 - 39	3
40 — 49	4
50 - 59	5
60 - 69	6
70 - 79	7
80 - 89	8
Over 90	9

Sex/Gender

Male	1
Female	2
Other	3

If you are currently a student

What is your year of study

Undergraduate 1, 2, 3 / Postgraduate

Are you studying music?

Yes No

If **not** currently a student

Highest level of education

O-level/GCSE, FE qualification, HE qualification

Occupation

Unemployed, Retired, Unskilled manual, Skilled manual,
White collar unskilled, White Collar skilled, Professional

Do you have any of the following academic qualifications in music?

O-level/GCSE

A level

Access to Music

Higher education qualification

Can you play a musical instrument or instruments?

Yes No

If you have taken music examinations (for an instrument or singing) what is the highest grade level you have achieved?

Not applicable

Grades 1-3

Grades 4-5

Grades 6-8

In the last year have you performed on your instrument in public as part of an orchestra, small ensemble or band?

Yes No

In the last year, have you sung a solo part in any performance event?

Yes No

How would you rate your ability to read a musical score?

I cannot read music

I can follow the notes with help

I can read music quite well

I am skilled at reading music

Which of these, best describes you?

Spiritual but not religious	1
Pagan	
Humanist	2
Agnostic	3
Atheist	4
Christian	5
Muslim	6
Buddhist	7
Hindu	8
Jewish	9
Sikh	10
Baha'i	11
Other religion	12

Do you attend a place of worship?

Daily	1
Once a week	2
Some times	3
Once or twice a year	4
Never	5

What is your ethnic group? Choose one option that best describes your ethnic group or background

White

1. English/Welsh/Scottish/Northern Irish/British
2. Irish
3. Gypsy or Irish Traveller
4. Any other White background, please describe

Mixed/Multiple ethnic groups

5. White and Black Caribbean
6. White and Black African
7. White and Asian
8. Any other Mixed/Multiple ethnic background, please describe

Asian/Asian British

9. Indian
10. Pakistani
11. Bangladeshi
12. Chinese
13. Any other Asian background, please describe

Black/ African/Caribbean/Black British

14. African
15. Caribbean
16. Any other Black/African/Caribbean background, please describe

Other ethnic group

17. Arab

18. Any other ethnic group, please describe

Do you have any more comments about any aspect of the Choirs Festival, please give them here.

--

THANK YOU!

A REPORT ON THIS PROJECT WILL BE PUBLISHED IN THE AUTUMN THIS YEAR
AND YOU WILL RECEIVE A SUMMARY OF THE KEY FINDINGS THROUGH YOUR
CHOIR

Appendices 2 - 12

Note 1. Appendix 8 shows UKES mappings.

Note 2. Appendix 12 maps project aims onto semi-structured interview questions.

Note 3. Appendices 2-7 and 9-11 map responses to survey questions 2,3,14 and 56 onto research factors as follows:

Aim 1

Appendix 2: music-making (skills/achievement);

Appendix 3: social well-being;

Appendix 4: physical well-being;

Appendix 5: mental well-being;

Appendix 6: spiritual well-being.

Aim 2

Appendix 7, music provision: (a) Festival venue/ensembles and (b) Festival repertoire, rehearsal/performance events (questions 2,3 and 56); (c) the HEI choir as a resource for sustaining life participation in music (question 14).

Appendix 9: corporate reputation/affiliation;

Appendix 10: community participation.

Other

Appendix 11.

In Appendices 2-7 and 9-10 italics highlight content belonging to its *main factor* or a *music-making + music provision factor*. The statement below for example, pairs music-making (*the opportunity to perform*), with Festival music provision (a) (*prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra*) and occurs in Appendices 2 and 7.

Italics below pair music-making and Festival provision (a).	
Cross-reference	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">1: mental well-being.	
1.	I was given <i>the opportunity to perform</i> in a <i>prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra</i> which was very rewarding.

If a statement expresses other factors a cross-reference is signposted. For example, the response above also appears in Appendix 5 for mental well-being with different italics.

Cross-references	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">1: music-making and Festival provision (a).	
1.	I was given the opportunity to perform in a prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra <i>which was very rewarding</i> .

All factor-specific keywords/phrases have single valency except:

- ‘Other/individual choirs/universities’ (or similar), which reflect the collective basis of the Festival. They are italicised in *corporate reputation/affiliation* and where appropriate in *music-making/Festival music provision (a)* as an ensemble factor. ‘Workplace choir’, likewise, is italicised in *corporate reputation/affiliation* and *music-making/music provision (c)*.

- ‘Uplifting’ (unqualified), which carries mental and spiritual connotations and is italicised in both appendices.
- Social indicators in Appendices 2 and 7 (Q14) that delineate a phase of music-making which sustains life participation through a co-factor such as friendship (e.g. joining a choir ‘to make **new friends and sing**’). Here, Italicised keywords are cross-referenced to Appendix 3.
- ‘Fun’ and ‘enjoyment’, which carry a social or mental connotation according to context.

APPENDIX 2: Qualitative survey feedback for music-making (skills/achievement)

Table 1. Aim 1. Singers’ music-making (skills/achievement) and Festival participation, positive.
QUESTION 2

<p>Italics in rows 1-42 pair music-making and music provision (a) Festival venue/ensembles.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Music-making denotes singing, performing, attentive hearing/listening, directing, being part of/taking part in/working or interacting in a related activity. • See appendices 5 and 6 for classification Festival esteem characteristics, e.g. ‘amazing and prestigious venue’. • ‘Other/university choirs’ (plural) or similar in the feedback is italicised below as an ensemble factor. It is also understood to reflect the collective basis of the Festival and cross-referenced to Appendix 9, whereas ‘large’ or ‘massive choir’ is not, unless qualified by ‘coming together’ or similar.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-42: Festival music provision (a) – paired factor. • 1-6: mental well-being. • 6: community participation. • 7-8: spiritual well-being. • 34-39: corporate reputation/affiliation.
1. I was given <i>the opportunity to perform</i> in a <i>prestigious venue</i> with a <i>huge symphony orchestra</i> which was very rewarding.
2. It gave me the experience of <i>performing in the Symphony Hall</i> which was a <i>class venue</i> and once in a lifetime experience.
3. <i>Singing in the amazing symphony hall</i> for the first time!
4. The whole experience being able to <i>sing at some amazing venues</i>
5. <i>The performance location: Absolutely stunning.</i> And absolutely delight to <i>perform in the space, both acoustically and with the orchestra.</i>
6. It is often not an experience obtainable for amateur musicians, so I valued the chance to <i>perform in such a place.</i>
7. <i>Singing with 200 others</i> is a tremendous experience.
8. <i>Working with the Philharmonic...</i> gave me a real tingle.
9. <i>Singing in the Birmingham symphony hall with such a huge orchestra!</i>
10. <i>Singing in the Symphony Hall, alongside the Philharmonic Orchestra</i>
11. <i>Singing with the Birmingham Philharmonic Orchestra</i>
12. <i>Performing with the Birmingham symphony orchestra.</i>
13. <i>Singing with a large and well-prepared orchestra</i>
14. <i>Singing with the Orchestra</i>
15. <i>Singing in the symphony hall.</i>
16. Being able to <i>perform in Birmingham Symphony Hall.</i>
17. <i>Performing in the symphony hall.</i>
18. SINGING IN BIRMINGHAM SYMPHONY HALL

19. <i>Singing in the Symphony Hall (different participant from 15)</i>
20. <i>Singing in Birmingham Symphony Hall</i>
21. <i>The opportunity to perform in the Symphony Hall</i>
22. <i>Getting to sing in the Symphony Hall</i>
23. <i>Singing in a great venue</i>
24. <i>The opportunity to sing in Symphony Hall</i>
25. <i>Performing with the Birmingham Philamonic orchestra and the four brass bands.</i>
26. <i>Performing with an orchestra</i>
27. <i>Singing in such a phenomenal setting as the symphony hall.</i>
28. <i>Singing in an amazing venue with a massive orchestra and choir. Where else could you do this.</i>
29. <i>A chance to sing in an amazing and prestigious venue.</i>
30. <i>Singing with a fantastic orchestra</i>
31. <i>Singing with the amazing orchestra & brass bands</i>
32. <i>Being able to sing with a large group of people and be accompanied by the Orchestra and the Brass bands</i>
33. <i>The opportunity to sing with a massed choir and orchestra.</i>
34. <i>Be able to sing amongst other universities and being able to see what they have to offer musically.</i>
35. <i>Singing with orchestra and other choirs</i>
36. <i>Performing with other choirs.</i>
37. <i>Being part of such a large choir when we all came together.</i>
38. <i>Listening to what other choirs had to offer from around the country</i>
39. <i>Working Together with other Choirs</i>
40. <i>Singing in a large group...</i>
41. <i>Part of a massive choir</i>
42. <i>Being able to sing with so many other people.</i>
Italics in rows 43-58 pair music-making with music provision (a) Festival venue/ensembles and (b) Festival repertoire, rehearsal/performance events.
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 43-58: Festival music provision (a) and (b) – paired factors. • 46-48 & 51: social well-being • 47-50: mental well-being. • 47-53: corporate reputation/affiliation • 52: spiritual well-being and community participation.
43. <i>Challenge of performing a major musical work in a major musical venue</i>
44. <i>Be able to perform such a large requiem with a massive orchestra.</i>
45. <i>Doing a large-scale work with so many people</i>
46. <i>Being part of something huge and getting to meet and sing with a big group</i>
47. <i>The Friday afternoon rehearsal with the other choirs was very exciting as we were able to experience other conducting styles as well as take an opportunity to meet new people.</i>
48. <i>The opportunity to be reunited with my choir: having not seen them in four months, it was wonderful to have this event in the location to see and perform with them again.</i>
49. <i>The Afternoon rehearsal session: I thought it was a really lovely idea that worked well in encouraging interaction between the choirs in attendance.</i>
50. <i>I enjoyed performing in front of the other choirs during our individual piece.</i>
51. <i>Admiring the general standards of the individual universities and enjoying meeting with the various groups of singers and discussing their particular ideas, through watching the individual groups in the first half.</i>
52. <i>I was able to feel a sense of belonging – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the huge collective choir from all walks of life. We were all able to contribute to the</i>

<i>Performance and work together as a team. Although, most of the people in the room were strangers from different parts of the country we all seemed united by the music and the goal to perform.</i>
53. A chance to sing a 'big' piece of music, requiring choral and orchestral resources our university on its own does not have.
54. Getting to sing a challenging classical work in an incredible venue
55. Hearing the orchestra during the run through Saturday afternoon
56. Performing the Berlioz in the Symphony Hall with a huge choir and orchestra.
57. Singing a wonderful piece as a large choir.
58. Getting to sing a challenging classical work in an incredible venue
Italics in rows 59-78 pair music-making with music provision (b), Festival repertoire, rehearsal/performance events.
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 59-78: music provision (b) – paired factor. • 59-60: spiritual well-being. • 61-64: mental well-being. • 61: corporate reputation/affiliation.
59. <i>Singing the Berlioz piece.</i> It required great concentration, which in itself was almost like being taken to a special space within myself, almost like a Form of meditation. Very calming and yet enlivening at the same time.
60. <i>Singing such an inspiring and unforgettable work as the Berlioz.</i> Inspired choice made the weekend quite unforgettable.
61. <i>The music:</i> I play the piano and enjoy singing, so <i>being part of and hearing great music is one of the positives of being part of the choir festival</i>
62. It was also great to come away from the weekend feeling a sense of achievement that we had <i>learnt and performed some challenging music.</i>
63. <i>Learning to perform such music is educationally testing, the education offered by the conductor is both fun and exciting.</i>
64. <i>Being part of the Berlioz Requiem</i> was an amazing experience.
65. <i>Singing a great piece</i> that isn't often done.
66. <i>Singing the Berlioz</i>
67. <i>Opportunity to take part in a larger work than normal.</i>
68. <i>The challenge of performing a great work</i>
69. <i>The Berlioz is a wonderful piece of music to sing.</i>
70. <i>Learning & singing Berlioz</i>
71. <i>Singing the Music</i>
72. <i>Singing the Berlioz again after a gap of 25 years</i>
73. <i>Performing a new piece of music</i> for the first time in public
74. Having the <i>opportunity to direct the choir.</i>
75. After that <i>single rehearsal</i> it felt like <i>we all really had each others' measure and that we were working together</i>
76. <i>Taking part in such an overwhelming piece of music.</i>
77. Getting to <i>sing such amazing music.</i>
78. <i>Learning something new</i>
Italics in rows 79-82 highlight skills-related comments.
Cross-reference <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 82: Mental well-being.

79. <i>Seeing student conductors/organist taking an active role in the festival.</i>
80. It helped my <i>sight-reading skills improve</i>
81. <i>Singing</i>
82. The amazing sound <i>we made.</i>

Table 2. Aim 1: Music-making and reasons for joining a choir. QUESTION 14

<p>Italics in rows 1-41 refer to music-making.</p> <p>Music-making denotes singing, performing, attentive hearing/listening, directing, being part of/taking part in/working or interacting in a related activity.</p> <p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-7: mental well-being. • 4-7: social well-being.
1. I do a music degree and I enjoy <i>singing in a choir</i>
2. I like <i>singing</i> and <i>admire the skills of our choir master</i> (name of choir master)
3. I like <i>singing</i> and I particularly like <i>the Berlioz we sang.</i>
4. I enjoy <i>singing</i> with others and it makes me feel more positive after attending a choir rehearsal.
5. <i>Singing</i> with others is a very positive experience
6. I love <i>singing</i> in a group because of the level of cooperation and support of requires. It feels very fulfilling
7. I love <i>performing and listening to choral music</i> , as well as the sense of Community that the choir creates.
<p>Italics in rows 8-41 pair music-making and music provision (c) sustaining life participation. They associate singing or performing in the HEI choir with a starting point/opportunity in time (musical or social), and continued, occasional or recovered involvement in music.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Time/opportunity markers are underlined. <p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-41: music provision (c) sustaining life participation – paired factor. • 9-20 & 23: social well-being - italicised when linked to sustaining participation. • 14-15 & 17-32: mental well-being • 15 & 17: spiritual well-being. • 16-18, 21-26 & 33: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 19, 21-22 & 33-35: community participation.
8. I've <u><i>always sung in choirs</i></u> and <u><i>wanted to do more singing</i></u> in university.
9. To meet <u><i>new people</i></u> and <i>sing</i>
10. To meet <u><i>new people</i></u> who share an interest in <i>singing</i> .
11. I was <i>part of a similar kind of choir</i> <u><i>before I came</i></u> to university and <u><i>wanted to continue</i></u> with <i>choral singing</i> . I also thought it would be a <u><i>good opportunity to be social</i></u> .
12. To <u><i>gain more experience</i></u> in a <i>traditional choir</i> and to create <u><i>new friendships</i></u>
13. To <u><i>gain technical experience</i></u> and <u><i>make friends</i></u> .
14. The choir <u><i>needed another bass</i></u> , and I enjoy <i>singing</i> with others.

15. <i>To sing the kind of music I like to sing <u>with other like-minded singers</u>. <u>To improve my skills by stretching myself with this kind of music and challenge</u>. To have a purpose to my singing when we have specific tasks to perform and to praise God at other times with some of the things we do.</i>
16. There are <i>so <u>many opportunities to sing at various occasions</u></i> , and different venues as part of this choir, the cathedral's festival being one of them. It's a great way to <u>make new friends too</u> .
17. I have been participating in the Festival <i>for <u>several years now</u></i> and it is the musical highlight <i>of <u>my year</u></i> . It gives <i><u>an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music</u></i> which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, <i>to sing</i> is very uplifting.
18. I enjoy <i>singing and performing music <u>in general</u></i> . It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an environment I have always felt accepted and valued. <i><u>Over the years</u></i> many of my friends have been made through singing in the King Alfred Singers.
19. To be able to <i>sing in a choir</i> To connect with people To have a <i><u>new</u></i> hobby To break up the working week
20. An enjoyment <i>of singing, to be part of a group</i>
21. I love singing and <i>while I attended</i> university it was one of the few <i>extra activities</i> I could get involved in. <i>Since leaving</i> university it has been wonderful to be able to keep the singing going and include my husband too.
22. We were <i>invited to take part</i> through my local chorus group and I was delighted to get <i>the <u>opportunity to perform</u></i> such a remarkable work with such a superb generous conductor and an outstanding Orchestra.
23. I've been a member of a few choirs <i>over the years</i> and find <i>singing</i> fun. It's great to have a <i>workplace choir and I feel it's something to be supported</i> as so many other friends don't have one.
24. I have <i><u>always</u></i> loved <i>music and singing</i> so <i>I joined</i> KAS as a positive outlet whilst at Winchester University.
25. I have <i><u>always</u></i> sung in choirs and the chamber choir seemed fun and prestigious
26. Pure and simple, <i>I joined</i> because I enjoy <i>singing</i> and Marjon <i><u>don't do auditions to be a part of them</u></i> .
27. I've <i><u>always</u></i> enjoyed <i>singing</i> but <i>never joined a choir, so I thought it'd be a fun thing to do</i> . And it is!
28. To have <i>the <u>opportunity</u></i> to do something I love, <i>singing</i> .
29. I had a passion <i>for singing</i> and I <i>wanted to <u>expand it</u></i> into our Choir Society
30. I like <i>to sing</i> classical music and it is <i><u>on a good day for me</u></i>
31. Making great music and <i>being able sing at such a high standard</i> and being <i>committed to a choir <u>each week</u></i> , with some amazing <i><u>new opportunities</u></i> able to come my way.
32. I just love <i>to sing</i> . I also <i>wanted <u>to brush up on my sight-singing skills</u></i> .
33. Wanted <i><u>to continue</u></i> choir singing at my undergraduate university and wanted <i><u>to continue</u></i> to be a part after leaving.
34. My wife has been a member for <i>some years</i> , but <i>I joined this time specifically to sing the berlioz</i>
35. <i>I loved singing in a choir at school – it has taken me <u>50 years</u> to get back to regular choral singing</i> . I did not even know it existed until a friend told me, and then I joined <i><u>3 years ago</u></i> , as an alumna.
36. <i>I wanted to <u>sing the Berlioz</u></i>
37. <i><u>Opportunity to sing</u></i> a major work. <i>They were short of tenors</i>
38. I wanted <i>to <u>get back into</u></i> singing in a choir, <i>after <u>not being able to for a while</u></i> .
39. I am a talented choral singer <i>having sung in choirs for <u>most of my life</u></i>
40. <i>To get <u>more experience</u> in singing as an ensemble and choral singing</i> .
41. <i><u>To improve my musical skills</u></i>

Table 3. Aim 1. Music-making (skills/achievement) and Festival participation. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

<p>Italics in all rows refer to music-making feedback. Music-making denotes singing, performing, attentive hearing/listening, directing, being part of/taking part in/working or interacting in a related activity.</p>	
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-3 mental well-being and Festival music provision (b). • 3: community participation. • 4: corporate reputation/affiliation and Festival music provision (a). 	
1.	It was a really wonderful event, a lot of fun and <i>I learned a lot from it</i> . Looking forward to next year!
2.	Our choir director works hard to enable all levels of musical skills are able to access the music <i>we perform</i> . It is a delight when <i>we together sing</i> the more difficult pieces especially.
3.	A marvellous event which encourages a sense of community participation in an area (music) which I love, but would not otherwise have an opportunity <i>to perform in</i> . I also like the opportunity to visit different parts of England within the context of music.
4.	I think it is a wonderful opportunity for the faith universities to get together and for choir members <i>to experience singing</i> in wonderful venues.

Table 4. Aim 1: Festival participation and singers' music-making (skills/achievement), negative. QUESTION 3

<p>Italics in all rows refer to music-making feedback. Music-making denotes singing, performing, attentive hearing/listening, directing, being part of/taking part in/working or interacting in a related activity.</p>	
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-2: physical well-being (voice). • 1 & 4-8: Festival provision (b). • 2-3: Festival provision (a + b) and corporate reputation/affiliation. • 6-7: mental well-being. • 8: social well-being. 	
<p>MUSIC-MAKING AND SCHEDULING/ REHEARSING</p>	
1.	By the end I felt like I was over-rehearsed. Think the rehearsal at 2pm <i>was when I sang my best</i> , by the evening I was exhausted and my voice was strained.
2.	The amount of music was maybe slightly too much, and it was quite straining on the voice, especially with the orchestra. I feel like all the <i>choirs weren't able to really perfect the music</i> in time.
<p>MUSIC-MAKING AND REPERTOIRE</p>	
3.	The music was <i>too challenging for many of the singers</i> meaning the performance was not as good as it should have been, and it was a terrible edition. A better choice would be something simpler with less orchestra, <i>so the less talented choirs have a chance of being able to sing it properly</i> .
4.	It was in Latin and often is. I would much rather sing in a language I understand. Our choir tends to spend <i>most of the academic year working on this piece</i> instead of lots of different pieces and styles through the year.
5.It {The Berlioz} was very long. It was very male dominated as the tenors and basses had the melody a lot of the time meaning the altos very rarely had any melody or parts on their own. <i>I also didn't find it particularly easy to latch on to any of the melodies from the Berlioz</i> .

6.	Also given the original Requiem's <i>lack of alto part, we did not really have much of an active role</i> in the music and often felt neglected in rehearsals and even in the concert.
7.	I did not particularly enjoy <i>singing</i> the Berlioz.
8.	<i>Some singers had clearly not spent enough if any time learning the Berlioz</i> which I found disrespectful and arrogant as it was a difficult piece.

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR MUSIC-MAKING

Music-making responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making responses	82	41	4	8	0
Music-making cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Cross-references					
Social w.b.	4	17	0	1	0
Mental w.b.	15	25	3	2	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	0	2	0
Spiritual w.b.	5	2	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	42	N/A	1	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	20	N/A	3	6	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	16	N/A	0	2	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	34	0	0	0
Corporate	14	10	1	2	0
Community	2	6	1	0	0

APPENDIX 3: qualitative survey feedback for social well-being

Table 1. Aim 1. Festival participation and social well-being: positive. QUESTION 2

<p>Italics in all rows highlight social factors/occasions, e.g. meeting people, making friends, forming bonds, desire to sing in/belong to a group, being reunited, integrating, the after-party or journey and/or having fun in these contexts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enjoyment of meeting/catching up with friends is classified as social. Enjoyment in other contexts, e.g. of singing, is a mental factor. • Where open reference is made to meeting new people from other choirs (or similar) a cross-reference to corporate reputation/affiliation is made. Meeting new people in general is not cross-referenced.
<p>SOCIAL WELL-BEING AND TIMETABLED ACTIVITIES</p> <p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6-7: mental well-being. • 6-8: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 6-8: music-making and Festival music provision (a + b).
1. <i>The after party was great too.</i>
2. <i>The after party!</i>
3. <i>Social time after rehearsals</i>
4. <i>Getting to know people at the after party</i>
5. <i>The after party is always fun</i>
6. The Friday afternoon rehearsal with the other choirs was very exciting as we were able to experience other conducting styles as well as take an <i>opportunity to meet new people</i>
7. The opportunity to be <i>reunited with my choir</i> : having not seen them in four months, it was wonderful to have this event in the location to see and perform with them again
8. Admiring the general standards of the individual universities and <i>enjoying meeting with the various groups of singers</i> and discussing their ideas, through watching the individual groups in the first half.
OTHER
9. It was a <i>nice opportunity to spend more time getting to know the chamber choir</i>
10. <i>Going on 'tour' with friends</i>
11. <i>Getting to know the other people in the choir better</i>
12. <i>Meeting lots of new people</i>
13. <i>Meeting new people</i>
14. <i>Getting to go on a trip and have fun with my friends in choir and being part of a group together.</i>
15. <i>The people I met and the friends I made</i>
16. <i>Meeting new people, feeling part of something</i>
17. <i>It is a weekend of music and friends</i>
18. <i>Having fun journeys</i>
19. <i>The people I went with</i>
20. <i>Meeting people from other countries</i>
21. <i>Meeting up with old friends.</i>
22. <i>Lots of laughs on the journey</i>
23. <i>Talking individually to other members of my own choir who I didn't really know. Some lovely conversations ensued.</i>
24. <i>Getting to bond with my own choir.</i>
25. <i>Bonding with my choir</i>
26. <i>Meeting other people.</i>

27. <i>General friendliness</i> of all concerned
28. The <i>shuttle bus journey</i> back to the hotel on Friday night.
29. <i>The social side of it – spending more time with our choir and meeting new people</i>
30. <i>Good bonding with the choir</i>
31. My second being how <i>lovely and friendly everyone</i> is no matter who you are or where you are from
32. <i>Meeting with other choir members that I've got to know over the years</i>
33. <i>Friendship</i>
34. <i>Making new friends and meeting new people.</i>
35. <i>Spending time with people from the choir and getting to know them better.</i>
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 36-56: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 51 & 55: spiritual well-being. • 53-54 & 56: mental well-being. • 55-57: community participation. • 58: music-making and Festival music provision (a + b)
36. <i>Social aspect spending time with choir.</i> Sitting in parts was good as it meant <i>we spoke to people outside</i> of our own choirs.
37. <i>Friendship with</i> other singers from all over
38. <i>Meeting new people</i> from other choirs
39. <i>Spending time with members of my choir and meeting new people</i> from other choirs
40. <i>Travelling to different universities and having fun journeys.</i>
41. I got to <i>meet new people and talk to other music students</i> from other Universities
42. <i>The social side: Getting to know people within my own choir better and also other choir members, it gives you a sense of belonging</i>
43. <i>The sense of community</i> amongst the choirs.
44. <i>Bonding with</i> other universities.
45. Getting to <i>see people from their university's.</i> My sister sings for Canterbury so <i>I got to hang out with her all weekend!</i>
46. <i>Chance to meet</i> colleagues from other choirs <i>and compare experiences</i>
47. <i>Meeting new people</i> in other choirs.
48. <i>Downtime to socialise</i> with colleagues from my own choir
49. <i>Connecting with</i> colleagues at own university and similar institutions
50. <i>There was a great sense of community</i> amongst the universities.
51. <i>A chance to be part of something with other singers</i> from universities <i>across the UK,</i> combining together to become greater than the sum of our parts.
52. The <i>collaboration</i> of the Universities and their choirs
53. I was able to <i>meet new people</i> from other choirs which was exciting.
54. <i>The reunion</i> of members of other university choirs is very fulfilling.
55. Experiencing the wonderful migration of similarly minded people from the various universities, and <i>enjoying the general comradeship</i> from the different corners of the country.
56. Also I am an alumni so I <i>enjoyed catching up with members of the university choir who I had not seen for a while.</i> I have fond memories of making music at the university so it is nice for me to come back for choir fest as almost a celebration of the happiness music brought me at university
57. <i>Bonding with</i> all age groups to a common end
58. Being part of something huge and <i>getting to meet</i> and sing with a big group

Table 2. Aim 1. Social well-being and reasons for joining a university choir. QUESTION 14

<p>Italics in all rows highlight social factors/occasions, e.g. meeting people, making friends, forming bonds, desire to work/be in a group, being reunited, integrating, the after-party or journey and/or having fun in these contexts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Joining an HEI choir to 'sing with others' is understood to be social. Statements referring to 'musical interaction' or similar are understood to express music-making.
1. <i>Meeting like-minded people</i>
2. <i>They were like a family to me.</i>
3. To supplement a small but <i>loyal student membership</i>
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4-11: music-making. 4-11: music provision (c) sustaining life participation. 6: corporate reputation/affiliation. 10-11: mental well-being. 11: spiritual well-being and community participation.
4. To gain more experience in a traditional choir and to <i>create new friendships.</i>
5. I was part of a similar kind of choir before I came to university and wanted to continue with choral singing, I also thought it would be a good opportunity <i>to be social.</i>
6. There are so many opportunities to sing at various occasions, and different venues as part of this choir, the cathedral's festival being one of them. <i>It's a great way to make new friends too.</i>
7. To gain technical experience and <i>make friends.</i>
8. <i>To meet new people</i> and sing
9. <i>To meet new people</i> who share an interest in singing.
10. The choir needed another bass, and I enjoy singing <i>with others.</i>
<p>11. To sing the kind of music I like to sing <i>with other like-minded singers.</i></p> <p>To improve my skills by stretching myself with this kind of music and challenge.</p> <p>To have a purpose to my singing when we have specific tasks to perform and to praise God at other times with some of the things we do.</p>
<p>Cross references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 12-22: mental well-being. 12-15 and 23-24: corporate reputation/affiliation 12-17 & 24: music provision (c) sustaining life participation. 13-21: music-making. 14: spiritual well-being.
12. Love of music and choral music. I enjoy <i>the social aspects of a choir</i> and within the university context it enables staff and students to mix across the institution. And this choir is one of the highlights of my time there.
13. I've been a member of a few choirs over the years and find singing fun. It's great to have a workplace choir and <i>I feel it's something to be supported as so many other friends don't have one.</i>
14. I have been participating in the Festival for several years now and it is the musical highlight of my year. It gives an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music which you don't get with small choirs and <i>joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming,</i> to sing is very uplifting.
15. I enjoy singing and performing music in general. It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding <i>family to be a part of.</i> Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an

environment I have always felt accepted and valued. Over the years <i>many of my friends have been made</i> through singing in the King Alfred Singers.
16. To be able to sing in a choir <i>To connect with people</i> To have a new hobby To break up the working week
17. An enjoyment of singing, <i>to be part of a group</i>
18. I enjoy singing <i>with others</i> and it makes me feel more positive after attending a choir rehearsal.
19. I love singing <i>in a group</i> because of the <i>level of cooperation and support</i> of requires. It feels very fulfilling.
20. Singing <i>with others</i> is a very positive experience
21. I love performing and listening to choral music, as well as <i>the sense of Community</i> that the choir creates.
22. I love the fact that we are a student lead choir and that <i>we have a lot of say in what we want to see</i>
23. Excellent reputation and <i>welcoming family like group of people</i>
24. I work part-time after normal office hours, so the choir is my chance to <i>integrate more fully</i> with the University & <i>meet like-minded folk</i> .

Table 3. Aim 1: Social well-being and Festival participation, free remarks, negative. QUESTION 56.

Italics in all rows highlight social factors/occasions which mitigate against meeting people, making friends, forming bonds, desire to work/be in a group, integrating, being reunited, having fun in these contexts.
Cross-reference
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Music provision (b) Festival repertoire, rehearsal/performance events.
1. <i>Director was patronising</i> and not very good. Student conductors were not very good. The Friday afternoon was a waste of time, particularly the vocal distraction sections.

Table 3. Aim 1: Social well-being and Festival participation, negative. QUESTION 3

SOCIAL WELL-BEING AND SCHEDULING
Italics in all rows highlight social factors/occasions which mitigate against meeting people, making friends, forming bonds, desire to work/be in a group, integrating, being reunited, having fun in these contexts.
Cross references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3: music-making. • 3-5: music provision (b). • 5-7: corporate reputation/affiliation.
1. <i>Difficult to socialise or have time to talk to others</i>
2. <i>Over socialising!</i>
3. Some singers had clearly not spent enough if any time learning the Berlioz <i>which I found disrespectful and arrogant</i> as it was a difficult piece.
4. Having a very balanced and smooth beginning of the concert, but then the last group performing twice. This appeared to be <i>rather insensitive and rude, and changed the dynamic</i> of the gathering.
5. Rehearsal schedule overly packed. <i>Very limited time for socialising</i> with colleagues either from my own choir or others

6.the weekend flew by and <i>we didn't really get to integrate</i> with other universities <i>as much as I would have liked</i>
7. <i>Minimal interaction</i> between choirs.
8. <i>The after-party</i> needed some kind of entertainment.
9. <i>The after party</i> wasn't great.

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR SOCIAL WELL-BEING

Social well-being responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Social w.b. responses	58	24	0	9	1

Social well-being cross references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Cross-references					
Music-making	4	17	0	1	0
Mental w.b.	5	13	0	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	0	0	0
Spiritual w.b.	2	2	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	0	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	0	N/A	0	3	1
Festival music Provision (a + b)	4	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	15	0	0	0
Corporate	24	7	0	3	0
Community	3	1	0	0	0

APPENDIX 4: qualitative survey feedback for physical well-being

Table 1. Aim 1. Physical well-being and Festival participation, positive. QUESTION 2

Italics highlight sufficiency of recuperation
Cross-reference
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Festival music provision (b).
1. The balance between <i>rehearsals and breaks</i> .

Table 2. Aim 1. Physical well-being and reasons for joining a choir. QUESTION 14

N/A

Table 3. Aim 1. Physical well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight physical effects
Cross-references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: mental well-being.
1. Wonderful challenging and <i>energising experience</i>

Table 4. Aim 1. Physical well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, mixed/neutral. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight physical effects
Cross references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: Festival music provision (b) and corporate reputation/affiliation.
1. I think it would be more musically satisfying for the choirs involved if the massed choir piece was overall more simple to piece together i.e Haydn/Mozart symphony? It would make the short rehearsal time more achievable and <i>lead to less fatigue</i> and negativity towards actually doing the concert.

Table 5. Aim 1. Physical well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, negative. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight lack of recuperation (short breaks).
Cross-references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-3: music provision (b) Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events.
1. <i>Too long</i> rehearsals and <i>breaks not long enough</i> . Too early starts.
2. Going straight into a three hour rehearsal on Friday with a <i>limited break</i> .
3. <i>Not having enough breaks</i> in between singing rehearsals.

Table 6. Aim 1. Physical well-being and Festival participation, negative. QUESTION 3

Italics in all rows highlight physical effects
Cross-references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-7: music provision (b), Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events. • 2-4: mental well-being. • 7-8: music-making. • 8: music provision (a + b) and corporate reputation/affiliation.
PHYSICAL WELL-BEING AND SCHEDULING

1. This year was very full. <i>I felt tired and overworked.</i>
2. I think spending the entire Friday in rehearsal was <i>far too draining</i> , to then get up super early on the day of the performance with a voice that had been <i>knackered by the day before</i> wasn't fun.
3. The rehearsals were far too long and it was <i>impossible to maintain focus</i> for the length of time. We were made to work without any breaks. The conducting was also very frustrating and fickle.
PHYSICAL WELL-BEING AND PROGRAMME
4. The length of the concert - the Berlioz was so vast, <i>it was exhausting</i> - The prospect of which made the concert itself less enjoyable
5. I was <i>very tired</i> by the time the Berlioz ended!
6. The <i>only negative was the physical tiredness</i> , from holding the music and standing up so long!
7. By the end I.....felt like I was over-rehearsed. Think the rehearsal at 2pm was when I sang my best, <i>by the evening I was exhausted and my voice was strained.</i>
8. The amount of music was maybe slightly too much, and it was <i>quite straining on the voice</i> , especially with the orchestra. I feel like all the choirs weren't able to really perfect the music in time.
OTHER
Cross-reference
• 13: Corporate affiliation/reputation.
9. <i>I wasn't fully well so it was more of a struggle than usual</i>
10. <i>Very tiring....</i>
11. <i>By the end I was drained..... by the evening I was exhausted.</i>
12. <i>Healthier food</i> at these events is needed.
13. <i>It was very Tiring!</i> I've been part of the festival for 3 years and <i>I was knackered after this one.</i>
14. A large number of people with <i>coughs and colds.</i>

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR PHYSICAL WELL-BEING

Physical well-being responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Physical well-being responses	1	0	1 + 1	14	3

Physical well-being cross references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Cross-references					
Music-making	0	0	0	2	0
Mental w.b.	0	0	1	3	0
Spiritual w.b.	0	0	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	0	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	1	N/A	1	7	3

Festival music Provision (a + b)	0	N/A	0	1	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	0	0	0	0
Corporate	0	0	21	2	0
Community	0	0	0	0	0

APPENDIX 5: qualitative survey feedback for mental well-being

Table 1. Aim 1. Mental well-being and Festival participation, positive. QUESTION 2

<p>Italics in all rows highlight keywords associated with positive mood/feeling/experience, e.g. liking, enjoyment (see below) music-making fun, excitement, pride, a sense of fulfilment including reaching a milestone.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enjoyment of meeting/catching up with friends is classified as social. Enjoyment in other contexts, e.g. of singing, is a mental factor. • Liking/enjoyment etc. below is confined to the Festival and excludes liking of music in general which is captured in Question 14. • In addition to the statements below, an indirect relationship between mental well-being and esteem characteristics of the event can sometimes be inferred from Festival provision feedback (see Appendix 7, Table 1). In these cases, epithets such as 'the amazing symphony hall' are understood to describe an object or context. They differ from phrases like '<i>experiencing</i> the orchestra' or '<i>the amazing sound</i> we made' which privilege involvement/inner response.
MENTAL WELL-BEING AND MUSIC-MAKING
<p>Cross-references.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-5 music-making and Festival provision (a). • 6: music-making 'other'. • 7-10: music-making Festival provision (a) and (b). • 7-8: social well-being. • 7-10 & 14: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 11-14: music-making and Festival provision (b).
1. I was given the opportunity to perform in a prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra..... which was <i>very rewarding</i> .
2. It gave me the experience of performing in the Symphony Hall which was a class venue and <i>once in a lifetime experience</i> .
3. <i>The whole experience</i> (associated with <i>positivity</i> in the question) being able to sing at some amazing venues.
4. Singing in the amazing symphony hall <i>for the first time!</i>
5. The performance location: Absolutely stunning. And <i>absolutely delight</i> to perform in the space, both acoustically and with the orchestra.
6. <i>The amazing sound</i> we made.
7. The opportunity to be reunited with my choir: having not seen them in four months, <i>it was wonderful</i> to have this event in the location to see and perform with them again.
8. The Friday afternoon rehearsal with the other choirs was <i>very exciting</i> as we were able to experience other conducting styles as well as take an opportunity to meet new people.
9. The Afternoon rehearsal session: I thought it was a <i>really lovely idea</i> that worked well in encouraging interaction between the choirs in attendance.
10. <i>I enjoyed</i> performing in front of the other choirs during our individual piece.
11. Being part of the Berlioz Requiem was an <i>amazing experience</i> .

12. It was also <i>great to come away from the weekend feeling a sense of achievement</i> that we had learnt and performed some challenging music.
13. Learning to perform such music is educationally testing, the education offered by the conductor is <i>both fun and exciting</i> .
14. The music: I play the piano and enjoy singing, so being part of and hearing great music <i>is one of the positives</i> of being part of the choir festival
OTHER
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15-16: Festival music provision (b). • 17-18: Festival music provision (a) • 19-21: social well-being. • 19-21: corporate affiliation/reputation. • 21-22: community participation. • 22: music-making and Festival music provision (a)
15. The afternoon rehearsal session: The variety of contributions were <i>entertaining, enjoyable</i> , and helpful for Sunday's service.
16. The piece was challenging and the performance <i>was rewarding</i>
17. <i>What a privilege</i> to appear in Symphony Hall.
18. <i>Experiencing</i> the orchestra.
19. I was able to meet new people from other choirs <i>which was exciting</i> .
20. The reunion of members of other university choirs is <i>very fulfilling</i> .
21. Also I am an alumni so I enjoyed catching up with members of the university choir who I had not seen for a while. I have fond memories of making music at the university so it is nice for me to come back for choir fest as almost a <i>celebration of the happiness music brought me at university</i> .
22. <i>It is often not an experience obtainable</i> for amateur musicians, so <i>I valued the chance</i> to perform in such a place.
23. Doing something <i>memorable</i> .
24. <i>The experience</i> (associated with <i>positivity</i> from the survey question)

Table 2. Aim 1. Mental well-being and reasons for joining a university choir. QUESTION 14

Italics in all rows highlight keywords associated with positive mood/feeling/experience, e.g. e.g. liking, enjoyment (see below) music-making fun, excitement, pride, a sense of fulfilment including reaching a milestone.
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6-11 & 16-17: music-making. • 9-12, 15-17: social well-being. • 13-15: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 9 & 13-16: music provision (c) sustaining life participation • 13 & 15: community participation.
1. I <i>enjoyed the music</i> they sang
2. I <i>was bored</i> (positive connotation from reverse negative)
3. I heard them & <i>saw their happiness last year</i> & thought I'd like join
4. <i>Enjoyment</i> .
5. <i>Exciting music on 'home' territory</i> .
6. I do a music degree and <i>I enjoy</i> singing in a choir
7. <i>I like</i> singing and admire the skills of our choir master (name of choir master)
8. <i>I like singing</i> and <i>I particularly like</i> the Berlioz we sang.
9. <i>An enjoyment</i> of singing, to be part of a group

10. <i>I love singing in a group because of the level of cooperation and support of requires. It feels very fulfilling</i>
11. Singing with others is a <i>very positive experience</i>
12. <i>I love the fact</i> that we are a student lead choir and that we have a lot of say in what we want to see.
13. The Chamber Choir at Christ Church is the flagship ensemble of the university so joining the choir is really something to aim for as it only takes a small number of students. This year I came to the Choir Festival as an alumnus, so <i>it was lovely to be back</i>
14. I joined the choir in this festival because I had done 5 previous Festivals and they <i>were so much fun</i> that I wanted to be a part of the festival again. I plan to be a part of every festival for as long as they continue to go on for.
15. <i>Love of music and choral music.</i> I enjoy the social aspects of a choir and within the university context it enables staff and students to mix across the institution. <i>And this choir is one of the highlights of my time there.</i>
16. The choir needed another bass, and <i>I enjoy singing with others.</i>
17. <i>I love performing and listening to choral music, as well as the sense of Community that the choir creates.</i>
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18-34: music-making. • 18-32 & 34-35: music provision (c) sustaining life participation. • 19, 22-28 & 35: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 24-26 & 31-33: to social well-being. • 24 & 32: spiritual well-being. • 27-28 & 31: community participation.
18. To have the opportunity to do <i>something I love, singing.</i>
19. Pure and simple, I joined because <i>I enjoy singing</i> and Marjon don't do auditions to be a part of them.
20. I had <i>a passion</i> for singing and I wanted to expand it into our Choir Society
21. <i>Making great music</i> and being able sing at such a high standard and being committed to a choir each week, with some amazing new opportunities able to come my way.
22. I have always sung in choirs and the chamber choir <i>seemed fun</i> and prestigious
23. I have <i>always loved</i> music and singing so I joined KAS as a <i>positive outlet</i> whilst at Winchester University.
24. I have been participating in the Festival for several years now and it is the <i>musical highlight</i> of my year. It gives an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, to sing is <i>very uplifting.</i>
25. I <i>enjoy</i> singing and performing music in general. <i>It brings me great happiness</i> and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals <i>boosts my self-esteem</i> as it is an environment I have always felt <i>accepted and valued.</i> Over the years many of my friends have been made through singing in the King Alfred Singers.
26. I've been a member of a few choirs over the years and find singing <i>fun.</i> <i>It's great</i> to have a workplace choir and I feel it's something to be supported as so many other friends don't have one.
27. <i>I love singing</i> and while I attended university it was one of the few extra activities I could get involved in. Since leaving university it <i>has been wonderful</i> to be able to keep the singing going and include my husband too.
28. We were invited to take part through my local chorus group and <i>I was delighted</i> to get the opportunity to perform such a remarkable work with such a superb generous conductor and an outstanding Orchestra.
29. I've <i>always enjoyed</i> singing but never joined a choir, so I thought it'd be a <i>fun</i> thing to do. <i>And it is!</i>
30. <i>I like</i> to sing classical music and it is on a <i>good day for me</i>
31. To be able to sing in a choir To connect with people

<i>To have a new hobby</i> <i>To break up</i> the working week
32. To sing the kind of music <i>I like</i> to sing with other like-minded singers. To improve my skills by stretching myself with this kind of music and challenge. To have a purpose to my singing when we have specific tasks to perform and to praise God at other times with some of the things we do.
33. I <i>enjoy</i> singing with others and it makes me <i>feel more positive</i> after attending a choir rehearsal.
34. I <i>just love</i> to sing. I also wanted to brush up on my sight-singing skills.
35. I was part of king Alfred singers and then we were all invited to come. <i>And having had a good experience</i> last year I wanted to go again

Table 3. Aim 1. Mental well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

Italics in all rows highlight keywords associated with positive mood/feeling/experience, e.g. liking, enjoyment (see below) music-making fun, excitement, pride, a sense of fulfilment including reaching a milestone.
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3: spiritual well-being and corporate reputation/affiliation. • 4: physical well-being. • 5-7: Festival music provision (b). • 5-7: music-making. • 7: community participation.
1. <i>A wonderful experience</i>
2. <i>Brilliant weekend. Very well done</i>
3. <i>A thoroughly enjoyable and uplifting experience. Look forward</i> to Liverpool next year.
4. <i>Wonderful challenging and energising experience</i>
5. It was a really wonderful event, <i>a lot of fun</i> and I learned a lot from it. <i>Looking forward to next year!</i>
6. Our choir director works hard to enable all levels of musical skills are able to access the music we perform. <i>It is a delight</i> when we together sing the more difficult pieces especially.
7. A marvellous event which encourages a sense of community participation in an area (music) <i>which I love, but would not otherwise have an opportunity</i> to perform in. <i>I also like the opportunity to visit different parts of England within the context of music.</i>

Table 4. Aim 1: Festival participation and mental well-being, negative. QUESTION 3

Italics in all rows highlight factors or experiences that mitigate against liking, enjoyment (see below) music-making fun, excitement, pride, a sense of fulfilment including reaching a milestone.
MENTAL WELL-BEING AND SCHEDULING
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-5: Festival provision (b). • 1-3: physical well-being. • 4-5: music-making. • 6: corporate reputation/affiliation.
1. The rehearsals were far too long and it was impossible to maintain focus for the length of time. We were made to work without any breaks. The conducting was also very <i>frustrating and fickle</i> .
2. I think spending the entire Friday in rehearsal was far too draining, to then get up super early on the day of the performance with a voice that had been knackered by the day before <i>wasn't fun</i> .
MENTAL WELL-BEING AND PROGRAMME

3. The length of the concert - the Berlioz was so vast, it was exhausting - the prospect of which made the concert itself <i>less enjoyable</i>
4. I did <i>not particularly enjoy</i> singing the Berlioz.
MENTAL WELL-BEING AND PROGRAMME/INCLUSION
5. Also given the original Requiem's lack of alto part, we did not really have music of an active role in the music and often <i>felt neglected</i> in rehearsals and even in the concert.
6. A negative would be that as we are a sole student choir being student lead it often seems that <i>we are looked down upon by larger fellow choirs.</i>

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR MENTAL WELL-BEING

Mental well-being responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Mental well-being responses	24	35	7	6	0

Mental well-being cross references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	15	25	3	2	0
Social w.b.	5	13	0	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	1	3	0
Spiritual w.b.	0	2	1	0	0
Festival Music Provision (a)	8	N/A	0	0	0
Festival Music Provision (b)	6	N/A	3	5	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	4	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	22	0	0	0
Corporate	8	11	1	0	0
Community	1	5	1	0	0

APPENDIX 6: qualitative survey feedback for spiritual well-being

Table 1. Aim 1. Spiritual well-being and Festival participation, positive. QUESTION 2.

In addition to the statements below, an indirect relationship between spiritual well-being and esteem characteristics of the event can sometimes be inferred from Festival provision feedback (see Appendix 7, Table 1). In these cases, epithets such as 'to sing in a <i>phenomenal setting</i> ' are understood to describe a resource or context. They differ from phrases like 'It was <i>thrilling to have</i> such a large orchestra' which are understood to reflect quality of feeling.
Italics highlight keywords associated with inspiration, thrill, inner wonder, the ineffable, quality of religious experience.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-2: music-making and Festival music provision (b). • 3: Festival music provision (b). • 4: music-making and Festival music provision (a) and (b); • 4-6: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 4-5 & 7: community participation. • 5-6: social well-being. • 8-9: music-making and Festival music provision (a). • 10: Festival music provision (a).
1. Singing the Berlioz piece. It required <i>great concentration</i> , which in itself was almost <i>like being taken to a special space within myself</i> , almost like a <i>Form of meditation</i> . <i>Very calming and yet enlivening at the same time</i> .
2. Singing such an inspiring and unforgettable work as the Berlioz. <i>Inspired choice made the weekend quite unforgettable</i> .
3. The last note of the Berlioz when the conductor (name of conductor) <i>smiled at us all!</i>
4. <i>I was able to feel a sense of belonging</i> – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the huge collective choir from all walks of life. We were all able to contribute to the Performance and work together as a team. <i>Although, most of the people in the room were strangers from different parts of the country we all seemed united</i> by the music and the goal to perform.
5. <i>Experiencing the wonderful migration</i> of similarly minded people from the various universities, and enjoying the general comradeship from the different corners of the country.
6. A chance to be part of something with other singers from universities across the UK, <i>combining together to become greater than the sum of our parts</i> .
7. Exploring the city library, <i>which I found beautiful, exciting, and even moving</i> - a fabulous building which made me think that the "powers that be" DO believe in community services after all, and think it's worth investing large amounts of money in it....
8. Working with the Philharmonic... <i>gave me a real tingle</i>
9. Singing with 200 others <i>is a tremendous experience</i> .
10. <i>It was thrilling</i> to have such a large and orchestra.
11. It was very <i>spiritually uplifting!</i>
12. <i>The religious side: Coming together for the service on the Sunday, it is great to see a Chapel so full of people praising God.</i>
13. The <i>Sunday service</i> which for once was really good.
14. <i>It was a pleasure to be part of the conductor's life ambition. Truly an honour, knowing how much it meant to him.</i>

Table 2. Aim 1. Spiritual well-being and reasons for joining a university choir. QUESTION 14

Italics highlight a spiritual response. Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-2: music-making, social well-being, mental well-being and music provision (c) sustaining life participation. • 2: corporate reputation/affiliation. 	
1.	To sing the kind of music I like to sing with other like-minded singers. To improve my skills by stretching myself with this kind of music and challenge. <i>To have a purpose to my singing when we have specific tasks to perform and to praise God at other times with some of the things we do.</i>
2.	I have been participating in the Festival for several years now and it is the musical highlight of my year. It gives an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, to sing <i>is very uplifting.</i>

Table 3. Aim 1. Spiritual well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight spiritual feedback Cross-reference. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2: mental well-being and corporate reputation/affiliation. 	
1.	<i>Deus vult</i>
2.	A thoroughly enjoyable and <i>uplifting experience.</i> <i>Look forward</i> to Liverpool next year.

Table 4. Aim 1. Spiritual well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, neutral. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight a faith-based question	
1.	How do we engage with students who may be <i>Muslim or from a non Christian background?</i>

Table 5. Aim 1: Spiritual well-being and Festival participation. Free remarks, negative. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight a spiritual judgement	
1.	<i>It would have been great to hear the gospel on the Sunday morning!</i> I was really hoping that with such a big group of Students who do not know the truth in front of you would prompt you to tell the best story in The world! Unfortunately my choir kind of took the mic of being a 'work of art' even though that is what they are! I understand the sentiment behind it but do better! <i>I want my choir to know and understand Jesus like I do and you have such an opportunity to teach them.</i>

Table 6. Aim 1: Spiritual well-being and Festival participation, negative. QUESTION 3

N/A

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR SPIRITUAL WELL-BEING

Spiritual well-being responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Spiritual well-being responses	14	2	2 + 1	0	1

Spiritual well-being cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	5	2	0	0	0
Social w.b.	2	2	0	0	0
Mental w.b.	0	2	1	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	3	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	3	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	1	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	2	0	0	0
Corporate	3	1	1	0	0
Community	3	0	0	0	0

APPENDIX 7: qualitative survey feedback on music provision

Table 1. Aim 2. Music provision: Festival venues and ensembles (a) and Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events (b), positive. QUESTION 2

Italics in rows 1-61 highlight remarks about venue and ensembles/orchestra (a)	
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-42: music-making/skills – paired factor, italicised. • 1-6: mental well-being. • 6: community participation. • 7-8: spiritual well-being. • 34-39: corporate reputation/affiliation. 	
1.	I was given <i>the opportunity to perform</i> in a prestigious venue with a <i>huge symphony orchestra</i> which was very rewarding.
2.	It gave me the experience of <i>performing in the Symphony Hall</i> which was a <i>class venue</i> and once in a lifetime experience.
3.	<i>Singing in the amazing symphony hall</i> for the first time!
4.	The whole experience being able to <i>sing at some amazing venues</i>
5.	<i>The performance location:</i> Absolutely stunning. And absolutely delight to <i>perform in the space, both acoustically and with the orchestra.</i>
6.	It is often not an experience obtainable for amateur musicians, so I valued the chance to <i>perform in such a place.</i>
7.	<i>Singing with 200 others</i> is a tremendous experience.
8.	<i>Working with the Philharmonic...</i> gave me a real tingle.
9.	<i>Singing in the Birmingham symphony hall with such a huge orchestra!</i>
10.	<i>Singing in the Symphony Hall, alongside the Philharmonic Orchestra</i>
11.	<i>Singing with the Birmingham Philharmonic Orchestra</i>
12.	<i>Performing with the Birmingham symphony orchestra.</i>
13.	<i>Singing with a large and well-prepared orchestra</i>
14.	<i>Singing with the Orchestra</i>
15.	<i>Singing in the symphony hall</i>
16.	Being able to <i>perform in Birmingham Symphony Hall.</i>
17.	<i>Performing in the symphony hall.</i>
18.	<i>SINGING IN BIRMINGHAM SYMPHONYHALL</i>
19.	<i>Singing in the Symphony Hall</i> (different participant from 13)
20.	<i>Singing in Birmingham Symphony Hall</i>
21.	The opportunity to <i>perform in the Symphony Hall</i>
22.	Getting to <i>sing in the Symphony Hall</i>
23.	<i>Singing in a great venue</i>
24.	The opportunity to <i>sing in Symphony Hall</i>
25.	<i>Performing with the Birmingham Philamonic orchestra and the four brass bands.</i>
26.	<i>Performing with an orchestra</i>
27.	<i>Singing in such a phenomenal setting as the symphony hall.</i>
28.	<i>Singing in an amazing venue with a massive orchestra and choir.</i> Where else could you do this.
29.	A chance to <i>sing in an amazing and prestigious venue.</i>
30.	<i>Singing with a fantastic orchestra</i>
31.	<i>Singing with the amazing orchestra & brass bands</i>
32.	<i>Being able to sing with a large group of people and be accompanied by the Orchestra and the Brass bands</i>
33.	The opportunity to <i>sing with a massed choir and orchestra.</i>

34. <i>Be able to sing amongst other universities and being able to see what they have to offer musically.</i>
35. <i>Singing with orchestra and other choirs</i>
36. <i>Performing with other choirs.</i>
37. <i>Being part of such a large choir when we all came together.</i>
38. <i>Listening to what other choirs had to offer from around the country</i>
39. <i>Working Together with other Choirs</i>
40. <i>Singing in a large group...</i>
41. <i>Part of a massive choir</i>
42. <i>Being able to sing with so many other people.</i>
General appreciation of the venue and ensembles/orchestra
Cross references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 43-44: mental well-being. • 45: spiritual well-being.
43. <i>What a privilege to appear in Symphony Hall</i>
44. <i>Experiencing the orchestra</i>
45. <i>It was thrilling to have such a large and orchestra.</i>
46. <i>Superb venue</i>
47. <i>Venue</i>
48. <i>Having a great orchestra</i>
49. <i>The first time we heard the brass bands in the rehearsal.</i>
50. <i>The orchestra was good</i>
51. <i>The venue</i>
52. <i>Symphony Hall was great</i>
53. <i>Symphony Hall is a magnificent venue</i>
54. <i>The gorgeous venue</i>
55. <i>The orchestra were absolutely superlative.</i>
56. <i>The amazing musicians in the fabulous venue</i>
57. <i>Being in such a large group of basses</i>
58. <i>Performance space was beautiful.</i>
59. <i>The fantastic symphony hall</i>
60. <i>The symphony hall was a lovely venue this year</i>
61. <i>Quality orchestra</i>
Italics in rows 62-80 highlight remarks about venue/ensembles (a) <u>and</u> repertoire and rehearsal/performance events (b).
Cross-references
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 65-80: music-making – paired factor, italicised. • 69-72: mental well-being. • 68-69 & 72-73: social well-being. • 69-75: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 74: spiritual well-being, community participation.
62. <i>The concert and venue were both excellent.</i>
63. <i>The massed piece with all the orchestra!</i>
64. <i>The performance and rehearsal with the orchestra</i>
65. <i>Getting to sing a challenging classical work in an incredible venue</i>
66. <i>Challenge of performing a major musical work in a major musical venue</i>
67. <i>Be able to perform such a large requiem with a massive orchestra.</i>
68. <i>Being part of something huge and getting to meet and sing with a big group</i>
69. <i>The Friday afternoon rehearsal with the other choirs was very exciting as we were able to experience other conducting styles as well as take an opportunity to meet new people</i>
70. <i>I enjoyed performing in front of the other choirs during our individual piece.</i>

71. <i>The Afternoon rehearsal session: I thought it was a really lovely idea that worked well in encouraging interaction between the choirs in attendance.</i>
72. The opportunity to be reunited with my choir: having not seen them in four months, it was wonderful to have <i>this event in the location to see and perform with them again.</i>
73. <i>Admiring the general standards</i> of the individual universities and enjoying meeting with the various groups of singers and <i>discussing their particular ideas, through watching individual groups in the first half.</i>
74. I was able to feel a sense of belonging – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the <i>huge collective choir</i> from all walks of life. <i>We were all able to contribute to the Performance and work together as a team.</i> Although, most of the people in the room were strangers from different parts of the country we all seemed united <i>by the music and the goal to perform.</i>
75. A chance to <i>sing a 'big' piece of music</i> , requiring <i>choral and orchestral resources</i> our university on its own does not have.
76. Getting to <i>sing a challenging classical work</i> in an <i>incredible venue</i>
77. <i>Hearing the orchestra</i> during the <i>run through Saturday afternoon</i>
78. <i>Performing the Berlioz</i> in the <i>Symphony Hall with a huge choir and orchestra.</i>
79. <i>Singing a wonderful piece as a large choir.</i>
80. <i>Doing a large-scale work with so many people</i>
Italics in rows 81-100 highlight remarks about rehearsal/performance characteristics (b).
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 81-100: music-making – paired factor, italicised. • 81-82: spiritual well-being. • 83-86: mental well-being. • 83: corporate reputation/affiliation.
81. <i>Singing the Berlioz piece.</i> It required great concentration, which in itself was almost like being taken to a special space within myself, almost like a Form of meditation. Very calming and yet enlivening at the same time.
82. <i>Singing such an inspiring and unforgettable work as the Berlioz.</i> Inspired choice made the weekend quite unforgettable.
83. <i>The music:</i> I play the piano and enjoy singing, so <i>being part of and hearing great music is one of the positives of being part of the choir festival</i>
84. It was also great to come away from the weekend feeling a sense of achievement that we had <i>learnt and performed some challenging music.</i>
85. <i>Learning to perform such music is educationally testing,</i> the education <i>offered by the conductor</i> is both fun and exciting.
86. <i>Being part of the Berlioz Requiem</i> was an amazing experience.
87. <i>The Berlioz is a wonderful piece of music to sing.</i>
88. <i>Singing a great piece that isn't often done.</i>
89. <i>Singing the Berlioz</i>
90. <i>Opportunity to take part in a larger work than normal.</i>
91. <i>The challenge of performing a great work</i>
92. <i>Learning & singing Berlioz</i>
93. <i>Singing the Music</i>
94. <i>Singing the Berlioz again</i> after a gap of 25 years
95. <i>Performing a new piece of music</i> for the first time in public
96. Having the <i>opportunity to direct the choir.</i>
97. After that <i>single rehearsal</i> it felt like <i>we all really had each others' measure and that we were working together</i>
98. <i>Taking part in such an overwhelming piece of music.</i>

99. <i>Learning something new.</i>
100. <i>Getting to sing such amazing music</i>
General appreciation of repertoire and rehearsal/performance experiences. Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 101-102: mental well-being. • 103: spiritual well-being. • 104: physical well-being.
101. <i>The piece was challenging and the performance was rewarding</i>
102. <i>The afternoon rehearsal session. The variety of contributions were entertaining, enjoyable and helpful for Sunday's service.</i>
103. <i>The last note of the Berlioz when the conductor (name of conductor) smiled at us all!</i>
104. <i>The balance between rehearsals and breaks.</i>
105. <i>Seeing student conductors/organist taking an active role in the festival.</i>
106. <i>The orchestra and choir rehearsal!</i>
107. <i>Friday afternoon session</i>
108. <i>The performance itself</i>
109. <i>The concert on the Saturday evening</i>
110. <i>The music</i>
111. <i>Music chosen</i>
112. <i>Choice of music</i>
113. <i>Superb musical direction</i>
114. <i>The amazing music</i>
115. <i>Rehearsals were really well managed, and very efficient – often finishing early.</i>
116. <i>The conductor! (x2)</i>

Table 2. Aim 2. Music provision (a) Festival resources/venue and (b) Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

Italics in row 1 highlights feedback about Festival provision (a), and rows 2-7 Festival provision (b).
Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 1-4 music-making. • 2-4: mental well-being. • 4-5: community participation.
1. I think it is a <i>wonderful opportunity</i> for the faith universities to get together and for choir members to experience singing <i>in wonderful venues</i> .
2. <i>Our choir director works hard to enable all levels of musical skills</i> are able to access the music we perform. It is a delight when we together sing the more difficult pieces especially.
3. <i>It was a really wonderful event</i> , a lot of fun and I learned a lot from it. Looking forward to next year!
4. A <i>marvellous event</i> which encourages a sense of community participation in an area (music) which I love, but would not otherwise have an opportunity to perform in. I also like the opportunity to visit different parts of England within the context of music.
5. A <i>fabulous event</i> which bonds the generations and communities.
6. <i>The conductor (name of conductor) deserves an award. A calm, collected, helpful, positive conductor!</i>
7. It is an <i>amazing opportunity to be part of something bigger and challenging than normal</i> .

Table 3. Aim 2. Music provision (b) Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events. Free remarks, neutral/mixed. QUESTION 56

Italics highlight positive feedback about the Festival Cross-references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: Physical well-being • 1-2: corporate reputation/affiliation. 	
1.	I think it would be <i>more musically satisfying for the choirs involved if the massed choir piece was overall more simple to piece together i.e Haydn/Mozart symphony? It would make the short rehearsal time more achievable and lead to less fatigue and negativity towards actually doing the concert.</i>
2.	I think we should select <i>repertoire on the basis that most of the rehearsal will take place in individual choirs with just finishing touches required in the combined rehearsals.</i>
3.	The <i>afternoon session was a really good session! It was just a bit heavy...</i> Play some games, mingle and warm up, but <i>not rehearsal of more classical music. It made the last 3 hours quite hard.</i>
4.	<i>The afternoon session was good but didn't need to be so long.</i>

Table 4. Aim 2. Music provision (b): Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance events. Free remarks, negative. QUESTION 56

Italics in all rows highlight negative feedback about Festival provision (b). Cross references. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 social well-being. • 3-5: physical well-being (implicit, too little time for rest). 	
1.	<i>Director was patronising and not very good. Student conductors were not very good. The Friday afternoon was a waste of time, particularly the vocal distraction sections.</i>
SCHEDULING	
2.	<i>We rehearsed for too long over the weekend, I found the rehearsal on Friday afternoon a bit of a waste of time</i>
3.	<i>Too long rehearsals and breaks not long enough. Too early starts.</i>
4.	<i>Going straight into a three hour rehearsal on Friday with a limited break.</i>
5.	<i>Not having enough breaks in between singing rehearsals.</i>
6.	<i>The first day of rehearsals was very long and could have been much shorter.</i>
7.	<i>On the Saturday not having a lead warm up session.</i>
8.	<i>The length of the evening rehearsal on Friday</i>
9.	<i>Organisation for the actual performance day could have been better.</i>
10.	<i>Break down of rehearsal structure</i>
11.	<i>Needed more rehearsal time with the orchestra</i>
12.	<i>Needed more rehearsal for Berlioz. Sectionals for all would have been helpful.</i>
Positive outcome from a reverse negative.	
13.	<i>Very long rehearsal on Friday, but worth it!</i>

Table 5. Aim 2. Music provision (a + b) and (b): Festival repertoire and rehearsal/performance characteristics, negative. QUESTION 3

<p>Italics in rows 1-5 highlight negative feedback about Festival provision (b). Provision (a + b) is covered in rows 6-7.</p>	
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2-7: music-making. • 4: mental well-being. • 5-6: physical well-being (voice). • 6-7: corporate reputation/affiliation. 	
1.	<i>The piece was too long</i>
2.	<i>It was in Latin and often is. I would much rather sing in a language I understand.</i> Our choir tends to spend most of the academic year working on this piece instead of lots of different pieces and styles through the year.
3.	<i>.....It [The Berlioz] was very long. It was very male dominated as the tenors and basses had the melody a lot of the time meaning the altos very rarely had any melody or parts on their own.</i> I also didn't find it particularly easy to latch on to any of the melodies from the Berlioz.
4.	Also given the <i>original Requiem's lack of alto part</i> , we did not really have music of an active role in the music and often felt neglected in rehearsals and even in the concert.
5.	<i>By the end I felt like I was over-rehearsed.</i> Think the rehearsal at 2pm was when I sang my best, by the evening I was exhausted and my voice was strained.
6.	<i>The amount of music was maybe slightly too much</i> , and it was quite straining on the voice, especially with the orchestra. I feel like all the choirs weren't able to really perfect the music <i>in time</i> .
7.	The music was too challenging for many of the singers <i>meaning the performance was not as good as it should have been, and it was a terrible edition. A better choice would be something simpler with less orchestra</i> , so the less talented choirs have a chance of being able to sing it properly.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8-10: social well-being. • 8 & 17: music-making. • 10: corporate affiliation/reputation. • 11-16: physical well-being. • 14-17: mental well-being. 	
8.	Some singers had clearly not spent enough if any time learning the Berlioz which I found disrespectful and arrogant <i>as it was a difficult piece</i> .
9.	<i>Having a very balanced and smooth beginning of the concert, but then the last group performing twice.</i> This appeared to be rather insensitive and rude, and changed the dynamic of the gathering.
10.	<i>Rehearsal schedule overly packed.</i> Very limited time for socialising with colleagues either from my own choir or others
11.	The only negative was the physical tiredness, from holding <i>the music and standing up so long!</i>
12.	I was very tired by the time <i>the Berlioz ended!</i>
13.	<i>This year was very full.</i> I felt tired and overworked.
14.	I think spending the <i>entire Friday in rehearsal</i> was far too draining, to then <i>get up super early on the day of the performance</i> with a voice that had been knackered by the day before wasn't fun.
15.	<i>The rehearsals were far too long</i> and it was impossible to maintain focus for the length of time. <i>We were made to work without any breaks.</i> The conducting was also very frustrating and fickle.
16.	<i>The length of the concert - the Berlioz was so vast</i> , it was exhausting - The prospect of which made the concert itself less enjoyable
17.	I did not particularly enjoy singing <i>the Berlioz.....</i>

Table 6. Aim 2. Music provision (c): sustaining life participation and reasons for joining a choir.
QUESTION 14

<p>Italics in rows 1-44 associate HEI choir membership, singing or performing with a starting point/opportunity in time (musical or social), and continued, occasional or recovered involvement in music.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Time/opportunity markers are underlined.
1. It was <u>a long time ago</u> :)
Responses 2-10 highlight membership of a group without open reference to singing/music-making.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3-9: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 4-5: social well-being. • 5-8: mental well-being. • 7-10: community participation.
2. I've <u>always</u> been in choirs and didn't want that to stop when I joined uni.
3. Have <u>always</u> been part of a choir before going to university. Heard about the good reputation.
4. I work part-time after normal office hours, so the choir is <u>my chance</u> to integrate more fully with the University & meet like-minded folk.
5. Love of music and choral music. I enjoy the social aspects of a choir and within the university context it enables staff and students to mix across the institution. <i>And this choir</i> is one of the highlights <u>of my time there</u> .
6. I was part of king Alfred singers and then we were all invited to come. And having had a good experience <u>last year I wanted to go again</u>
7. The Chamber Choir at Christ Church is the flagship ensemble of the university <i>so joining the choir</i> is really something to aim for as it only takes a small number of students. <u>This year</u> I came to the Choir Festival as an alumnus, so it was lovely <u>to be back</u>
8. I joined the choir in <u>this festival</u> because I had done 5 previous Festivals and they were so much fun that I wanted to be a part of The festival again. I plan to be a part of <u>every festival</u> for as long as they continue to go on for.
9. I was part of the classical choir in my <u>previous</u> institution and the choir was recommended to me by friend.
10. I joined originally <u>10 years ago</u> to assist, my daughter was studying there and a singer, I was asked to join. <i>I am still there</i> , (name of daughter) now lives in Moscow!
Italics in rows 11-44 pair music provision (c) sustaining life participation with music-making.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11-44: music-making (continuing, new, resumed) – paired factor. • 14-20, 25-27 & 30-32: social well-being - italicised when associated with a new phase of music-making. • 18, 23-29 & 35-36: corporate reputation/affiliation. • 19, 21-35 & 39-40: mental well-being. • 28-30 & 36-38: community participation. • 26 & 31: spiritual well-being.
11. I am a talented choral singer <i>having sung in choirs for</i> <u>most of my life</u>
12. I wanted to get <u>back into singing in a choir, after not being able to for a while</u> .
13. I've <u>always sung in choirs</u> and wanted <u>to do more singing</u> in university.
14. <u>To meet new people</u> and sing
15. <u>To meet new people</u> who share an interest in singing.
16. I was part of a similar kind of choir <u>before I came to university</u> and wanted <u>to continue</u> with choral singing. I also thought it would be a <u>good opportunity to be social</u> .
17. <u>To gain more experience in a traditional choir</u> and to create <u>new friendships</u> .

18. There are <u>so many opportunities to sing at various occasions</u> , and different venues as part of this choir, the cathedral's festival being one of them. It's a great way <u>to make new friends too</u> .
19. The choir <u>needed another bass</u> , and I enjoy <u>singing</u> with others.
20. To <u>gain technical experience</u> and <u>make friends</u> .
21. I had a passion <u>for singing</u> and I <u>wanted to expand it</u> into our Choir Society
22. I like <u>to sing classical music</u> and it is <u>on a good day for me</u>
23. I have <u>always</u> loved <u>music and singing</u> so I joined KAS as a positive outlet <u>whilst at</u> Winchester University.
24. I have <u>always</u> <u>sung in choirs</u> and <u>the chamber choir</u> seemed fun and prestigious
25. I enjoy <u>singing and performing music in general</u> . It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an environment I have always felt accepted and valued. <u>Over the years</u> many of my friends have been made through singing in the King Alfred Singers.
26. I have been participating in the Festival <u>for several years now</u> and it is the musical highlight <u>of my year</u> . It gives <u>an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music</u> which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, <u>to sing</u> is very uplifting.
27. I've been a member of a few choirs <u>over the years</u> and find <u>singing</u> fun. It's great to have a <u>workplace choir</u> and I <u>feel it's something to be supported</u> as so many other friends don't have one.
28. I love singing and <u>while I attended</u> university it was one of the few <u>extra activities</u> I could get involved in. <u>Since leaving</u> university it has been wonderful to be able to keep the singing going and include my husband too.
29. We were <u>invited to take part through my local chorus group</u> and I was delighted to get <u>the opportunity to perform</u> such a remarkable work with such a superb generous conductor and an outstanding Orchestra.
30. To be able to <u>sing in a choir</u> To connect with people To have a <u>new</u> hobby To break up the working week
31. <u>To sing</u> the kind of music I like to sing with <u>other like-minded singers</u> . <u>To improve my skills by stretching myself with this kind of music and challenge</u> . To have a purpose to my singing when we have specific tasks to perform and to praise God at other times with some of the things we do.
32. An enjoyment <u>of singing, to be part of a group</u> .
33. I've <u>always</u> enjoyed <u>singing</u> but <u>never joined a choir</u> , so I thought it'd be a fun <u>thing to do</u> . And it is!
34. To have <u>the opportunity</u> to do something I love, <u>singing</u> .
35. Pure and simple, <u>I joined</u> because I enjoy <u>singing</u> and Marjon <u>don't do auditions to be a part of them</u> .
36. Wanted <u>to continue choir singing</u> at my undergraduate university and wanted <u>to continue</u> to be a part after leaving.
37. My wife has been a member for <u>some years</u> , but I <u>joined this time specifically to sing the berlioz</u>
38. <u>I loved singing in a choir at school – it has taken me 50 years to get back to regular choral singing</u> . I did not even know it existed until a friend told me, and then I joined <u>3 years ago</u> , as an alumna.
39. Making great music and <u>being able sing at such a high standard</u> and being committed to a choir <u>each week</u> , with some amazing <u>new opportunities</u> able to come my way.
40. I just love <u>to sing</u> . I also wanted <u>to brush up on my sight-singing skills</u> .
41. I wanted <u>to sing the Berlioz</u>
42. <u>Opportunity</u> to sing a major work. <u>They were short of tenors</u>
43. <u>To get more experience in singing as an ensemble and choral singing</u> .
44. <u>To improve my musical skills</u> .

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR MUSIC PROVISION A,B AND C

Festival music provision (a) - location and ensembles - responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music provision (a) responses	61	N/A	1	0	0

Music provision (a) cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	42	N/A	1	0	0
Social w.b.	0	N/A	0	0	0
Mental w.b.	8	N/A	0	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	N/A	0	0	0
Spiritual w.b.	3	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Corporate	6	N/A	1	0	0
Community	1	N/A	0	0	0

Festival music provision (b) - repertoire, rehearsals/performances - responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music provision (b) responses	37	N/A	7 + 4	17	13

Music provision (b) cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	20	N/A	3	6	0
Social w.b.	0	N/A	0	3	1
Mental w.b.	6	N/A	3	5	0
Physical w.b.	1	N/A	1	8	3
Spiritual w.b.	3	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Corporate	2	N/A	2	1	0
Community	0	N/A	2	0	0

Festival music provision (a + b) – venue/ensembles & repertoire, rehearsals/performances - responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music provision (a + b) responses	18	N/A	2	2	0

Music provision (a + b) cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	16	N/A	0	2	0
Social w.b.	4	N/A	0	0	0
Mental w.b.	4	N/A	0	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	N/A	0	0	0
Spiritual w.b.	1	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	N/A	0	0	0
Corporate	7	N/A	2	2	0
Community	1	N/A	0	0	0

Music provision (c) – sustaining life participation- responses per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music provision (c) responses	N/A	44	N/A	N/A	N/A

Music provision (c) cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	N/A	34	N/A	N/A	N/A
Social w.b.	N/A	15	N/A	N/A	N/A
Mental w.b.	N/A	22	N/A	N/A	N/A
Physical w.b.	N/A	0	N/A	N/A	N/A
Spiritual w.b.	N/A	2	N/A	N/A	N/A
Festival music Provision (a)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Festival music Provision (b)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Festival music Provision (a + b)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Corporate	N/A	17	N/A	N/A	N/A
Community	N/A	11	N/A	N/A	N/A

APPENDIX 8: UKES skill mappings

Table 1. Aim 2. Contribution of the Festival to student experience and engagement: UKES skill mappings.

Statements from Question 2 illuminating the impact of the Festival on singers' music-making.	UKES mappings based on Q16 skill sets
<p>1. Event, venue, performance space.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Getting to sing a challenging classical work in an incredible venue • I was given the opportunity to perform in a prestigious venue with a huge symphony orchestra • Challenge of performing major musical work in a major musical venue • Singing in the amazing symphony hall for the first time! • It gave me the experience of performing in the Symphony Hall which was a class venue and once in a lifetime experience. • Singing in the Symphony Hall, alongside the Philharmonic Orchestra • Singing in the Birmingham symphony hall with such a huge orchestra! <p>... and 30 other responses (see Appendix 2, Table 1) where music-making involvement is associated with the same factors.</p>	<p>Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner (i.e. from adapting to an exceptional context); working effectively with others;</p> <p>Civic skills: exploring real-world complex problems.</p>
<p>2. The Friday afternoon rehearsal with the other choirs was very exciting as we were able to experience other conducting styles.</p>	<p>Active learning: becoming an independent learner; working effectively with others.</p>
<p>3. The music: I play the piano and enjoy singing, so being part of and hearing great music is one of the positives of being part of the choir festival</p>	<p>Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically (e.g. from repertoire comparison and judgement).</p>
<p>4. It helped my sight-reading skills improve</p>	<p>Active learning: becoming an independent learner.</p>
<p>5. Repertoire, rehearsal, performance.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Being part of something huge and getting to meet and sing with a big group. • Challenge of performing major musical work in a major musical venue • Opportunity to take part in a larger work than normal. • The challenge of performing a great work. • It was also great to come away from the weekend feeling a sense of achievement that we had learnt and performed some challenging music.... <p>... and 25 other responses (see Appendix 2, Table 1) where perceived achievement is associated with the same factors.</p>	<p>Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner (i.e. from adapting to an exceptional ensemble challenge); working effectively with others.</p> <p>Civic skills: exploring real-world complex problems.</p>

6. Learning to perform such music is educationally testing, the education offered by the conductor is both fun and exciting.	Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner;
7. After that single rehearsal it felt like we all really had each other's' measure and that we were working together	Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner; working effectively with others; exploring real-world complex problems.
8. The afternoon rehearsal session: I thought it was a really lovely idea that worked well in encouraging interaction between the choirs in attendance.	Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner; working effectively with others; Civic skills: exploring real-world complex problems.
9. Having the opportunity to direct the choir.	Academic skills: thinking critically and analytically. Active learning: becoming an independent learner; working effectively with others, being creative. Career skills: CV-worthy experience
10. Seeing student conductors/organist taking an active role in the festival.	Active learning (observed): becoming an independent learner; being creative. Career skills: CV-worthy experience NB 13 respondents who identified themselves as <u>music students</u> could all be assumed to gain experience for their CV from HEI choir membership and Festival involvement.
11. Performing <i>a</i> new piece of music for the first time in public	Active learning: becoming an independent learner (rising to a new challenge); working effectively with others.

*The UKES assesses the contribution of students' university *experience* (their curricular programme) and their involvement in a 'joint community of staff and students' (broader engagement) to their overall skill development. By asking students, additionally, whether/how much time they devote to extra-curricular work, the 2016 survey revealed value-added gains compared with non-participants as follows: academic skills: 7%; active learning skills: 5%, career skills: 15%; civic skills: 5%. These gains were higher than those produced by paid work or caring, and slightly lower than volunteering.

APPENDIX 9: qualitative survey feedback for corporate reputation/affiliation

Table 1. Aim 2. Corporate reputation/affiliation and Festival participation, positive. QUESTION 2

<p>Italics highlight:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A sense of affiliation to universities/choirs in the Cathedrals Group and/or appreciation of the Festival. 'Other/university choirs' (plural) or similar in the feedback carries a sense of collective/CG belonging whereas 'large' or 'massive choir' does not. • Awareness of prestige factors and reputation. • Corporate reputation/affiliation is the primary classification for self-identified staff and students. • Community participation is the primary classification for alumni (see Appendix 10) and cross-referenced below if reputational matters are raised.
1. My first highlight is how warm and <i>welcoming Newman university</i> were
2. <i>Welcoming hosts.</i>
3. <i>Newman university's hospitality</i>
4. Being locally based via the <i>Newman University</i> , appreciating the massive organisation that went into the project and the <i>generous cooperation of all the parties concerned. Here's looking forward to Liverpool!</i>
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5-12, 15-27 & 29-31: social well-being. • 9 & 12: spiritual well-being. • 11-12: community participation. • 11, 13-14, 24-25 & 30-32: mental well-being. • 13: music-making and Festival provision (b). • 14 & 28-33: music-making and Festival provision (a) + (b). • 28: spiritual well-being and community participation. • 34-39: music-making and Festival provision (a).
5. Travelling to <i>different universities</i> and having fun journeys.
6. Connecting with <i>colleagues at own university and similar institutions</i>
7. Downtime to socialise <i>with colleagues</i> from my own choir
8. There was a great sense of community <i>amongst the universities.</i>
9. A chance to be part of something with other singers <i>from universities across the UK</i> , combining together to become greater than the sum of our parts.
10. The collaboration of <i>the Universities and their choirs</i>
11. Also <i>I am an alumni</i> so I enjoyed catching up with members of the university choir who I had not seen for a while. <i>I have fond memories of making music at the university</i> so it is nice for me to come back for choir fest as almost a celebration of the happiness music brought me at university
12. Experiencing the wonderful migration of similarly minded people <i>from the various universities</i> and enjoying the general comradeship from the different corners of the country.
13. The music: I play the piano and enjoy singing, so being part of and hearing great music is one of the positives of <i>being part of the choir festival</i>
14. I enjoyed <i>performing in front of the other choirs</i> during our individual piece.
15. Social aspect spending time with choir. Sitting in parts was good as it meant we spoke to people <i>outside of our own choirs.</i>
16. Friendship with other <i>singers from all over</i>
17. Meeting new people <i>from other choirs</i>
18. Spending time with <i>members of my choir</i> and meeting new people <i>from other choirs</i>

19. The social side: Getting to know people within my own choir better <i>and also other choir members, it gives you a sense of belonging</i>
20. Chance to meet <i>colleagues from other choirs and compare experiences</i>
21. Getting to see <i>people from their university's. My sister sings for Canterbury</i> so I got to hang out with her all weekend!
22. Bonding with <i>other universities.</i>
23. The sense of community <i>amongst the choirs.</i>
24. The reunion of <i>members of other university choirs</i> is very fulfilling.
25. I was able to meet new people <i>from other choirs</i> which was exciting.
26. I got to meet new people and talk to <i>other music students from other Universities</i>
27. Meeting new people in <i>other choirs.</i>
28. I was able to feel a sense of belonging – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the huge <i>collective</i> choir from all walks of life. We were all able to contribute to the Performance and work together as a team. Although, most of the people in the room were strangers <i>from different parts of the country</i> we all seemed united by the music and the goal to perform.
29. Admiring the general standards <i>of the individual universities</i> and enjoying meeting with <i>the various groups of singers</i> and discussing their particular ideas, through watching the individual groups in the first half.
30. The Friday afternoon rehearsal <i>with the other choirs</i> was very exciting as we were able to experience other conducting styles as well as take an <i>opportunity to meet new people</i>
31. The opportunity to be <i>reunited with my choir:</i> having not seen them in four months, it was wonderful to have this event in the location to see and perform with them again.
32. The Afternoon rehearsal session: I thought it was a really lovely idea that worked well in encouraging interaction <i>between the choirs</i> in attendance.
33. A chance to sing a 'big' piece of music, requiring choral and orchestral resources <i>our university on its own does not have.</i>
34. Be able to sing <i>amongst other universities</i> and being able to see what they have to offer musically.
35. Singing with orchestra <i>and other choirs</i>
36. Performing with <i>other choirs.</i>
37. Being part of such a <i>large choir when we all came together.</i>
38. Listening to what <i>other choirs had to offer from around the country</i>
39. Working Together with <i>other Choirs</i>

Table 2. Aim 2. Corporate reputation/affiliation and reasons for joining a university choir.

QUESTION 14

<p>Italics highlight:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A sense of affiliation to universities/choirs in the Cathedrals Group and/or appreciation of the Festival. 'Other choirs' (plural) or similar in the feedback carries a sense of collective/CG belonging whereas 'large' or 'massive choir' does not. • Awareness of prestige factors and reputation. • Contributory comments from self-identified alumni also appear in Appendix 10.
1. <i>Highest musical standard of choral singing at the University</i>
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2-8: social well-being. • 3-19: music provision (c) sustaining life participation. • 4, 6-13 & 17: music-making.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5-15: to mental well-being. • 7: spiritual well-being. • 12-17 community participation.
2. <i>Excellent reputation</i> and welcoming family like group of people
3. <i>I work part-time</i> after normal office hours, so the choir is my chance to integrate more fully <i>with the University</i> & meet like-minded folk.
4. There are so many opportunities to sing at various occasions, and different venues <i>as part of this choir, the cathedrals festival being one of them.</i> It's a great way to make new friends too.
5. Love of music and choral music in particular. I enjoy the social aspects of a choir <i>and within the university context it enables staff and students to mix across the institution.</i> And this choir is one of the highlights of my time there.
6. I enjoy singing and performing music in general. It brings me great happiness and is a very rewarding family to be a part of. Attending rehearsals boosts my self-esteem as it is an environment I have always felt accepted and valued in. Over the years many of my friends have been made <i>through singing in the King Alfred Singers.</i>
7. I have been <i>participating in the Festival</i> for several years now and it is the musical highlight of my year. It gives an opportunity to tackle a major complex piece of music which you don't get with small choirs and joining with so many others, who are all friendly and welcoming, to sing is very uplifting.
8. I've been a member of a few choirs over the years and find singing fun. <i>It's great to have a workplace choir</i> and I feel it's something to be supported as so many other friends don't have one
9. I have always loved music and singing so I <i>joined KAS</i> as a positive outlet <i>whilst at Winchester University.</i>
10. I have always sung in choirs and <i>the chamber choir seemed fun and prestigious</i>
11. Pure and simple, I joined because I enjoy singing and <i>Marjon</i> don't do auditions to be a part of them.
12. I love singing and while <i>I attended university</i> it was one of the few extra activities I could get involved in. Since leaving university it has been wonderful to be able to <i>keep the singing going</i> and include my husband too.
13. We were invited to take part through my local chorus group and I was delighted to get the opportunity to perform such a remarkable work with such a <i>superb generous conductor and an outstanding Orchestra.</i>
14. <i>The Chamber Choir at Christ Church is the flagship ensemble of the university</i> so joining the choir is really something to aim for as it only takes a small number of students. This year I came to the <i>Choir Festival</i> as an alumnus, so it was lovely to be back
15. I joined the choir in this festival because I had done 5 previous Festivals and they were so much fun that <i>I wanted to be a part of the festival again.</i> I plan to be a part of every festival for as long as they continue to go on for.
16. I was part of the classical choir in my previous institution and the choir was <i>recommended to me</i> by friend.
17. Wanted to continue choir singing <i>at my undergraduate university</i> and wanted to continue to be a part after leaving.
18. Have always been part of a choir before going to university. <i>Heard about the good reputation.</i>
19. I was part of <i>king Alfred singers</i> and then we were all invited to come. And having had a good experience last year I wanted to go again
20. <i>Part of my employment requires me to attend.</i>
Course-related reasons for joining the HEI choir: student experience
21. I am a <i>music scholar</i> and attending choir at <i>Liverpool Hope</i> is compulsory.

22. <i>As a music student we are encouraged to join many ensembles.</i>
23. <i>Passing the audition for the Chamber Choir is a challenge and an expectation for serious singer/performers</i>
24. <i>I auditioned in my first year and have been in the choir ever since. I study music at university</i>

Table 3. Aim 2. Corporate reputation/affiliation and reasons for joining a university choir. Free remarks, positive. QUESTION 56

Italics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A sense of affiliation to universities/choirs in the Cathedrals Group and/or appreciation of the Festival. 'Other choirs' (plural) or similar in the feedback carries a sense of collective/CG belonging whereas 'large' or 'massive choir' does not. • Awareness of prestige factors and reputation. • Contributory comments from self-identified alumni also appear in Appendix 10.
Cross-reference <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: music-making and Festival music provision (a). • 2: mental and spiritual well-being.
1. I think it is a wonderful opportunity for <i>the faith universities to get together</i> and for choir members to experience singing in wonderful venues.
2. A thoroughly enjoyable and uplifting experience. Look forward to <i>Liverpool next year</i> .

Table 4. Aim 2. Corporate reputation/affiliation and reasons for joining a university choir. Free remarks, mixed/neutral. QUESTION 56

Italics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A sense of affiliation to universities/choirs in the Cathedrals Group and/or appreciation of the Festival. 'Other choirs' (plural) or similar in the feedback carries a sense of collective/CG belonging whereas 'large' or 'massive choir' does not. • Awareness of prestige factors and reputation. <p>Contributory comments from self-identified alumni also appear in Appendix 10.</p>
Cross references <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: Physical well-being. • 1-2: Festival provision (a + b)
1. I think it would be more musically satisfying <i>for the choirs involved</i> if the massed choir piece was overall more simple to piece together i.e Haydn/Mozart symphony? It would make the short rehearsal time more achievable and lead to less fatigue and negativity towards actually doing the concert.
2. I think we should select repertoire on the basis that most of the rehearsal will take place in <i>individual choirs</i> with just finishing touches required in the combined rehearsals.

Table 5. Aim 2. Corporate reputation/affiliation and Festival participation, negative. QUESTION 3

Italics: factors mitigating against sense of affiliation, gathering, prestige or reputation.
Cross-reference <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1-3: social well-being.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3: Festival music provision (b). • 4-5: music-making and Festival Provision (a + b) • 4 & 6: physical well-being • 7: mental well-being.
1. Minimal interaction <i>between choirs</i> .
2.the weekend flew by and we didn't really get to integrate with <i>other universities</i> as much as I would have liked
3. Rehearsal schedule overly packed. Very limited time for socialising <i>with colleagues</i> either from my own choir <i>or others</i>
4. The amount of music was maybe slightly too much, and it was quite straining on the voice, especially with the orchestra. I feel like <i>all the choirs</i> weren't able to really perfect the music <i>in time</i> .
5. The music was too challenging for many of the singers meaning the performance was not as good as it should have been, and it was a terrible edition. A better choice would be something simpler with less orchestra, so the <i>less talented</i> choirs have a chance of being able to sing it properly.
6. It was very Tiring! I've been <i>part of the festival for 3 years</i> and I was knackered after this one.
7. A negative would be that as we are a sole student choir being student lead it often seems that <i>we are looked down upon by larger fellow choirs</i> .
8. Travel to and from <i>Newham University</i> .

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR CORPORATE REPUTATION/AFFILIATION

Corporate reputation/affiliation occurrences per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Corporate reputation/affiliation	39	24	2 + 2	8	0

Corporate reputation/affiliation cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	14	10	1	2	0
Social w.b.	24	7	0	3	0
Mental w.b.	8	11	1	1	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	1	2	0
Spiritual w.b.	3	1	1	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	6	N/A	1	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	1	N/A	0	1	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	7	N/A	2	2	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	17	0	0	0
Community	3	6	0	0	0

APPENDIX 10: Qualitative survey feedback for community participation

Table 1. Aim 2. Community participation and Festival involvement, positive. QUESTION 2

<p>Italics: feedback associated with community participation.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Corporate affiliation is the primary classification for self-identified students and staff (see Appendix 9) and community participation for alumni. Alumni statements are cross-referenced to Appendix 9 if relevant matters are raised. Community statements are classified as such by content, especially permeability of HEI participation boundaries. It is not assumed that they are voiced by community participants.
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1: music-making, Festival provision (a). 1 & 3: mental well-being. 3-5: corporate reputation/affiliation 3-4: social well-being. 4-6: spiritual well-being. 5: music-making and Festival music provision (a) and (b).
1. It is often not an experience obtainable for <i>amateur musicians</i> , so I valued the chance to perform in such a place.
2. Bonding with <i>all age groups to a common end</i>
3. Also <i>I am an alumni</i> so I enjoyed catching up with members of the university choir who I had not seen for a while. I have fond memories of making music at the university so <i>it is nice for me to come back for choir fest</i> as almost a celebration of the happiness music brought me at university
4. Experiencing the wonderful migration of <i>similarly minded people</i> from the various universities and enjoying the general comradeship <i>from the different corners of the country</i> .
5. I was able to feel a sense of belonging – feeling part of not only the alto section but as a member of the huge collective choir <i>from all walks of life</i> . We were all able to contribute to the Performance and work together as a team. Although, most of the people in the room were strangers from different parts of the country we all seemed united by the music and the goal to perform.
6. Exploring the city library, which I found beautiful, exciting, and even moving - a fabulous building which made me think that the "powers that be" <i>DO believe in community services after all</i> , and think it's worth investing large amounts of money in it....

Table 2. Aim 2. Community participation and reasons for joining a choir. QUESTION 14

<p>Italics refer to community involvement in the choir, including alumni.</p>
<p>Cross-references</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1-10: music provision (c) sustaining life participation. 1-6: music-making. 4-8: mental well-being. 4: social well-being. 3 & 5-9: corporate reputation/affiliation.
1. <i>My wife has been a member for some years but I joined</i> this time specifically to sing the berlioz
2. I loved singing in a choir at school – it has taken me 50 years to get back to regular choral singing. <i>I did not even know it existed until a friend told me, and then I joined 3 years ago, as an alumna.</i>
3. Wanted to continue choir singing at my undergraduate university and wanted to continue <i>to be a part after leaving.</i>
4. To be able to sing in a choir To connect with people To have a new hobby

	To break up <i>the working week</i>
5.	We were invited to take part <i>through my local chorus group</i> and I was delighted to get the opportunity to perform such a remarkable work with such a superb generous conductor and an outstanding Orchestra.
6.	I love singing and while I attended university it was one of the few extra activities I could get involved in. <i>Since leaving university</i> it has been wonderful to be able to keep the singing going <i>and include my husband too</i> .
7.	I joined the choir in this festival because I had done <i>5 previous Festivals</i> and they were so much fun that I wanted to be a part of the festival again. I plan to be a part of every festival <i>for as long as they continue to go on for</i> .
8.	The Chamber Choir at Christ Church is the flagship ensemble of the university so joining the choir is really something to aim for as it only takes a small number of students. This year I came to the Choir Festival <i>as an alumnus</i> , so it was lovely to be back
9.	I was part of the classical choir in my previous <i>institution</i> and the choir was recommended to me <i>by a friend</i>
10.	<i>I joined originally</i> 10 years ago to assist, <i>my daughter was studying there</i> and a singer, I was asked to join. I am still there, <i>(name of daughter) now lives in Moscow!</i>

Table 3. Aim 2. Community participation and Festival involvement. Free remarks, positive.
QUESTION 56

Italics: feedback associated with community participation.	
Cross-references	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1: mental well-being and music-making. • 1-2: music provision (b), Festival repertoire, rehearsal/performances. 	
1.	A marvellous event which encourages a sense of <i>community participation in</i> an area (music) which I love, but would not otherwise have an opportunity to perform in. I also like the opportunity to visit different parts of England within the context of music.
2.	A fabulous event which bonds the generations <i>and communities</i> .

Table 4. Aim 2. Community participation and Festival involvement, negative. QUESTION 3

N/A

SUMMARY CORRELATIONS FOR COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION

Community participation occurrences per question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive/neutral	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Community participation	6	10	2	0	0

Community participation cross-references by factor and question					
	Q2 positive	Q14	Q56 positive	Q3 negative	Q56 negative
Music-making	2	6	1	0	0
Social w.b.	3	1	0	0	0
Mental w.b.	2	5	1	0	0
Physical w.b.	0	0	0	0	0
Spiritual w.b.	3	0	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (a)	1	N/A	0	0	0
Festival music Provision (b)	0	N/A	2	0	0
Festival music Provision (a + b)	1	N/A	0	0	0
Music Provision (c)	N/A	10	0	0	0
Corporate	3	6	0	0	0

APPENDIX 11: Qualitative survey feedback, other

Table 1. Other Festival feedback: positive. QUESTION 2

ORGANISATION
1. The structure of the weekend was good.
2. Very well organised.
3. The organisation of seating in the Symphony Hall was clearer and quicker than last year.
4. Organisation
5. It was very well organised.
6. Superb organisation
7. Logistically well managed, even in a more complex venue than usual.
8. Everything was really well timed – we never felt that we were running out of time or rushing anything.
9. Having the weekend run smoothly makes a huge difference to being able to enjoy the weekend.
10. The weekend was very well organized overall and ran smoothly.
11. Well-organised event
FACILITIES
12. Gluten-free options of packed lunch given and staff were very accommodating
MISCELLANEOUS
13. Generous hospitality.
14. Camaraderie
15. The professionalism of those involved in the festival
16. Dancing
17. Visiting Birmingham for the first time.
18. Exploring Birmingham for the first time
19. ...explore the city!
20. Seeing a new city
21. My third highlight is how lovely the city of Birmingham is.
22. Exploring a part of the country that I may not have otherwise been to any time in the near future.
23. Exploring a new city
24. Living
25. Never been to Birmingham before so that was nice.
26. Being on home ground

Table 2. Other Festival feedback: free responses, positive. QUESTION 56

ORGANISATION
1. The organisation this year was fantastic!
MISCELLANEOUS
2. Thank you for allowing me to participate :)
3. Thank you for hosting a great event. My answers are mainly because my choir are mean.

Table 3. Other Festival feedback: reverse negative responses giving positives. QUESTION 3

SCHEDULING
1. Over too soon again.
2. A week would be even better
OTHER
3. None (x7)
4. I honestly can't think of any!
5. There weren't any.
6. Sadly it had to come to an end.
7. Nothing
8. I am sure that being the locally based group, we had it a lot easier than those who had a distance to travel and perhaps experienced certain hotel restrictions, but my personal impression was generally of a sensible and well run flexible programme for everyone.

Table 4. Other Festival feedback, negative. QUESTION 3

SCHEDULING
1. Saturday was a very long day.
2. Slow start on Sunday.
3. Some of the timekeeping could have been better.
4. Early mornings
5. Sometimes a lot of waiting
FACILITIES (VENUES, TRANSPORT, ACCOMMODATION, CATERING)
6. Problems with Hotel
7. Not being able to stay in a hotel closer to the venue.
8. Transport within Birmingham.
9. Not being warned in advance that we would need to arrange our own lunches (in previous years sandwiches had been provided)
10. Usually a sandwich lunch is provided. It would have helpful to know before the weekend that we had to make our own arrangements for lunch as well as supper.
ACCESS/INCLUSION
11. Fitting it in with work role
12. Disabled access. Being for want of a better word "told off" for coming in a wheel chair by.....(description of usher).
AUDIENCE/MARKETING
13. The audience needed to be bigger.
14. Wish there had been more audience. Could we not have given seats away to members of the public who might not be able to afford them or to groups such as schools, charities, etc
15. Needed to be marketed better. Such a shame that an wonderful auditorium like Symphony Hall was less than half full.
ORGANISATION
16. Some years (not this year) it has been particularly unorganised.
17. Some of the organizing at the Hall was sometimes not that good. For instance, we were told we must be on time for Saturday morning rehearsal a number of times so we set off early and arrived early only to have to wait around because they were not ready. I waited for over 35 minutes.
18. The seating could have been better organised at the beginning of Saturday. We seemed to spend a lot of time moving around.

Table 5. Other. General Festival feedback: free remarks, negative. QUESTION 56

FACILITIES (VENUES, TRANSPORT, ACCOMMODATION, CATERING)	
1.	It would have been well appreciated by many students if there was a Dance floor at the after party!
2.	Sometimes a lot of waiting.

APPENDIX 12: Semi-structured interview prompts and project aim mappings

Table 1. Semi-structured interview prompts and project aim mappings.

Participant Group	Prompts and Aims
Music Directors	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What are your impressions of this year's Festival? 2. Aim 1: social well-being: to what extent does the Festival and/or leading the choir contribute to your own sense of social well-being? And for the choir: what have you observed or heard about the contribution of the choir to their social well-being? 3. Aim 1: spiritual well-being and indirectly, musical factors: You sang at the Festival a choral piece expressing a Christian sentiment. Is that usual practice for the choir? Would you associate it with offering a spiritual experience? How do you engage the choir with affect and content? 4. Aim 1: physical well-being: How would you describe the effect of choir membership on physical well-being – yours? The choir's? Different for different ages? 5. Aim 1: mental well-being and musical factors: to what extent does the choir contribute to mental well-being, e.g. confidence-building, developing musical competence? <p>Factual questions if not answered during the interview</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In what capacity are you employed? 2. How long have you been involved in the festival? Aim 1: musical factors 3. Is there a music course at the university and what does it cover? 4. Aim 1: musical factors; Aim 2: student engagement and experience; community participation. Are all the students in the choir involved in curriculum music as well or it is it all voluntary? What is the range of expertise among singers when they join the choir? 5. Is the festival choir the only choir or are there others at the university?
Chaplains and affiliated members of the clergy	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How long is your association with the Festival? (Where relevant) Have you seen significant changes over the years? 2. Aim 1: spiritual well-being: How far is this a religious event for you? 3. How far do you think that it is this for singers who are students? And for those who are staff or community members? 4. Aim 1: spiritual well-being and repertoire: How do you <u>approach</u> sacred pieces in a secular world? 5. Aim 1: social well-being. Is the Festival regarded by the choir primarily as a social event? 6. Aim 1: spiritual well-being and repertoire: How do the pieces learned by the choir in general/for the festival fit with the descriptor spiritual but not religious?
Festival Founders	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. did you last attend a Festival and what were your impressions of it? 2. As far as you remember, why was the Festival established?

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Aim 2: Corporate involvement and reputation/affiliation. The Festival weekend comprises meetings for Vice-chancellors and chaplains, choir rehearsals, a concert, a post-concert gathering and a closing service. What is your opinion of this format? Why is music performance centralised? 4. Did you notice/have you noticed any significant changes to the Festival over the years? 5. Aim 2: corporate reputation/affiliation. In your opinion, how does the Festival concert project the identity/mission of the Cathedral Group of Universities to the public? 6. Aim 2: student and community participation. What does the Festival contribute to student engagement and/or the experience of staff/community singers? 7. Aim 1: spiritual well-being. To what extent would you describe The Festival as a religious occasion? To what extent spiritual? <p>Factual questions if not covered by respondents' answers</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How frequently have you attended the Festival over the years? 2. Do you/did you normally attend from Friday to Sunday, ending with the service?
--	---

